Minute No. 79
Report - Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development - November 19, 2002

Item No. 5 Proposed Grade III Listing on Building Conservation List - Florence Nightingale School - 31 Shaughnessy Street - File G-3.1.1 (Vol. 1)

COUNCIL DECISION:

Council concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development and adopted the following:

1. That the Florence Nightingale School located at 31 Shaughnessy Street not be placed on the Buildings Conservation List, under the Historical Buildings By-law No. 1474/77 as a Grade III building, on the condition that the building be demolished and the applicant submit a landscape plan for the subject property for the approval of the Director of Property, Planning and Development or his designate.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing, including the execution of any documents related thereto.

Report - Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development - November 19, 2002

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Councillor Vandal,

That the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development be adopted by consent.

Carried

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On December 4, 2002, the Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On November 19, 2002, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development concurred in the recommendation of the Lord Selkirk-West Kildonan Community Committee.

COMMUNITY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On November 12, 2002, the Lord Selkirk-West Kildonan Community Committee did not concur in the Historical Buildings Committee recommendation, and recommended that the Florence Nightingale School located at 31 Shaughnessy Street not be placed on the Buildings Conservation List, under the Historical Buildings By-law No. 1474/77 as a Grade III building, on the condition that the building be demolished and the applicant submit a landscape plan for the subject property for the approval of the Director of Property, Planning and Development or his designate.

HISTORICAL BUILDINGS COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On September 19, 2002, the Historical Buildings Committee recommended that the Florence Nightingale School located at 31 Shaughnessy Street be placed on the Buildings Conservation List, under the Historical Buildings By-law No. 1474/77 as a Grade III building.

Winnipeg

September 27, 2002

TO: CHAIRPERSON AND MEMBERS
STANDING POLICY COMMITTEE ON
PROPERTY AND DEVELOPMENT

CHAIRPERSON AND MEMBERS
LORD SELKIRK/WEST
KILDONAN COMMUNITY
COMMITTEE

RE: HISTORICAL BUILDINGS BY-LAW
NO. 1474/77 AS AMENDED

The Historical Buildings Committee recommends that the following building be placed on the Buildings Conservation List:

Name	Address	Grade Recommendation
Florence Nightingale School	31 Shaughnessy Street	Grade III

The above recommendation was made by the Committee at its meeting on September 19, 2002.

Councillor Jenny Gerbasi
Chairperson
Historical Buildings Committee

HERITAGE PLANNER'S REPORT

The Historical Buildings Committee evaluated Florence Nightingale School at the request of Winnipeg School Division #1 who made an application to the City to demolish the one-storey building.

The role of the City's Historical Buildings Committee is to advise City Council on the technical and historical significance of buildings whose owners wish to either be eligible for grant programs or to demolish a structure on the "Inventory of Buildings" under the terms of the Historical Buildings By-law 1474/77 (as amended). The Committee, in reviewing buildings may take into account engineering reviews of a structure but must allow discussion of economic viability to be a political consideration.

The Committee advised that the reasons for designation are for the school building's strong architectural interest. This one-storey brick veneer structure with an elaborate entranceway is now just one of several school buildings of this type that remain. The overall design of the building and the interior arrangement are noteworthy and contribute to the building's significance.

The school building is one of the last remaining features that interprets the history of "CPR Town", in the section of the North End which was inhabited by labourers from the British Isles who worked in the Canadian Pacific shops. By 1900 the area was known as Shaughnessy Park.

SUMMARY OF HISTORIC RESEARCH

World War I and its aftermath posed many challenges for the Winnipeg School District (WSD), not the least of which was how to accommodate a fast-growing student population at a time when there was little money or material for new classrooms.

One response by WSD officials was to adopt an alternative to their two- and three-storey school buildings. They turned to a less elaborate one-storey model that could be erected quickly and economically.

The first eight 'bungalow-style' schools, intended for temporary use only, were planned in 1918-19 by the WSD's long-time architect, James B. Mitchell. Another eight were designed by consultant John N. Semmens in 1920-21, including Florence Nightingale School in northwest Winnipeg. Because the latter were to be permanent facilities, Semmens was given greater scope to incorporate ornamental detailing and more expensive construction materials in his plans.

Semmens (1880-1961) was an Ontarian who had studied at Wesley College in Toronto and the University of Pennsylvania. His Winnipeg practice extended from 1910 into the 1950s, latterly with his nephew, Harold N. Semmens, then with John S. Allison. His portfolio included warehouses, hospitals, the North End (St. John's) Library, churches, commercial structures, and

private houses, as well as schools in Winnipeg, St. James, Dauphin, Manitoba, and Saskatoon, Saskatchewan. Like Mitchell, Semmens had a second career in the military with the Winnipeg Grenadiers. He was an officer in Europe during World War I, organized a Grenadiers battalion in World War II, and commanded Camp Shilo near Brandon, Manitoba for a period.

Florence Nightingale School was built in 1920 by the Sutherland Construction Co. on the east side of Shaughnessy Street between Pritchard and Manitoba avenues, just north of the Canadian Pacific Railway's bustling Weston shops and yards. Named after a pioneer British nurse, the elementary school was of masonry construction with a reinforced concrete foundation, brick load-bearing walls, wood frame, and hip roof. Its exterior was clothed in red brick with stone and wood accents.

The original design of the symmetrical front (west) façade featured a central entrance flanked by prominent gable ends with return eaves and bold arched window heads. The entrance was set behind plain wooden columns that supported a name panel and wooden balustrade-parapet. The double door was topped by a decorative transom light and framed by attached columns and a swept hood.

The interior had two classrooms, a principal's office and teachers' room at the front; three classrooms, washrooms and end doorways at the rear; all off a wide central corridor. Classrooms had high ceilings and large rectangular banks of wood-framed, multi-paned windows. A rear three-sided bay window lit a stairway to the building's partial basement.

As with other bungalow-style schools, Florence Nightingale experienced physical modifications over time to meet changes in enrolment, curriculum and building standards. End additions planned in 1929 by architect John H.G. Russell and in 1949 by W.A. Martin, the WSD's building commissioner, were sympathetic to the structure's original exterior design, while nearly doubling available space and providing new facilities such as an auditorium/gymnasium.

In June 2002, however, the school was closed after being deemed redundant and too expensive to upgrade. The school division subsequently solicited tenders for the building's demolition. Three other WSD bungalow-style schools remain from the 1918-21 period. All are occupied, but only one – Wolseley on Clifton Street South – continues to be an active elementary school.

_____

Giles Bugailiskis
Senior Planner (Heritage)

GB:eb
Attach.
cc: Ms. Gail Stephens, Chief Administrative Officer
Mr. E. Gilroy, Manager, EPC Secretariat
Mr. H. Finnigan, Director, Planning, Property & Development Department

CITY OF WINNIPEG

HISTORICAL BUILDINGS COMMITTEE

BUILDING EVALUATION
FORM

Location: 31 Shaughnessy Street

Name: Current - Florence Nightingale School
Original -

Owner: Winnipeg School Division No. 1, Attention: Brian Porter, Building Department, 1395 Spruce Street, R3E 2V8

Present Use: Vacant

Building Grade **I** **II** **III**
I* **II*** **III***

EVALUATION DATE: September 19, 2002

Recommendation: To list as Grade III


FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE SCHOOL