Agenda - Council - June 24, 2009

Report - Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development - June 2, 2009

Item No. 1 The Historical Buildings By-law No. 1474/77 - Dennistown House - 166 Roslyn Road (Fort Rouge-East Fort Garry Ward) File G-3.1.1

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On June 10, 2009, the Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development and submits the following to Council:

1. That 166 Roslyn Road (Dennistown House) be removed from the Buildings Conservation List.

2. That no demolition permits be issued for 166 Roslyn Road prior to the issuance of building permits.

3. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Report - Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development - June 2, 2009

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On June 10, 2009, the Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development and submitted the matter to Council.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On June 2, 2009, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development did not concur in the recommendation of the Historical Buildings Committee and recommended to the Executive Policy Committee and Council:

1. That 166 Roslyn Road (Dennistown House) be removed from the Buildings Conservation List, subject to the following condition:

2. That no demolition permits be issued for 166 Roslyn Road prior to the issuance of building permits.

Further on June 2, 2009, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development received submissions from the following:

In support of the recommendation from the Historic Buildings Committee not to remove 166 Roslyn Road from the Historic Buildings Conservation List:

- Judy Lehn, submitted a presentation
- Jennifer Lukovich, submitted a presentation
- Dr. Frank J. Hechter submitted a communication dated May 25, 2009
- Dave Wilken submitted a presentation dated June 2, 2009

In opposition to the recommendation from the Historic Buildings Committee not to remove 166 Roslyn Road from the Historic Buildings Conservation List:

- Bill Cody, Sunstone Resort Properties, submitted a presentation dated June 2, 2009

HISTORICAL BUILDINGS COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On March 20, 2008 the Historical Buildings Committee recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development:

Report - Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development - June 2, 2009

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

HISTORICAL BUILDINGS COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION (continued):

1. The building not be delisted because the heritage values have not changed.

2. The Osborne Village Neighbourhood Plan be noted as stating:
(7.1.6.A) Discourage the demolition of historic or architecturally significant buildings or structures. Demolition shall be considered as a last resort, and should only be considered when buildings are determined to be structurally unsound beyond repair by an independent structural engineering report. Economic viability should not be the sole determining factor.

THE CITY OF WINNIPEG

COUNCILLORS' OFFICE

CIVIC CENTRE • 510 MAIN STREET • WINNIPEG • MANITOBA • R3B 1B9
www.jennygerbasi.ca

JENNY GERBASI
Councillor
FORT ROUGE-EAST FORT
GARRY WARD
City-Centre Community
Committee

Telephone: 986-5878
Fax: 986-5636
E-Mail: jgerbasi@winnipeg.ca

March 20, 2009

Chairperson and Members
Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development

Re: Delisting Dennistown House, 166 Roslyn Road

The Historical Buildings Committee has been advised that a request was received from Sunstone Resort Communities Corp., agents of the property owners, to have this building removed from the Buildings Conservation List (delisted) in order that it may be demolished. The proposed redevelopment of the site would be a multi-family residential complex, including the three neighboring properties to the west.

In considering this request, the Committee visited the house on March 19, 2009 to review its condition. At their meeting following, the Committee agreed that the heritage values have not changed since designation of the property in 1984 as a Grade III structure.

The three-storey Dennistown House was built in 1908 for the Honourable Justice Robert M. Dennistown. It stands as one of the few private dwellings remaining from one of Winnipeg's early affluent suburbs, a good example of the Tudor style designed by prominent architect John D. Atchison, and is associated with a notable historic figure. It was designated for its merit as a structure contributing to the early suburban character of Roslyn Road, which is slowly being eroded, as the stately homes are lost to new development.

The Historical Buildings Committee believes that the heritage values of the building have not changed since the time of designation. The Committee may consider a building be delisted in extraordinary circumstances where it has been entirely or substantially destroyed, or is no longer of special architectural or historic interest. However, in this case, the historical connection with Judge Dennistown gives the structure a prominence representing the career of a notable figure in Manitoba's judicial and military history. The architectural style also makes the Dennistown House of particular importance in establishing the dominant character of the area and contributes to the historical continuity of the streetscape.

Therefore, the Historical Buildings Committee recommends that:

1) The building not be delisted because the heritage values have not changed;
2) The Osborne Village Neighbourhood Plan be noted as stating:
   (7.1.6.A) Discourage the demolition of historic or architecturally significant buildings or structures. Demolition shall be considered as a last resort, and should only be considered when buildings are determined to be structurally unsound beyond repair by an independent structural engineering report. Economic viability should not be the sole determining factor.

Jenny Gerbasi
Chairperson, Historical Buildings Committee
Councillor, Fort Rouge-East Fort Garry Ward

cc: Glen Laubenstein, Chief Administrative Officer
Phil Sheegl, Deputy Chief Administrative Officer
Deepak Joshi, Director, Planning, Property, and Development Department