Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – February 17, 2010

Minute No. 176
Report – Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works – February 9, 2010

Item No. 1 Organics Collection Options
eFile WT-1.3

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

The Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works and submits the following to Council:

1. That a curbside collection program be implemented in the North-West automated cart collection area in order to collect surplus yard waste during the peak spring and fall periods.

2. That the St. James area Leaf-It-With-Us depot be closed after the implementation of recommendation 1.

3. That the City contract out the collection program as well as the construction and operation of a yard waste composting facility to process the anticipated yard waste.

4. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works – February 9, 2010

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Councillor Clement,

That the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works be concurred in and forwarded to Council.

Carried

The Executive Policy Committee received submissions with respect to Organics Collection Options from the following:

- Wayne Warren, Environmental Geographer, submitted a copy of his presentation
- Peter Miller and Kate Bergen, Resource Conservation Manitoba, submitted a communication dated February 16, 2010.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On February 9, 2010, the Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the matter to Executive Policy Committee and Council.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

ISSUE: ORGANICS COLLECTION OPTIONS

Critical Path: Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Work, EPC, Council.

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO
D. Drohomerski, Manager, Solid Waste Services Division	B. D. MacBride, P. Eng. Director, Water and Waste Department	M. Ruta CFO	A. Robinson Deputy CAO

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That a curbside collection program be implemented in the North-West automated cart collection area in order to collect surplus yard waste during the peak spring and fall periods.

2. That the St. James area Leaf-It-With-Us depot be closed after the implementation of recommendation 1.

3. That the City contract out the collection program as well as the construction and operation of a yard waste composting facility to process the anticipated yard waste.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

Four options were considered for addressing the organics and yard waste issues for the entire City of Winnipeg. Appendix A shows selected Canadian cities organics programs for comparison purposes.

Option 1: Depot Program - Status Quo. The status quo option is continue with a projected 5,000 tonne spring and fall yard waste collection program at the 12 Leaf-It-With-Us drop-off depots city-wide. Residents would be required to drop off their yard waste, or use alternatives such as home composting, grass cycling, or hire contractors to haul yard waste to the drop off facilities. Residents can also drop off yard waste at the Brady Road Landfill during the rest of the year for no charge.

Residents may find this option unsatisfactory because they require a vehicle to take advantage of the program.

There is no financial impact to this option as it is what is being done now.

Option 2: Spring and Fall Yard Waste Curbside Collection. Recommended Option. This option involves manual collection of an estimated 19,000 tonnes of bagged yard waste, citywide. The program provides for bi-weekly collection service for four weeks in the spring, and four weeks in the fall, depending on weather. Residents will bag their yard waste using certified compostable bags. The special bags allow the composter to produce a better quality compost. The City will contract the collection of yard waste, and yard waste processing for compost.

Outside the collection periods, residents may choose to grass cycle, home compost, place their yard waste in the collection cart or have it hauled away.

The program is estimated to cost approximately $1,043,000 annually to operate City wide.

The recommendation of this report is to launch this option would be in the north-west sector to 42,500 homes. The estimated cost will be approximately $232,000 annually. With the automated cart collection contract for the North West sector lower than the 2010 budget, there are funds available to fund the program.

The recommendation is limited to the north-west area in order to serve as a complimentary program to the automated cart collection program. Implementation in the rest of the City would require additional funding. It may make sense to consider expansion of the program when Council considers expansion of the automated cart collection program in future tenders.

Automated garbage collection using 240 litre carts will commence in the north-west sector of Winnipeg on February 1, 2010. The 240 litre cart has slightly more volume that an average volume of residential garbage put out (less than two standard garbage cans put out, cart has capacity for three garbage cans of waste). Automated garbage collection trucks can not pick up additional bags or cans of garbage. However in peak times, such as spring and fall, there is a greater volume of yard waste than cart capacity.

Option 3: Seven month yard waste collection program. This option involves manual collection of an estimated 42,000 tonnes of bagged yard waste, citywide. The program is provided for seven months, starting in the spring from May to November, depending on weather. To participate, residents will need to bag their yard waste using only certified compostable bags.

The program is estimated to cost approximately $2,217,000 annually to operate City wide. The yard waste collection contract and composting processing contracts can be administered by existing staff. There would be additional savings in garbage collection contracts as the bidders would haul less waste each year and could reduce their hauling costs accordingly.

Option 4: 12 month organics and yard waste curbside collection. This option involves manual collection of kitchen and bagged yard waste, of an estimated 64,400 tonnes of bagged yard waste. The program operates year-round. Residents will place kitchen scraps in a special cart for collection, and need to bag their yard waste using certified compostable bags only.

The program is estimated to cost approximately $4,995,000 annually to operate City wide. The organics collection contract and composting processing contracts *will require* addition staff to administer contracts. Note that the cost estimate is for open windrow composting of kitchen and yard waste. If a contained composting system was required, the estimated additional capital cost would be in the order of $5,000,000. This value is not included with the annual cost estimate provided in this report.

If the yard waste processing operation is on the Brady Road property, it needs to fall within the new Provincial landfill operating license that Solid Waste Services is applying for. See "Common considerations" for additional implications.

The following table is a summary of the estimated costs associated each option. There is a risk that when the work is actually tendered the costs could be higher.

Summary	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4
Tonnes/year	4,948	19,197	42,057	64,413
Operating $/yr	$ 247,000	$ 1,043,000	$ 2,217,000	$ 4,995,000
$ cost per tonne	$ 57.28	$ 54.33	$ 52.70	$ 77.54

Common Considerations:

Some of the additional cost may be offset by the Provincial Waste Reduction and Recycling Support (WRARS) funding. The greater amount of the waste diverted versus other programs in Manitoba, the greater the share of the total funding that would come to Winnipeg. The amount funding available for each option is not known at this time and therefore has not been included in current budget estimates.

In addition, there will be savings by closing the Leaf-It-With-Us depots, and with the offset of tonnes diverted from the landfill. There may be carbon dioxide reduction credits available; however these have not been included in the estimate due to their uncertainty. There is a potential to sell the compost, if a Grade A material is produced. Compost material is a valuable landfill cover material and soil amendment. The City would work with retailers to ensure compostable bags are made available to the public in sufficient quantities. A ban on non-compostable bags for organics would be required and has been successful in other cities in Canada.

Environmental benefits include avoided land filling of organic material, and the corresponding green house gas (GHG) production, and extended landfill life. The creation of compost is an excellent resource to enhance soil quality and for use in final landfill cover. Additional collection vehicles and associated processing machinery would be consuming additional fuel and creating GHGs. If the yard waste processing operation is on the Brady Road property, it needs to fall within the new Provincial landfill operating license that Solid Waste Services is applying for.

Other: The City does not have expertise and human resources to construct and operate a yard waste and organics processing facility. The construction, processing of yard waste and potential sale of compost could be contracted modeled along similar successful contracts that Solid Waste Services has undertaken to process recyclables. Such a contract would provide composting services on a fee per tonne basis for a period of time.

Complimentary waste reduction programs: the following programs are available to minimize garbage:

- Recycling is available to every residence within the City via curbside collection. Currently, there is an 85% participation rate in the program. Residents can set out unlimited amounts of recycling;
- Grass mulching, also called grass-cycling is great for lawns and reduces the need for fertilizers.

- Back yard composting: the Solid Waste Services has held a number of back yard composter sales in recent years, and it creates an excellent source of compost.

HISTORY

The existing Leaf-it-With-Us program was established in 1993.

In April 2009 the Leaf-it-With-Us program was expanded to include a six week long spring collection service, at the existing 10 drop off depots. In the fall of 2009 an additional two depots were added to the existing 10 drop off depots in the North West sector of the city.

In October 2009 Council approved an automated cart based collection program for garbage collection for the North West section of the city. This collection method limits the amount of garbage that can be set out by residents to 240 litres of volume per collection day. This amount is equivalent to about three normal sized garbage cans. City Council will consider conversion to automated cart collection as collection contracts expire and are renewed.

At the October 13, 2009 meeting, the Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works requested that the Winnipeg Public Service investigate options for a program on curb side pick up of leaves, yard waste, and organics for report back.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Project Name: **First Year of Program:** **2010**

Organics Collection

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014
Capital					
Capital Expenditures Required	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Less: Existing Budgeted Costs	-	-	-	-	-
Additional Capital Budget Required	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Funding Sources:					
Debt - Internal	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Debt - External	-	-	-	-	-
Grants (Enter Description Here)	-	-	-	-	-
Reserves, Equity, Surplus	-	-	-	-	-
Other - Enter Description Here	-	-	-	-	-
Total Funding	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Total Additional Capital Budget Required	$ -				
Total Additional Debt Required	$ -				
Current Expenditures/Revenues					
Direct Costs	$ 232,000	$ 232,000	$ 232,000	$ 232,000	$ 232,000
Less: Incremental Revenue/Recovery	-	-	-	-	-
Net Cost/(Benefit)	$ 232,000	$ 232,000	$ 232,000	$ 232,000	$ 232,000
Less: Existing Budget Amounts	232,000	232,000	232,000	232,000	232,000
Net Budget Adjustment Required	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -

Additional Comments:

"Original signed by L. Szkwarek, C.G.A."

Lucy Szkwarek, CGA

Acting Manager of Finance & Administration

CONSULTATION

In preparing this Report there was consultation with:
n/a

SUBMITTED BY

Department: Water and Waste
Division: Solid Waste Services
Prepared by: T. Sims/D. Drohomerski
Date: January 20, 2010
File No. 011-15-02-06-00

Appendix A

Table of select Canadian cities with organics collection programs.

City	Spring and/or Fall yard waste collection	Seasonal yard waste collection	Year-round kitchen waste collection
Kingston	Yes		Yes
Medicine Hat		Yes (subscription based)	
Ottawa		Yes	Yes
Saskatoon		Yes (subscription based)	
Toronto			Yes
Vancouver	Yes	Yes	

Note: all cities listed have automated cart collection