FOOD FOR THOUGHT ON THE CHARLESWOOD BRIDGE PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP

- Mayor Susan Thompson promoted the use of a Public-Private-Partnership (PPP) approach in 1995 to construct the Charleswood Bridge and said that it would be $1 million cheaper than using the traditional public sector capital construction and financing approach.

- John Loxley, an economist at the University of Manitoba, has recently completed a detailed study of the Charleswood Bridge that concludes otherwise: the PPP approach will cost an extra $1.4 million in present value in terms of financing; the PPP interest rate is double the level of interest of what the City would pay for borrowing funds; costs to consultants was 6.7 times as high as those incurred through the traditional design-bid-build approach.

- One of the main concerns regarding the PPP approach is that it privatizes information that should remain in the public realm.

- On March 27, 2009, the Public Works Department of the City of Winnipeg refused to disclose information about the Charleswood Bridge maintenance contract that was requested under the Freedom of Information and Protection (FIPPA) by a citizen of Winnipeg.

- The reasons given for the refusal to provide the requested information about the maintenance contract was based on two sections of the FIPPA:

    - 17(1) Disclosure harmful to a third party's privacy
    - 18(1)(c) Disclosure harmful to a third party's business interest

- The Public Works Department is hiding behind the FIPPA legislation – other sections of FIPPA state:

    - 17(4)(f) Disclosure of personal information is not an unreasonable invasion of a third party's privacy if the disclosure reveals financial or other details of a contract to supply goods or services to or on behalf of a public body

    - 18(4)(b) A head of a public body may disclose information if the private interest of the third party in the non-disclosure is clearly outweighed by the public interest in the disclosure for purposes of improved competition

- Imagine the uproar if arts groups or community organizations hid behind FIPPA third party privacy legislation and refused to reveal how much funding they received from the City of Winnipeg

- If public private partnerships are all the a cranked up to be, why is the City of Winnipeg afraid to provide the financial information regarding the maintenance contract of the Charleswood Bridge?

- Between 2007 and 2011, the City of Winnipeg will reduce spending on the construction and maintenance of public owned bridges from $24.8 M to $20.6 M or 17%. The Charleswood Bridge PPP has a fixed contract and will not experience these cutbacks. Why do publicly funded bridges get maintenance cutbacks and privately funded bridges get long term funding commitments?

FROM

THIS AGREEMENT MADE as of the 1st day of October, 1994.

BETWEEN:

THE CITY OF WINNIPEG,

(herein called the "City"),

OF THE FIRST PART,

- and -

S.17(1)],

(herein called "17(1)"),

OF THE SECOND PART.

WHEREAS:

A. The City and 17(1) have entered into the Project Agreement wherein, inter alia, 17(1) has agreed to undertake the Works in accordance with the plans and specifications approved by the City and more particularly described in the RFP, the Proposal and the Final Project Plan;

B. 17(1) has agreed with the City that it will perform, or cause to be performed the Major Maintenance subject to the terms and conditions of this Agreement;

C. The City has agreed with 17(1) that it will perform, or cause to be performed the Minor Maintenance subject to the terms and conditions of this Agreement.

Maintenance Fund Contributions

	December 1995 to November 1996	1996 1997	1997 1998	1998 1999	1999 2000	2000 2001	2001 2002	2002 2003	2003 2004	2004 2005	2005 2006	2006 2007	2007 2008	2008 2009	2009 2010
Asphalt Maintenance - Joints															
Asphalt Maintenance - Seal & Patch															
Asphalt overly - Includes Planing															
Asphalt Resurfacing - Includes Planing															
Approach Roadway Expansion Joint Replace															
Expansion Joint Regap															
Bearing Repositioning															
Deck Joints															
Roadway/Sidewalk/Barrier Resurface															
Concrete Maintenance - Joint															
Concrete Maintenance - Slab Patch															
Concrete Maintenance - Asphalt Overlay															
Maintenance Expense (1994 dollars)															
Maintenance Expense (current dollar)															

18(1)(c)

18(1)(c)

	December 2010 to November 2011	2011 2012	2012 2013	2013 2014	2014 2015	2015 2016	2016 2017	2017 2018	2018 2019	2019 2020	2020 2021	2021 2022	2022 2023	2023 2024	2024 2025	Tot
Asphalt Maintenance - Joints																
Asphalt Maintenance - Seal & Patch																
Asphalt overly - Includes Planing																
Asphalt Resurfacing - Includes Planing																
Approach Roadway Expansion Joint Replac																
Expansion Joint Regap																
Bearing Repositioning																
Deck Joints																
Roadway/Sidewalk/Barrier Resurface																
Concrete Maintenance - Joint																
Concrete Maintenance - Slab Patch																
Concrete Maintenance - Asphalt Overlay																
Maintenance Expense (1994 dollars)																
Maintenance Expense (current dollar)																

18(1)(c)

18(1)(c)

SCHEDULE "C" to Maintenance Agreement between the City of Winnipeg and 17(1) .. dated as of the 1st day of October, 1994.
PROJECT MANAGEMENT FEES AND ENGINEERING COSTS

	December to November	1995 1996	1996 1997	1997 1998	1998 1999	1999 2000	2000 2001	2001 2002	2002 2003	2003 2004	2004 2005	2005 2006	2006 2007	2007 2008	2008 2009	2009 2010	
l Management ering Costs								18(1)(c)									
ions Expense (1994 dollars) ions Expense (current dollar)								18(1)(c)									
	December to November	2010 2011	2011 2012	2012 2013	2013 2014	2014 2015	2015 2016	2016 2017	2017 2018	2018 2019	2019 2020	2020 2021	2021 2022	2022 2023	2023 2024	2024 2025	Total
Management ering Costs								18(1)(c)									
ions Expense (1994 dollars) ions Expense (current dollar)								18(1)(c)									