Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – February 15, 2012

REPORTS

Minute No. 154 Reduced Speeds in School Zones

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

The Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and recommends to Council:

1. That the City of Winnipeg submit a written request to the Province of Manitoba, to further pursue the matter of reduced speeds in school zones in Winnipeg.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

The Chairperson called Deputy Mayor Swandel to the Chair in order to move the following motion.

Moved by His Worship Mayor Katz,,

That the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service be concurred in and forwarded to Council.

Carried

The Chairperson resumed the Chair

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: **REDUCED SPEEDS IN SCHOOL ZONES IN WINNIPEG**

Critical Path: **Executive Policy Committee - Council**

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO
L. Escobar, P. Eng., PTOE Manager of Transportation	B.W. Sacher, P.Eng. Director of Public Works	n/a	D Joshi COO

RECOMMENDATIONS

That the City of Winnipeg submit a written request to the Province of Manitoba, to further pursue the matter of reduced speeds in school zones in Winnipeg.

REASON FOR THE REPORT

On September 28, 2011, Council concurred in the September 7, 2011 recommendation of the Executive Policy Committee and adopted the following:

1. That the Winnipeg Public Service consult with the Provincial Government, and the appropriate School Divisions in Winnipeg, and report back to Council with a plan of action on how to best implement reduced speeds in school zones in Winnipeg.
2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Letters received from both Manitoba Infrastructure and Transportation, and the Highway Traffic Board of the Province of Manitoba indicate that, if at this time, Council desires to implement reduced speeds in school zones in Winnipeg, a letter of request should be submitted to the Honourable Steve Ashton, Minister of Infrastructure and Transportation to further pursue the matter.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

There are currently no implications associated with the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service. If approval is granted in the future for the implementation of reduced speeds in school zones in Winnipeg, the financial impact would be assessed at that time in accordance with the scope of the provisions of the applicable legislation.

HISTORY

Prior to 1966, 15 mph (~25 km/h) school zone speed limits were in effect in Manitoba. Following a review of a Special Select Committee on Highway Safety, the Highway Traffic Act was amended in 1966 to remove the 15 mph school zone speed limits and replace them with provisions requiring that motorists drive at a reasonable and prudent speed when a child is present on or near a highway.

In 1982 and 1995, requests were made to the Minister of Highways and Transportation to reintroduce school zone speed limits. These requests were not supported.

Subsequent to Council's September 28, 2011 direction, the Winnipeg Public Service sent letters to Manitoba Infrastructure and Transportation and the Highway Traffic Board of the Province of Manitoba seeking advice as to the steps required to authorize a speed reduction in a school zone in Winnipeg.

Copies of the Winnipeg Public Service's letters and the responses received are provided in *Appendix "A" – Related Communications*.

Manitoba Infrastructure and Transportation's (MIT) response indicated that it has commissioned a study to look at options for enhancing school zone safety across Manitoba with steering committee representation from the City of Winnipeg, Manitoba School Boards Association and Manitoba Education, among others. Once the study has been concluded, MIT will review the study's outcomes and recommendations, and then determine the next steps. It is noted that an unsolicited letter of endorsement dated November 17, 2011 from Seven Oaks School Division was received and is included in *Appendix "A" – Related Communications*. School Divisions have not been contacted at this time pending the outcome of the discussion with the Province and in consideration of the school representation on the Province's study steering committee.

The letters received from both Manitoba Infrastructure and Transportation, and the Highway Traffic Board of the Province of Manitoba indicate that, if at this time, Council desires to implement reduced speeds in school zones in Winnipeg, a letter of request should be submitted to the Honourable Steve Ashton, Minister of Infrastructure and Transportation to further pursue the matter. It is noted that the City of Winnipeg does not have the authority to introduce school zone speed limits independently; they must first be enabled through amendments to the Highway Traffic Act.

In preparing this report, the Winnipeg Public Service consulted with several jurisdictions across Canada to identify the following aspects of their school zone speed limit programs:

- *School zone speed limit (km/h)*
- *Primary intent of having school zone speed limits*
- *Implementation criteria*
- *Guiding documentation*

A summary of the information received is provided in *Appendix "B" – Interprovincial Comparison*.

In general, the *Transportation Association of Canada (TAC) School and Playground Areas and Zones: Guidelines for Application and Implementation* appear to be a "benchmark" in terms of consistency and application as elements of the guidelines are present in most school zone policies across Canada. The TAC Guidelines were developed in 2006 with input from jurisdictions across Canada, including the City of Winnipeg.

It is important to note that the TAC Guidelines prescribe two levels of treatment for schools. The first level is a ***School Area*** treatment where the section of roadway adjacent to a school or playground is denoted by signs. The second level is a ***School Zone*** treatment, which is the *School Area* treatment plus a reduced speed limit.

The *TAC School and Playground Areas and Zones: Guidelines for Application and Implementation* consider the following criteria in the establishment of school areas and school zones:

- School Type
- Road Classification
- Fencing
- Property Line Separation
- School Entrance
- Sidewalks

A maximum point value is multiplied by a weighting factor for each criterion (e.g. an elementary school has a different weighting factor than a high school). A copy of the School Zone Input Worksheet and Results Matrix is attached in *Appendix "C" – TAC School Zone Input Worksheet and Results Matrix*.

Should the opportunity arise, the Winnipeg Public Service suggests that the *Transportation Association of Canada (TAC) School and Playground Areas and Zones: Guidelines for Application and Implementation* be considered in the development of the Provincial school zone speed limit policy.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement Date: January 26, 2012

Project Name:

REDUCED SPEEDS IN SCHOOL ZONES IN WINNIPEG

COMMENTS:

There is no financial impact associated with the recommendation of this report at this time. If approval is granted in the future for the implementation of reduced speeds in school zones in Winnipeg, the financial impact would be assessed at that time in accordance with the scope of the provisions of the applicable legislation.

"Original Signed by D. Stewart, CA"
Manager of Finance & Administration

CONSULTATION

In preparing this report there was consultation with:

Manitoba Infrastructure and Transportation
Highway Traffic Board of the Province of Manitoba
City of Vancouver, British Columbia – Engineering Services
Alberta Infrastructure and Transportation
City of Calgary, Alberta – Transportation Department, Roads – Traffic Division
City of Saskatoon, Saskatchewan – Infrastructure Services
City of Ottawa, Ontario
City of Hamilton, Ontario
Nova Scotia Department of Transportation and Infrastructure Renewal

SUBMITTED BY

Department: Public Works
Division: Transportation Division
Prepared by: Tanner Jangula, Traffic Analyst
Stephen Chapman, P. Eng., Traffic Management Engineer

Date: February 7, 2012
File No.: G-12

Attachment(s): Appendix "A" – Related Communications
Appendix "B" – Interprovincial Comparison
Appendix "C" – TAC School Zone Input Worksheet and Results Matrix

APPENDIX "A" – RELATED COMMUNICATIONS

Winnipeg

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT • SERVICE DES TRAVAUX PUBLICS

Director's Office • Bureau du directeur

FILE NO: G-12

November 15, 2011

Manitoba Infrastructure and Transportation
Engineering and Operations – Highway Engineering
16th Floor – 215 Garry Street
Winnipeg, Manitoba R3C 3P3

RE: REDUCED SPEEDS IN SCHOOL ZONES IN WINNIPEG

At its meeting on September 28, 2011, Winnipeg City Council adopted the following recommendation:

> *"That the Winnipeg Public Service consult with the Provincial Government, and the appropriate School Divisions in Winnipeg, and report back to Council with a plan of action on how to best implement reduced speeds in school zones in Winnipeg."*

Further to this Council recommendation, we request that Manitoba Infrastructure and Transportation please advise by letter, prior to December 15, 2011, as to the steps required to authorize a speed reduction in a school zone in Winnipeg.

Sincerely,

B.W. Sacher, P. Eng.
Director of Public Works

c: L. Escobar, Manager of Transportation
S. Chapman, Traffic Management Engineer

Embrace the Spirit • Vivez l'esprit

103 – 1155 Pacific Avenue • 1155, avenue Pacific, bureau 103 • Winnipeg • Manitoba • R3E 3P1
Fax/télec. (204) 986-7358 • www.winnipeg.ca

Winnipeg

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT • SERVICE DES TRAVAUX PUBLICS

Transportation Division • Division des transports

FILE NO: G-12

2011 10 21

The Highway Traffic Board
Asta Industrial Park
200-301 Weston Street
Winnipeg, Manitoba
R3E 3H4

RE: REDUCED SPEEDS IN SCHOOL ZONES IN WINNIPEG

At their meeting on September 28, 2011, Winnipeg City Council adopted the following recommendation:

"That the Winnipeg Public Service consult with the Provincial Government, and the appropriate School Divisions in Winnipeg, and report back to Council with a plan of action on how to best implement reduced speeds in school zones in Winnipeg."

Further to this Council recommendation, we request that the Highway Traffic Board please advice by letter prior to November 15, 2011 as to the steps required to authorize a reduced speed in a school zone in Winnipeg.

Sincerely,

Luis Escobar, P. Eng., P.T.O.E.
Manager of Transportation

cc: S. Chapman, Traffic Management Engineer

Manitoba

Infrastructure and Transportation
Transportation Policy Division
Motor Carrier Division

1520 - 215 Garry Street
Winnipeg MB R3C 3P3
CANADA

PHONE: (204) 945-1025
FAX: (204) 945-5539
Email: PolMCADM@gov.mb.ca

December 23, 2011

Mr. B.W. Sacher, P.Eng.
Director of Public Works
Public Works Department
City of Winnipeg
103-1155 Pacific Avenue
Winnipeg, MB R3E 3P1

Dear Mr. Sacher:

RE: Reduced Speeds in School Zones in Winnipeg

This is in response to your November 15, 2011 letter (please see attached copy) to Manitoba Infrastructure and Transportation (MIT) requesting written advice to your Department as to the steps required to authorize a speed reduction in a school zone within the City of Winnipeg (Winnipeg).

As you may be aware, MIT has commissioned a study to look at options for enhancing school zone safety across Manitoba. The study was awarded to MMM Group and is currently underway. A stakeholder consultation workshop was held on October 19, 2011 at the Greenwood Inn at which Winnipeg was represented.

The study has not yet been concluded. Consequently, I cannot speculate about its findings pertaining to maximum speeds in school zones. MIT will review the study's outcomes and recommendations, and then determine the next steps. In the interim, should Winnipeg wish to further pursue matters relating to speeds in school zones, I suggest submitting a written request from the Mayor to the Minister of Infrastructure and Transportation addressing this issue.

I hope you find this information helpful. Please call me should you have any further inquiries.

Manitoba

Infrastructure and Transportation
Highway Traffic Board
200 – 301 Weston Street, Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada R3E 3H4
T 204-945-8912 F 204-783-6529

Infrastructure et Transports
Conseil routier
301, rue Weston, pièce 200, Winnipeg (Manitoba) Canada R3E 3H4
Tél. 204 945-8912 Téléc. 204 783-6529

November 23, 2011

Our File 900-4

Mr. Luis Escobar, P. Eng., P.T.O.E.
Manager of Transportation
Public Works Department
City of Winnipeg
101 – 1155 Pacific Avenue
Winnipeg MB R3E 3P1

Dear Mr. Escobar:

RE: REDUCED SPEEDS IN SCHOOL ZONES
CITY OF WINNIPEG

Further to your of October 21, 2011 please be advised of the following.

A Special Select committee on Highway Safety (1965) was formed to study the law concerning school zones and its application to school patrols. The Committee recommended abolishment of the 15 mph (30 km/h) speed zones adjacent to schools. The Highway Traffic Act was amended and in 1966 the 15 mph (30 km/h) school zone speed was removed and replaced with the following section:

Reasonable and prudent speed

95(3) No person shall drive a vehicle on a highway at a speed greater than is reasonable and prudent or in a manner that is not reasonable and prudent under the conditions and having regard to the actual and potential hazards then existing; and, without restricting the generality of the foregoing, no person shall drive a vehicle on a highway at a speed otherwise permitted under this Act where

(a) the presence of a child on or near the highway, whether or not he is in close proximity to the grounds of a school building or a playground, dictates, in the interest of safety, a slower speed or the temporary stopping of a vehicle; or

(b) any factor exists in the face of which failure to reduce that speed, or to stop the vehicle temporarily, constitutes a danger to any person or property visible to the driver.

The removal of the reduced speed limit added more responsibility upon the motorists and upon school patrols with respect to school zones, playgrounds etc.

It was the Committees' belief that there was no real safety benefit to children in the 15 mph (30 km/h) speed limit. Child protection should be a duty of drivers wherever and whenever children are present anywhere in a street.

Collisions involving children, are not confined to locations adjacent to schools, but, as statistics show, are occurring everywhere. Speed may not be the fundamental cause of young pedestrian collisions. The inexperience of young pedestrians undoubtedly limits their ability to foresee and avoid risk, particularly while playing. Inattention may contribute to a driver's inability to respond appropriately, or a child running out from behind a parked vehicle may make it impossible for the driver to stop in time.

Law enforcement agencies advised that it was unlikely that the enforcement of a lower speed limit in the vicinity of schools could be undertaken with any greater degree of success now, then was the case in the early 1960's. Rather than attempting to modify driver behaviour by the use of a lower speed limit adjacent to schools, the government amended the Act to achieve enforceable pedestrian protection at all crosswalks (pedestrian corridors) and focused on pedestrian safety and driver awareness (public campaigns).

To enhance child safety, the following has been used and recommended over the years:

- fences have been and should be installed around schools
- sidewalks should, where possible, be put in along streets
- school crossing guards should be present
- marked crosswalks should be installed
- pedestrian corridors should be installed, where warranted
- school areas should be clearly marked as such with appropriate signs
- no passing in school zone signs should be erected

If it is the City of Winnipeg's recommendation to request reduced school zone speeds, a letter of request should be submitted to the Honourable Minister Steve Ashton, Minister of Manitoba Infrastructure and Transportation.

For your information, the Province of Manitoba was approached in 1995 to amend the Highway Traffic Act to reinstate the reduced school zone speed. The outcome of the request was that the Government was not prepared to amend the Act to introduce mandatory reduced speed zones around schools throughout the Province, including the City of Winnipeg.

If you require any additional information regarding this matter, do not hesitate to contact our office.

SEVEN OAKS SCHOOL DIVISION
community begins here

SEVEN OAKS SCHOOL DIVISION
830 Powers Street
Winnipeg, MB R2V 4E7
Ph. (204) 586-8061 Fax: (204) 589-2504

November 17, 2011

His Worship Mayor Sam Katz
City of Winnipeg
Council Building
510 Main Street
Winnipeg, MB. R3B 1B9

Dear Mr. Katz:

I write on behalf of the Board of Trustees of the Seven Oaks School Division. At its Regular Meeting of November 7, 2011 the Board passed the following motion:

> "That the Board write to Mayor Katz endorsing his plan to reintroduce School Speed Zones."

The Board supports your plan to reintroduce School Speed Zones and urges you to begin implementation as soon as possible. Your action on this issue will help prevent accidents, injury and even death. We would be pleased to support you in this important initiative.

Sincerely,

p.c.: City Councillors
Winnipeg School Divisions

APPENDIX "B" – INTERPROVINCIAL COMPARISON

JURISDICTION	Primary Intent	Implementation Criteria	Guiding Documentation	School Zone Speed Limit
Vancouver	• Reduce distance required for vehicles to come to a stop	• All local streets adjacent to Elementary and Secondary schools (Private Schools with school yards and/or large student count are considered) • Speeds are not reduced on arterial roads	• Manual of Uniform Traffic Control Devices of Canada (MUTCDC) • TAC School and Playground Areas and Zones: Guidelines for Application and Implementation	• 30 km/h
Alberta Manual **Guidelines for School and Playground Zones and Areas**	• Address unexpected or unintentional children entering onto the roadway at undefined crossing locations • Provide uniform guidelines towards the establishment of and the signing and marking of School and Playground Zones and Areas in both rural and urban environments	• School Type, Road Classification, School Ground Fencing Characteristics, Property Line Separation, Location of School Entrance, Location of Sidewalks	• Alberta Traffic Safety Act • Use of Highway and Rules of the Road Regulation • Manual of Uniform Traffic Control Devices for Canada	• 30 km/h • By bylaw can be as low as 20 km/h as per Traffic Safety Act
Calgary	• To enhance the safety of an area where there is a high concentration on young children	• Follow the Alberta School and Playground Zone warrants (Alberta Manual)	• Alberta Infrastructure and Transportation: GUIDELINES FOR SCHOOL AND PLAYGROUND ZONES AND AREAS	• 30 km/h
Saskatoon	• Enhance pedestrian safety *(In 2001, a Saskatoon elementary student was hit and killed on his way to school by a vehicle travelling at the legal speed limit. As a result of the debate surrounding this issue, Saskatoon City Council resolved to implement reduced speed zones for schools throughout the city)*	• Reduced speed zones be employed at each elementary and secondary school – no distinction made between public and private schools	• City of Saskatoon Policy C7-15 (outlined in implementation criteria)	• 30 km/h
Ottawa	• Used where there is a possibility of children entering the roadway	• School type, road classification, school ground fencing, property line separation, location of school entrance, location of sidewalks	• TAC School and Playground Areas and Zones: Guidelines for Application and Implementation	• 40 km/h
Hamilton	• Highlights the presence of a school and of school age children in the vicinity of a school	• Factors include presence or absence of sidewalks, volume and speed of vehicular traffic, number of students walking adjacent to the roadway, fencing of school property, difficulty of vehicular/school bus access to property (refer to guiding documentation) • Local street reduced speed limits are full time • Arterial street reduced speed limits are part time as indicated by flashing beacons	• Appendix A (PW09075) Policy for Setting Speed Limits in School Areas on City of Hamilton Roadways	• 40 km/h
Nova Scotia Provincial Legislation	• "*…speculate that the safety of children was the primary reason for introducing reduced speed limits in school areas*."	• Children are present on that portion of the highway or on land adjacent to that portion of the highway (includes the land within 30 metres of the centre of the travelled part of the highway) • Signs shall be erected on highways where school buildings or grounds are directly adjacent to the highway or where a school crosswalk needs to be installed in a speed zone higher than 50 km/h	• Nova Scotia Motor Vehicle Act • Nova Scotia Safer School Zones Act †	• > 50 km/h → 50 km/h • ≤ 50 km/h → 30 km/h †
Transportation Association of Canada (TAC) **School and Playground Areas and Zones: Guidelines for Application and Implementation**	• Can be considered where there is a possibility of children entering the roadway	• School Type, Road Classification, School Ground Fencing Characteristics, Property Line Separation, Location of School Entrance, Location of Sidewalks	• Developed with input from jurisdictions across Canada	--

† *pending as of 2011/11/18*

APPENDIX "C" – TAC SCHOOL ZONE INPUT WORKSHEET AND RESULTS MATRIX

Table 2.1 School Zone Input Worksheet

INSTALLATION CRITERION	MAXIMUM POINT VALUE (MPV)	DESCRIPTION		WEIGHTING FACTOR (WF)	SCORE (MPV * WF)
School Type	40	Elementary		1.0	
		Middle / Junior High		0.4	
		High School		0.2	
		Post Secondary / College / University		0.0	T =
Road Classification	20	Urban Land Use	Rural Land Use		
		Local		1.0	
		Minor Collector Collector	Local Collector	0.75 0.5	
		Major Collector / Minor Arterial	Arterial	0.25	
		Major Arterial / Expressway	Freeway	0.0	C =
Fencing	20	Fully Traversable		1.0	
		Partially Traversable		0.5	
		Non-Traversable		0.1	F =
Property Line Separation	10	Abuts Roadway		1.0	
		Within 50 metres		0.5	
		Further than 50 metres		0.0	L =
School Entrance	5	Main Entrance / Multiple Secondary Entrances		1.0	
		Secondary Entrance		0.6	
		None		0.0	E =
Sidewalks	5	None or Non-School Side		1.0	
		School Side		0.6	
		Both Sides		0.0	S =
TOTAL SCORE (sum of T,C,F,L,E and S)					

Table 2.2 School Zone Results Matrix

TOTAL SCORE	AREA OR ZONE?
0 – 40	Nothing
41 - 64	SCHOOL AREA
65 – 80	SCHOOL AREA or SCHOOL ZONE*
81 - 100	SCHOOL ZONE

*Local conditions must be considered in detail in order to determine the appropriate treatment. Wherever possible, mitigation measures should be explored that would reduce the score so that marginal school zones can be avoided. The reasons for the final decision should always be documented.

DRAFT