Report of the Committee on Planning and Community Services dated July 18, 1995

Preservation of The Hotel Fort Garry
File G-3.1.1

1006 - 1. The Committee on Planning and Community Services has received a formal request from 3036132 Manitoba Ltd., operating as the Hotel Fort Garry, for $1,500,000.00 in funding under the Winnipeg Development Agreement for the restoration and preservation of the Hotel Fort Garry, situated at 222 Broadway Avenue. The former and current owners of the Hotel Fort Garry have spent between ten and twelve million dollars renovating and restoring this building over the last ten years. The current owners have spent $1,700,000.00 in the last twelve months and have budgeted to spend an additional $2,160,000.00 on the restoration of the building including the Provencher Ballroom ($160,000.00) and on the restoration of the guest rooms ($2,000,000.00) over the next three years. It is imperative that certain exterior work be completed before the aforementioned interior renovations are started as the moisture penetration will continue to damage the interior of the building.

The Hotel Fort Garry has engaged the services of the Winnipeg based Crosier, Kilgour Engineers and Cohlmeyer Associates Architects, to identify the problems and specify the work required to seal, clean and preserve the structure. The Hotel Fort Garry was constructed in 1911 using Indiana Buff sandstone. The building is currently in a state of deterioration as a result of moisture penetration through the stone and brickwork. It has been determined that curtailing the moisture penetration is paramount to the preservation and interior restoration of this architecturally significant structure.

The scope of work required for the restoration and repairs to exterior walls and roof of the Hotel Fort Garry is outlined on Appendix "A"

On June 20, 1995, the Planning and Community Services Committee requested the Historical Buildings Committee to make recommendations on the financing of preservation work on the Fort Garry Hotel.

The Historical Buildings Committee met with the owners of the Hotel Fort Garry and submitted the following recommendation to the Committee for consideration:

- That the Historical Buildings Committee, with the approval of the Commissioner of Planning and Community Services be authorized to release up to $750,000 in grants to the Hotel Fort Garry;

- That the grants be released only when specific quotes and work orders are developed for the project, submitted and approved by the Historic Buildings Committee after ensuring work is relevant to historic preservation; that quotes for work are valid and consistent with the criteria contained in the Heritage Support Options Program;

- That Work Orders must be completed to the satisfaction of the Sub-Committee on Certificates of Suitability and the Commissioner of Planning and Community Services, in consultation with the Chairperson of the Committee on Planning and Community Services.

The Committee on Planning and Community Services recommends:

I. That an amount of $750,000.00 be approved from the Winnipeg Development Agreement for the restoration and preservation of the Hotel Fort Garry, to be released on a progressive basis on approval of the Historical Buildings Committee, Chairperson of the Committee on Planning and Community Services and the Commissioner of Planning and Community Services, in accordance with the "Consolidated City of Winnipeg Policy for Funding the Conservation of Heritage Buildings", as set out in Recommendation II.

II. That the "Consolidated City of Winnipeg Policy for Funding the Conservation of Heritage Buildings", as outlined on Appendix "B" be adopted and used as the criteria when considering applications for grant money.

Report of the Committee on Planning and Community Services dated July 18, 1995

III. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to effect the intent of the foregoing.

Adopted by consent.

(See Minute No. 1028 for attachment)

Report of the Committee on Planning and Community Services dated July 18, 1995

1028 - Appendix "A" referred to in Clause 1 of the Report of the Committee on Planning and Community Services dated July 18, 1995

COHLMEYER ASSOCIATES
ARCHITECTS • URBAN DESIGNERS
62 ELLEN STREET WINNIPEG R3A 0Z7
(204) 943-1394 FAX 942-4426

10 July 1995

Mr. Richard Bel
Manager and Director
Hotel Fort Garry
222 Broadway Avenue
Winnipeg, Manitoba
R3C 0R3

Dear Richard:

Re: Exterior Wall and Roof Restoration Contracts

I am writing this in order to clarify the process under which we and Crosier Kilgour Partners will be reviewing the work and issuing instructions to the Construction Manager and to various Sub-Contractors.

We have prepared a Project Manual which outlines the basis under which various contracts will be let out and administered, and which outlines technical specifications for various materials and installation and cleaning techniques.

As we are able to view the building in detail, we will complete a more thorough review of existing conditions and issue drawings, annotated plans, annotated photographs and necessary details for use by the Contractor.

As you know, we have recently made an opening in the masonry wall of the south face of the building (inside a service stair tower), and we have substantially increased our understanding of the nature of the construction and of the necessary repair techniques which will have to be used.

We feel that this exploratory and evolutionary approach to the restoration process will enable us to assure that specific conditions are solved individually and that solutions are based on accurate findings rather than on surmise.

Stephen Cohlmeyer, Architect, Urban Designer
B.A., M.Arch., MAA. OAA. MRAIC

James Wagner, B.E.S., B.Arch., MAA
Associate

Another advantage of this approach is that it will allow us to proceed immediately with the work, and help insure that cleaning is completed prior to arrival of frost in the stone (which can cause spalling if cleaning is completed too late for stone to dry out before frost comes).

We feel that this work will substantially benefit the health and longevity of the building envelope, and we are confident that now is the best possible time to proceed with this work in order to assure the continued health of this important Winnipeg and Canadian landmark.

I am attaching a copy of the current Scope of Work outline (which is included in the Project Manual) for your information.

Trusting that this is helpful, I look forward to hearing further from you and to successful completion of the work.

Yours,



Steve Cohlmeyer

Enc.

cc. Crosier Kilgour, Robert Horta Construction

HOTEL FORT GARRY • WINNIPEG
RESTORATION AND REPAIRS TO EXTERIOR WALLS AND ROOF

SCOPE OF WORK / OUTLINE OF WORK

DESCRIPTION OF THE WORK

The following is an outline of the work to be carried out under the terms of this contract:

- Masonry
    - Cleaning of existing masonry, including all contact points for sealants.
    - Removal of all damaged and deteriorated mortar.
    - Re-pointing of all mortar joints requiring removal.
    - Removal of all masonry which is cracked, spalled or otherwise damaged; assessment of source of damage; repair of substrate conditions as required.
    - Reinstallation of masonry which has been removed OR installation of new masonry where reinstallation is not feasible. (note that all new masonry materials are to match existing materials for colour and for surface conformation)
- Window & Door Openings
    - Remove all caulking materials, clean frames and surrounding masonry, re-caulk all joints with approved sealants.
- Flashings in Masonry
    - Provide new flashings in masonry with saw-cuts, lead plugs and reglets with caulking sealants as instructed by Architect and Engineers.
- Roof/Garret Restoration
    - Repair of Chimneys
        - Remove existing masonry which is loose or which appears to have inadequate support or coherence.
        - Assess damage, reinforce, re-install, re-point, seal and flash as required.
    - Supply, Repair, Provision of Flashings & Counterflashings
        - Throughout roof area, examine existing flashing conditions, assure that "shingled" overlaps are achieved wherever feasible, install new flashing, counterflashing, sealants as required.

- Reglets
  - At all joints between masonry and roofing flashing: remove existing caulking and provide new lead plug & caulked reglet and counterflashing as required.
- Cleaning of Drains
  - Clean all drains and assure clear passage of water.
- Provision of Access Stairs
  - Remove and replace existing access stairs in upper roof area.
- Provision & Repair of Protective Railings
  - Remove existing steel railings; re-install with new bracing and attachment brackets.
- Copper Roofing Repair & Cleaning
  - Clean all copper roofing and flashing where there is an indication of water infiltration or deterioration of joints or deterioration of caulking.
  - Re-build all joints to assure natural "shingled" seal and drainage.
  - Where necessary, re-seal with appropriate sealants.
- Asphalt & Tar Roofing Repair
  - Examine all areas where there is leaking or where flashing, counterflashing or sealants are failing; remove surrounding materials; evaluate appropriate repair; repair as required.
- Supply and Installation of replacement Doors & Windows
  - Remove all existing wood doors and frames in the roof area.
  - Remove all damaged and rotten substrate materials.
  - Re-build all removed substrate with pressure treated wood blocking.
  - Install new doors, windows, casings, sills and frames; caulk and flash as required.

- Plaster Repair
  - Remove damaged plaster and repair and prime as required in the following rooms and areas: Provencher Ballroom; Seventh Floor (extensive areas); Tenth Floor (extensive areas); 122; 128; 210; 130; 614; 936; 938; and other areas and detailed sections.

- Clean up

  - All Contractors and Sub-contractors will be required to clean up all work and debris during the construction process and to schedule work as required by the management of the Hotel to assure minimal disturbance of the guests.

- Access to Exterior Walls

  - Access to view and perform work as required on exterior walls is to be provided by the Contractor and appropriate Sub-Contractors. This access is to create minimal intrusion into the building face and any result of intrusions is to be repaired in a manner approved by the Architect and the Engineers prior to commencement of work.

  - Systems of access are the sole responsibility of the appropriate contractors, and all permits, designs, fees and insurance are the responsibility of the Construction Manager and of the appropriate Sub-Contractors.

  - Access is to be provided to the Architect and the Engineers on an as-required basis throughout the restoration process.

PREPARATION OF TEST AND SAMPLE PANELS FOR APPROVAL

The Construction Manager and appropriate Sub-Contractors will be required to provide test and sample panels of all typical work for review and approval by the Architect and the Engineers. Work requiring test samples include the following:

- Stone type, finish and colour
- Stone repair and replacement
- Removal of mortar joints and re-pointing
- Cleaning of stone
- Installation of reglets, flashing and caulking
- Roof Cleaning
- Repairs to roofing / gutters / flashings / counterflashings
- Plaster Repairs

For all work requiring test and sample panels, the Contractors will be required to obtain approval from the Architect and Engineers prior to proceeding with the work.

DOCUMENT PREPARATION & WORKING RELATIONSHIP

This Contract will be carried out through a process of review, clarification and approval.

This Project Manual is intended to set out the specific technical requirements for various materials and methods;

Details and site-specific requirements will be established as the Work progresses through a process of:

- detailed material review,
- preparation of clarification instructions, drawings and schedules,
- and on-site observation, instruction and review.

Contract Drawings will be produced throughout the process of the Work, and will consist of:

- annotated plans and elevations,
- annotated photographs,
- material schedules
- and schematic details

Administration of the Contract will be carried out through a process of submission of Claims for Payment, Certification for Payment, Administration of Builders' Lien Holdback Accounts, Certification for Substantial Performance and release of Holdback Accounts.

CROSIER
KILGOUR &
PARTNERS LTD.
Consulting Structural Engineers

Partners
D. M. Kilgour, P.Eng.
K. J. Hearson, P.Eng.
J. D. Miller, P.Eng.
G. Graham, C.E.T.
R. J. O'Toole, P.Eng.

July 11, 1995

Our File No. 95-330

Hotel Fort Garry
222 Broadway
Winnipeg, Manitoba
R3C 0R3

Dear Mr. Rick Bel

Dear Sir:

Re: Hotel Fort Garry
Structural Remediation

Although every effort is being made to expedite the repairs to the facility, please be advised of the following climate limitations with respect to various components of the project, as discussed below.

Mortar repairs during the colder months of the year are feasible, providing certain precautions are maintained to ensure the temperatures within the area under construction are high enough to attain a sufficient cure. With respect to the proposed cleaning program however, the climate considerations become more significant.

Prior to proceeding with cleaning of a historical masonry structure, localized test panels utilizing various techniques are employed to ensure the cleaning methods and materials have no deleterious effect on the masonry. A monitoring period of the cleaned test areas is strongly recommended to determine if any undesirable discolouration occurs. Typical monitoring time periods range from a minimum of a couple of weeks up to a year. The latter of which is more desirable as it allows assessment of surface variations throughout freezing temperatures.

More significantly, cleaning methods employing copius amounts of moisture should be terminated a minimum of 1 week prior to the statistical first frost date or sooner if freezing temperatures are expected. Moisture can become trapped in the substrate leading to increased freeze-thaw deterioration of the stone, if insufficient time is allotted to allow the masonry to dry out. Sandstone can be more susceptible because of its higher porosity compared to a harder, more impermeable stone such as granite.

As masonry repairs and recaulking should be completed prior to cleaning of the exterior, the remaining amount of weeks with above freezing temperatures strongly reduce the probability of completing cleaning of the exterior masonry this year. Please note however, that this should not detract from the recommendation to proceed with completion of the test panels, as to maximize the monitoring time.

Upon your review, please do not hesitate to call should you have any further questions or concerns.

Yours truly,

John A. Wells, P. Eng.

JAW/kfm

cc: Mr. Bob Horta
Mr. Steve Cohlmeyer

Report of the Committee on Planning and Community Services dated July 18, 1995

Appendix "B" referred to in Clause 1 of the Report of the Committee on Planning and Community Services dated July 18, 1995

CONSOLIDATED CITY OF WINNIPEG POLICY FOR FUNDING THE CONSERVATION OF HERITAGE BUILDINGS

City Council has previously adopted a number of guidelines and policies to establish the scope and criteria of civic funding of heritage restoration.

The Historical Buildings Committee recommends that these policies be consolidated and form the basis of allocating funds under the Winnipeg Development Agreement (Buildings Preservation Sub-program), the Parvin-Hammerquist Fund (an annual $100,000 capital allocation) and the implementation of Bill 17 (enabling legislation for tax credits and grants for heritage buildings).

The Committee requests that the Committee on Planning and Community Services reaffirm and adopt the following simplified guidelines and directions as the City's heritage buildings funding policy.

A. PRINCIPLES

(Source: Current Council Policy adopted on July 29, 1992)

Winnipeg City Council adopted the "Heritage Support - Policy and Programs" report which laid out these rules as the basis of an incentive strategy to support heritage buildings and subsequently the Province has drafted Bill 17 based on this program.

1. The City will maintain a comprehensive range of incentives for the conservation and use of designated heritage structures, including grants and other forms of financial assistance.

2. This range of incentives will be structured to permit a flexible and customized response to the needs of individual designated properties.

3. Incentives will be designed and administered in a manner that ensures all owners of designated structures are treated with equal fairness.

4. Program criteria and procedures will be as uncomplicated as possible to facilitate communication, understanding, and efficient, prompt administration.

5. Incentives (along with the management of City-owned heritage properties) will emphasize preservation, stabilization, restoration, and rehabilitation as the most appropriate methods for the conservation and use of heritage structures. However, the costs and benefits of the level of authenticity required by these approaches will be assessed carefully in relation to the circumstances of each structure.

6. The City will extend financial assistance for heritage conservation only when it expects to receive full value from the investment — i.e., public heritage benefits, such as retention and continued use of an entire structure, not just its facade; restoration of significant features; commitments to future repair and upkeep; assurances of public access; and/or owner-lessee participation in a district preservation program.

7. Recipients of financial aid from the City should be prepared to accept a community role in the stewardship of assisted properties (e.g., in the form of designation, review and approval of alterations, and/or requirements for ongoing maintenance).

B. CRITERIA FOR APPROVING FUNDING

(Source: Based on current City grant policies and practices)

All applicants for City Heritage funds are required to satisfy the following criteria:

1. The building must be listed on the "Buildings Conservation List" under the terms of the Historical Buildings By-law 1474/77 (as amended).
2. The Certificate of Suitability policy must be satisfied.

Report of the Committee on Planning and Community Services dated July 18, 1995

3. A heritage agreement must be signed that ensures the maintenance of the heritage features of the building, that there is adequate insurance on the structure and that there is protection from demolition in perpetuity.

4. No taxes must be owing.

5. Two estimates for work must be provided.

6. Council approval for grant or tax relief is required prior to the beginning of construction.

7. Costs and work plans must be submitted in advance for prepayment of work or for progressive billing payments.

8. Work must be inspected and approved.

9. Paid bills must be submitted upon completion for auditing.

C. GUIDELINES CONCERNING THE SCOPE AND NATURE OF WORK TO BE FUNDED
(Source: Current Canadian national and provincial definitions of heritage conservation work and building features considered eligible in funding applications)

The intent of the conservation program is to ensure the building's structural stability, to keep it weather tight and to conserve its heritage value.

Projects can fall into three general categories:

1. Preservation and repair of existing architectural elements which are significant from further deterioration
   - this includes repair of deteriorated elements such as doors, windows, roofing or other significant features.

2. Restoration of significant elements which still exist but are beyond preservation or repair.

3. Reconstruction of significant architectural features which are missing.

Explanatory Notes:

a) **Structure** — work to restore a building to structural soundness, but not including structural work to accommodate modern renovations, is eligible.

b) **Repair, Repointing and Cleaning of Masonry** — work is eligible only if the materials and methods used will not cause harm to the historic masonry. Cleaning of a building masonry may be eligible if it is necessary for a building's preservation.

c) **Interior** — services such as plumbing, electrical and heating may be eligible for funding, if they are essential for the preservation of the building. The preservation of listed interior elements will be eligible.

d) **Architects' and Engineers' Fees** — a portion of professional fees is eligible for grant assistance and it must be related to eligible conservation work undertaken as part of a grant-aided project.

c) Contemporary signs, colours or any other features that are not original will not be eligible.

D. STANDARDS
(Source: Current City of Winnipeg Historical Buildings Committee adopted standards for rehabilitation based on the U.S. Department of the Interior "Standards for Rehabilitation" of historic buildings)

The following Standards are to be applied to specific rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

(1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Report of the Committee on Planning and Community Services dated July 18, 1995

(3) Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

(4) Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

(5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old design, colour, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

(7) Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

(8) Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

(10) New additions and adjacent new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.