Minute No. 758
Report - Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services - October 13, 2005

Item No. 2 Establishment of Blue-Ribbon Panel on Malathion
File PA

COUNCIL DECISION:

Council concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services and adopted the following:

1. That the July 27, 2005 Council Motion and the administrative report dated October 7, 2005 pertaining to the proposed establishment of a Blue-Ribbon Panel on Malathion be received as information.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Report - Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services - October 13, 2005

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Councillor Steeves,

That the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services be adopted by consent.

Carried

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On October 19, 2005, the Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services and submitted the matter to Council.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On October 13, 2005, the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services recommended that the July 27, 2005 Council Motion and the administrative report dated October 7, 2005 pertaining to the proposed establishment of a Blue-Ribbon Panel on Malathion be received as information, and submitted the matter to the Executive Policy Committee and Council.

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On September 21, 2005, the Executive Policy Committee referred the recommendation of the Civic Environmental Committee (that the Committee be added as a fifth organization and be invited to nominate one representative to the proposed Blue Ribbon Panel on Mosquito Control) to the Administration for report back to the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services.

CIVIC ENVIRONMENTAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On September 12, 2005, the Civic Environmental Committee recommended that the Administration be requested to consider adding the Civic Environmental Committee as a fifth organization to be invited to nominate one representative to the (proposed) Blue Ribbon Panel on Mosquito Control, and forwarded the matter to the Executive Policy Committee.

Report - Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services - October 13, 2005

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On September 12, 2005, the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services referred the matter to the administration for report back to the Committee at its meeting on October 13, 2005.

COUNCIL:

On July 27, 2005, Council ruled automatic referral of the following motion to the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services:

Moved by Councillor Benham,
Seconded by Councillor Gerbasi,

WHEREAS City Council on October 27, 2004, approved a motion from the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services regarding the City's policy on Insect Control;

AND WHEREAS the motion requested the Winnipeg public service to report on the relative costs and effectiveness of Malathion as a means of controlling adult mosquitoes;

AND WHEREAS the subsequent report outlined a new policy regarding mosquito control, but did not review any of the scientific literature regarding Malathion;

AND WHEREAS City Council endorsed the Blueprint for Action on mosquito control in April, 2003, which called for a Blue-Ribbon Panel of Experts to "provide advice relative to the most effective and environmentally sensitive mosquito control methods;"

AND WHEREAS that panel was not established;

AND WHEREAS the Canadian Association of Physicians for the Environment has called Malathion "a dangerous nerve poison" linked to nerve, kidney and lung damage and childhood leukemia, and called for the City of Winnipeg to halt its use;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that City Council establish a Blue-Ribbon Panel of Experts to review the scientific literature and report on the safety, efficacy, costs and benefits of Malathion for mosquito adulticiding in the Winnipeg context;

Report - Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services - October 13, 2005

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the panel shall consist of:

1. The City of Winnipeg entomologist
2. A senior administrator from the Community Services Department;
3. A chairperson who is not employed by the City of Winnipeg;

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the following organizations be invited to nominate one representative each to the panel:

1. The Province of Manitoba
2. The University of Manitoba
3. The University of Winnipeg
4. The Manitoba Eco-Network

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the panel shall report its preliminary findings, based on the scientific literature, to Council before December 31, 2005;

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the panel shall then hold public hearings on its findings with at least one public hearing to be held in each of the community committee areas before March 31, 2006;

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the panel shall then make a final report to Council before April 30, 2006.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

RE: Establishment of Blue Ribbon Panel on Malathion®

FOR SUBMISSION TO:	**Standing Policy Committee on Protection & Community Services**
ORIGINAL REPORT SIGNED BY:	Ursula Stelman, Director Community Services Department
REPORT DATE:	**October 7, 2005**

RECOMMENDATION(S):

- Given that the Pest Management Regulatory Agency of Health Canada is the federal authority responsible for evaluating the safety and efficacy of pesticides and regulating their use in Canada, it is not recommended that the City of Winnipeg establish a Blue-Ribbon Panel to review the scientific literature for the purposes of evaluating the safety, efficacy, costs and benefits of Malathion® for mosquito adulticiding.

REPORT SUMMARY:

Key Issues:

- "Health Canada's Pest Management Regulatory Agency (PMRA), is the federal agency responsible for the regulation of pest control products in Canada. As the federal authority under the Pest Control Products Act (PCPA), the PMRA also:

    - reviews applications for the registration of pest control products;
    - conducts science-based health, environmental and value (including efficacy) assessments of each pesticide before deciding if it should be approved for use in Canada;
    - develops and implements policies and guidelines related to pest management;
    - promotes sustainable pest management;
    - seeks efficiencies in the processing of registration applications through such means as international harmonization and electronic submission and review of pesticide registration data;
    - enforces compliance with the *Pest Control Products Act*; and
    - disseminates information on pest management issues to the public.

Mandate: PMRA's primary objective is to prevent unacceptable risks to people and the environment from the use of pest control products.

Mission: To protect human health and the environment by minimizing the risks associated with pest control products in an open and transparent manner, while enabling access to pest management tools, namely, these products and sustainable pest management strategies.

Vision: A regulatory agency widely respected in Canada and abroad for the quality, transparency, and efficiency of its science-based decisions and its commitment to sustainable pest management."

- It is outside of the City of Winnipeg's mandate and expertise to scientifically evaluate and determine the safety and efficacy of Malathion®. The PMRA holds the mandate for regulating and licensing the use of pesticides in Canada.
    - The City of Winnipeg follows the regulations and recommendations of the Federal PMRA;
    - The Federal PMRA has recently conducted a re-evaluation of Malathion® . Re-evaluations of pesticides are based on review information from the international scientific community;
    - The Entomologist represents the City of Winnipeg, at both the Provincial and Federal levels, on Expert Scientific Advisory Committees which consider scientific knowledge related to West Nile Virus and best-practices relative to mosquito control, including residential fogging. This provides a mechanism for linking Winnipeg's mosquito control issues to the Provincial and Federal scientific networks. It also provides a mechanism whereby scientists can request the PMRA to consider the licensing of new products if they become available.

- Malathion® is the only adult mosquito control product that has been fully re-evaluated by the PMRA for use in Canada when carrying out ULV adulticiding (fogging) in urban areas. Therefore, it is the recommended product for this use. There are other registered ULV adult mosquito control products in Canada; however they do not have the history of Malathion®; are not as effective; and have not yet been re-evaluated by PMRA. The alternative to the use of Malathion® would be to not conduct residential fogging.

- A re-evaluation of Malathion® was carried out by the PMRA under its recently implemented Re-evaluation Program for all pest control products that were registered in Canada prior to December 31, 1994. Under the PMRA's re-evaluation program, these pest control products are being reviewed to determine if their use continues to be acceptable under today's standards for health and environmental protection. The re-evaluation program forms a key part of the PMRA's effort to ensure the continued safety and value of registered pest control products, and is a major component of the strategy to reduce the risk of pesticides.

- The complete review and re-evaluation of Malathion® for the purpose of adult mosquito control that was conducted by the PMRA in 2003 states *"The PMRA has determined that large-scale applications of Malathion® in residential areas for control of adult mosquitoes do not pose an unacceptable risk to bystanders and operators (mixers/loaders and applicators) when used in the following manner: ground applications are made with Ultra-Low Volume (ULV) equipment at the currently registered rate of up to 60.8 g active ingredient (a.i.)/ha"*.

- The Insect Control Strategy Report prepared for Council consideration and subsequently approved by Council on March 23, 2005 reviewed these PMRA findings with respect to Malathion®. Based on the recommendations and regulations of the PMRA, the report recommended the continued use of Malathion® in Winnipeg when mosquito conditions warrant residential fogging.

- As occurred in 2002 and 2005, when a health emergency appeared imminent because of mosquitoes capable of transmitting West Nile virus (WNv), a Ministerial Order pursuant to the Environment Act was issued by the Minister of Conservation to the City of Winnipeg to implement a mosquito adulticiding program. The Order stated that "the spraying program shall utilize the product Malathion® dispersed by an ultra low volume cold aerosol fogger". Manitoba Health also utilizes the direction of the PMRA when identifying Malathion® as the product to be utilized for adult mosquito control in response to WNv.

Implications of the Recommendation(s):

General implications:

None

X **For the organization overall &/or for other departments**

X **For the community and/or organizations external to the City**

Involves a multi-year contract

Comment(s): Malathion® has been the primary adulticide used in the City of Winnipeg's adult mosquito control program since 1969.

Malathion® is perceived by some citizens as a toxic chemical and therefore public concern regarding its use has been expressed.

It is outside of The City of Winnipeg's mandate and expertise to scientifically evaluate and determine the safety and efficacy of Malathion®. The City of Winnipeg follows the recommendations and regulations of the PMRA which holds this mandate and regulates the use of pesticides in Canada.

Malathion® is the only adult mosquito control product that has been fully re-evaluated by the PMRA for use in Canada when carrying out ULV adulticiding (fogging) in urban areas. Therefore, it is the recommended product for this use.

The alternative to the use of Malathion® would be to not conduct residential fogging.

Policy implications:

No

X **Yes** **Comment(s):** Health Canada's Pest Management Regulatory Agency (PMRA), is the federal agency responsible for the regulation of pest control products in Canada.

It is outside of the City of Winnipeg's mandate and expertise to scientifically evaluate and determine the safety and efficacy of Malathion®.

The City of Winnipeg follows the recommendations and regulations of the Federal PMRA.

Environmental implications:

No

X **Yes** **Comment(s):** In 2003 the Federal PMRA conducted a full re-evaluation of Malathion® when used for adult mosquito control.

The 2003 Federal PMRA re-evaluation of Malathion® states *"The PMRA has determined that large-scale applications of Malathion® in residential areas for control of adult mosquitoes do not pose an unacceptable risk to bystanders and operators (mixers/loaders and applicators) when used in the following manner: ground applications are made with Ultra-Low Volume (ULV) equipment at the currently registered rate of up to 60.8 g active ingredient (a.i.)/ha"*.

Malathion® is the only adult mosquito control product that has been fully re-evaluated by the PMRA for use in Canada when carrying out ULV adulticiding (fogging) in urban areas. Therefore, it is the recommended product for this use. There are other registered ULV adult mosquito control products in Canada, however the do not have the history of Malathion®; are not as effective; and have not yet been re-evaluated by PMRA.

The alternative to the use of Malathion® would be to not conduct residential fogging.

The Insect Control Strategy Report prepared for Council consideration and subsequently approved by Council on March 23, 2005:

- Reviewed these PMRA findings with respect to Malathion® and based on the recommendations and regulations of the PMRA, the report recommended the continued use of Malathion® in Winnipeg when mosquito conditions warrant residential fogging.

- Is intended to reduce the City of Winnipeg's reliance on residential fogging for nuisance mosquitoes through the implementation of a comprehensive biological based larviciding program over the next three years (2005 – 2007). However, in the event that conditions warrant, The City of Winnipeg Adult Mosquito Control Policy allows for adult nuisance mosquito control to be carried out as one component of an Integrated Pest Management Strategy.

Human Resources implications:
X No
Yes Comment(s):

Financial implications:
X Within approved current and/or capital budget
Current and/or capital budget adjustment required
Comment(s): There are no financial implications associated with this report.

REASON FOR THE REPORT:

On July 27, 2005, Council ruled automatic referral of the following motion to the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services:

Moved by Councillor Benham,
Seconded by Councillor Gerbasi,

WHEREAS City Council on October 27, 2004, approved a motion from the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services regarding the City's policy on Insect Control;

AND WHEREAS the motion requested the Winnipeg public service to report on the relative costs and effectiveness of Malathion as a means of controlling adult mosquitoes;

AND WHEREAS the subsequent report outlined a new policy regarding mosquito control, but did not review any of the scientific literature regarding Malathion;

AND WHEREAS City Council endorsed the Blueprint for Action on mosquito control in April, 2003, which called for a Blue-Ribbon Panel of Experts to "provide advice relative to the most effective and environmentally sensitive mosquito control methods;"

AND WHEREAS that panel was not established;

AND WHEREAS the Canadian Association of Physicians for the Environment has called Malathion "a dangerous nerve poison" linked to nerve, kidney and lung damage and childhood leukemia, and called for the City of Winnipeg to halt its use;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that City Council establish a Blue-Ribbon Panel of Experts to review the scientific literature and report on the safety, efficacy, costs and benefits of Malathion for mosquito adulticiding in the Winnipeg context;

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the panel shall consist of:

1. The City of Winnipeg entomologist
2. A senior administrator from the Community Services Department;
3. A chairperson who is not employed by the City of Winnipeg;

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the following organizations be invited to nominate one representative each to the panel:

1. The Province of Manitoba
2. The University of Manitoba
3. The University of Winnipeg
4. The Manitoba Eco-Network

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the panel shall report its preliminary findings, based on the scientific literature, to Council before December 31, 2005;

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the panel shall then hold public hearings on its findings with at least one public hearing to be held in each of the community committee areas before March 31, 2006;

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the panel shall then make a final report to Council before April 30, 2006.

On September 12, 2005, The Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services referred the matter to the administration for report back to the Committee at its meeting on October 13, 2005.

In addition, on September 21, 2005 the Executive Policy Committee referred the recommendation of the Civic Environmental Committee (that the Committee be added as a fifth organization and be invited to nominate one representative to the proposed Blue Ribbon Panel on Mosquito Control) to the Administration for report back to the Standing Policy Committee on Protection and Community Services.

HISTORY:

Malathion® has been the primary adulticide used in the City of Winnipeg's nuisance adult mosquito control program since 1969.

The Insect Control Strategy approved by Council on March, 2005 is intended to reduce the City of Winnipeg's reliance on residential fogging for nuisance mosquitoes through the implementation of a comprehensive biological based larviciding program over the next three years (2005 – 2007).

However, in the event that conditions warrant, The City of Winnipeg Adult Mosquito Control Policy allows for adult nuisance mosquito control to be carried out, as one component of an Integrated Pest Management Strategy.

As occurred in 2002 and 2005, when a health emergency appeared imminent because of mosquitoes capable of transmitting WNv, a Ministerial Order pursuant to the Environment Act was issued by the Minister of Conservation to the City of Winnipeg to implement a mosquito adulticiding program. The Order stated that "the spraying program shall utilize the product Malathion® dispersed by an ultra low volume cold aerosol fogger". Manitoba Health also utilizes the direction of the PMRA when identifying Malathion® as the product to be utilized for adult mosquito control in response to WNv.

DISCUSSION:

Malathion® is the only adult mosquito control product that has been fully re-evaluated by the Federal Pest Management Regulatory Agency (PMRA) for use in Canada when carrying out ULV adulticiding (fogging) in urban areas. Therefore, it is the recommended pesticide product for this use. There are other registered ULV adult mosquito control products in Canada such as synthetic permethrins, however they do not have the history of Malathion®; are not as effective; and have not yet been fully re-evaluated by PMRA. Therefore, it would not be prudent to consider these as an alternative to Malathion® at this time. The alternative to the use of Malathion® would be to not conduct residential fogging.

It is outside of The City of Winnipeg's mandate and expertise to scientifically evaluate and determine the safety and efficacy of Malathion®. The City of Winnipeg follows the recommendations of the Federal PMRA which holds this mandate. Information on the PMRA Re-evaluation Program can be found at www.pmra-arla.gc.ca.

- Health Canada has implemented the PMRA Re-evaluation Program in order to review all pesticide active ingredients, or active ingredients in end-use products, that were registered in Canada prior to December 31, 1994. Approximately 550 pesticide active ingredients and their end-use products are currently registered in Canada, of which 405 active ingredients were registered or were in registered end-use products prior to December 31, 1994. Re-evaluation is the review of pesticide active ingredients and their end-use products on the basis of updated data and information to determine whether, and under what conditions, their continued registration is acceptable. Currently registered end-use products are re-evaluated, and the conditions of acceptability for active ingredients and their end-use products, including acceptable uses, rates, timing, methods of application, preharvest and re-entry intervals, appropriate cautionary and first aid statements, and limitations or risk reduction measures are determined.

  Given the magnitude of the re-evaluation task, the Canadian re-evaluation policy is heavily reliant on the outcomes of the pesticide re-registration program of the United States; and in order to be cost effective is conducted in cooperation between the U.S and Canada and with other Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) countries.

  The re-evaluation program forms a key part of the PMRA's effort to ensure the continued safety and value of registered pest control products. Re-evaluation enhances the PMRA's ability to ensure the continued safety and value of registered pest control products and is a major component of the strategy to reduce the risk of pesticides.

- In 2003 Malathion® was re-evaluated by the PMRA Re-evaluation Program. On September 5, 2003, the PMRA released their decision in a document on the 'Re-evaluation of Malathion®, which provides a detailed review of human and non-human effects. This document states, *"The PMRA has determined that large-scale applications of Malathion® in residential areas for control of adult mosquitoes do not pose an unacceptable risk to bystanders and operators (mixers/loaders and applicators) when used in the following manner: ground applications are made with Ultra-Low Volume (ULV) equipment at the currently registered rate of up to 60.8 g active ingredient (a.i.)/ha"*.

  The Re-evaluation Document for Malathion can be accessed at www.pmra-arla.gc.ca/english/pdf/pacr/pacr2003-10-e.pdf

The Insect Control Strategy Report prepared for Council consideration and subsequently approved by Council on March 23, 2005 reviewed the PMRA recommendations with respect to Malathion®. Based on the findings and the regulations of the PMRA, the report recommended the continued use of Malathion® in Winnipeg when mosquito conditions warrant residential fogging.

The City of Winnipeg utilizes Malathion® in accordance with the regulations of the Federal PMRA.

The Pesticide Use Permit issued annually to the City of Winnipeg by Manitoba Conservation also regulates the conditions and manner in which Malathion® is used when conducting adult mosquito control in urban areas within the City of Winnipeg.

The City of Winnipeg Entomologist is a member of Scientific Review Committees at both the Provincial and Federal levels. These review committees provide advice on mosquito control with respect to WNv. This includes the use of adulticiding as a component of an integrated WNv mosquito control program. This provides a mechanism for linking Winnipeg's mosquito control issues to the Provincial and Federal scientific networks. It also provides a mechanism whereby scientists can request the PMRA to consider the licensing of new products if they become available.

These memberships include:

- *The Province of Manitoba West Nile Virus Scientific Advisory Committee*

Membership: Chief Medical Officer of Health; Manitoba Director of Public Health; Deputy Chief Medical Officer of Health; Infectious Disease Specialist; Winnipeg and rural Medical Officers of Health; Director of Cadham Laboratory; Manitoba West Nile Virus Coordinator; the Entomologist for the Province; Centre for Disease Control Epidemiologist; Environmental Medical Consultant; Health Canada Scientist; City of Winnipeg Entomologist; Provincial Veterinarian; Manitoba Conservation Representative; Pesticide Approvals Representative (Manitoba Conservation); Director of Health Communications; Representative Regional Coordinator; and a Community Medicine Resident.

Mandate: The mandate of this committee is "to review and interpret WNv surveillance data and other information to provide scientific advice on public health practice to the Public Health Leadership team".

As occurred in 2002 and 2005, when a health emergency appeared imminent because of mosquitoes capable of transmitting West Nile virus, a Ministerial Order pursuant to the Environment Act was issued by the Minister of Conservation to the City of Winnipeg to implement a mosquito adulticiding program. The Order stated that "the spraying program shall

utilize the product Malathion® dispersed by an ultra low volume cold aerosol fogger". Manitoba Health also utilizes the direction of the PMRA when identifying Malathion® as the product to be utilized for adult mosquito control in response to WNv.

- *The Health Canada National West Nile Virus Steering Committee and the National Mosquito Surveillance & Control Subcommittee*

Membership: Entomologists, scientists and disease experts representing major mosquito control programs in each Province and/or territory in Canada

Mandate: The mandate of this subcommittee is to identify options for mosquito control, gaps in available products, priorities and rationale for development and access to alternative mosquito control products.

Representatives from Manitoba who are members of the National Committee (National Microbiology Lab, the Entomologist for the Province of Manitoba, the University of Brandon and the City of Winnipeg Entomologist) also work together locally to ensure that Winnipeg and Manitoba's priorities are addressed at the Provincial and Federal level. This includes promoting the registration of new control products within Canada as they become available.

In summary, given that:

- the PMRA is the federal agency responsible, under the Pest Control Products Act (PCPA), for the regulation of pest control products in Canada, including the review of applications for the registration of pest control products; and conducting science-based health, environmental and value (including efficacy) assessments of each pesticide before deciding if it should be approved for use in Canada;
- the PMRA has recently conducted a full re-evaluation of Malathion®;
- and the City Entomologist represents the City of Winnipeg on Expert Advisory Committees that link municipal mosquito control issues to the larger Provincial and Federal scientific networks,

it is unclear what additional scientific contribution the proposed local Blue Ribbon Panel would make relative to scientifically evaluating and determining the safety and efficacy of Malathion®.

Financial Impact Statement **Date:** October 7, 2005

Project Name: **First Year of Program** 2005

Establishment of Blue Ribbon Panel on Malathion

	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Capital					
Capital Expenditures Required	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Less: Existing Budgeted Costs	-	-	-	-	-
Additional Capital Budget Required	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Funding Sources:					
Debt - Internal	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
External	-	-	-	-	-
Grants (Identify)	-	-	-	-	-
Reserves, Equity, Surplus, Other	-	-	-	-	-
Total Funding	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Total Additional Capital Budget Required	$ -				
Total Additional Debt Required	$ -				
Current Expenditures/Revenues					
Direct Costs	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Less: Incremental Revenue/Recovery	-	-	-	-	-
Net Cost/(Benefit)	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Less: Existing Budget Amounts	-	-	-	-	-
Net Budget Adjustment Required	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -

Additional Comments:

There are no financial implications associated with this report.

"Original signed by"
Cindy Fernandes, B. Comm (Hon), CMA
Acting Manager of Finance & Administrative Services

IN PREPARING THIS REPORT THERE WAS CONSULTATION WITH, AND CONCURRENCY BY:

- N/A

THIS REPORT SUBMITTED BY:

Community Services Department
Prepared by: Kelly Goldstrand,
Manager of Community Resource, Protection & Safety Services

Taz Stuart,
City of Winnipeg Entomologist
File No.