**Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – September 17, 2014**

**Minute No. 559**
**Report – Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works – September 9, 2014**

**Item No. 8 Policy on Snow Clearing and Ice Control Considerations for 2014 and 2015-2017**

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

The Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works and submitted the following to Council:

1. That reprioritization of sidewalks, as identified by the Public Works Department in consultation with Ward Councillors, for snow clearing on selected high pedestrian use routes within residential neighbourhoods, from P3 to P2 (Appendix B), be approved.

2. That Snow Removal Contracts be increased to a 4 year term with increased minimum equipment compliments and the East South Contract to be tendered as two separate contracts, which are part of adjustments to approximately 30 zones within the Know Your Zone program.

3. That the Public Service be directed to explore the logistics and any other implications related to the possible implementation of permitting odd side of the street parking on odd number days (Calendar) and even side of street parking on even number days (Calendar) on Hargrave Street, Hargrave Place and Carlton Street, south of Broadway.

4. That fines are raised for parking offences occurring during residential plowing operations from the current amount of $150, or $75 for early payment, to $300 with $150 for early payment (draft amending By-law attached as Appendix A).

5. That, subject to approval of Recommendations 1 – 4, above, additional funding of $672,000 in the 2014 Snow Clearing and Ice Control Budget to fund increased expenditures that may result during the balance of 2014 from the introduction of improvements identified in this report and that additional annual funding in the amount of $1,660,000 be included in the 2015- 2017 Operating Budgets to fund the improvements in future years, is approved.

6. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

**Report – Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works – September 9, 2014**

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Deputy Mayor Swandel,

That the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works be concurred in and forwarded to Council.

Carried

His Worship Mayor Katz and Councillor Browaty asked to be recorded as having voted against the above motion, in accordance with Rule 47(7) of The Procedure By-law No. 50/2007.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On September 9, 2014, the Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the matter to the Executive Policy Committee and Council.

Mark Cohoe, submitted a communication dated September 9, 2014, with respect to the Policy on Snow Clearing and Ice Control Considerations for 2014 and 2015-2017.

# ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

**Title:** Policy on Snow Clearing and Ice Control Considerations for 2014 and 2015-2017

**Critical Path:** Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works ➢Executive Policy Committee ➢ Council

## AUTHORIZATION

| Author | Department Head | CFO | CAO |
|---|---|---|---|
| J. Berezowsky | B.W. Sacher, P. Eng. | M. Ruta | M. Jack<br>A/CAO |

## RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That Council approve a reprioritization of sidewalks, as identified by the Public Works Department in consultation with Ward Councillors, for snow clearing on selected high pedestrian use routes within residential neighbourhoods, from P3 to P2(Appendix B).
2. Snow Removal Contracts to be increased to a 4 year term with increased minimum equipment compliments and the East South Contract to be tendered as two separate contracts, which are part of adjustments to approximately 30 zones within the Know Your Zone program.
3. That Council direct the Public Service to explore the logistics and any other implications related to the possible implementation of permitting odd side of the street parking on odd number days (Calendar) and even side of street parking on even number days (Calendar) on Hargrave Street, Hargrave Place and Carlton Street, south of Broadway.
4. That Council raise fines for parking offences occurring during residential plowing operations from the current amount of $150, or $75 for early payment, to $300 with $150 for early payment (draft amending By-law attached as Appendix A).
5. That, subject to approval of Recommendations 1 – 4, above, Council approve additional funding of $672,000 in the 2014 Snow Clearing and Ice Control Budget to fund increased expenditures that may result during the balance of 2014 from the introduction of improvements identified in this report and that additional annual funding in the amount of $1,660,000 be included in the 2015-2017 Operating Budgets to fund the improvements in future years.

## REASON FOR THE REPORT

The Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works recommended to Council:
1. That the Council Motion of January 29, 2014 be referred to the Winnipeg Public Service for a report back to Standing Committee.

On March 13, 2014, the Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works referred the following to the Winnipeg Public Service for consideration:

1. That the Public Works Department review the suggestions below for consideration prior to next year's snow season.

   **A. Zone G**

   **Problem:**
   Zone G is much too big. It doesn't get done in 12 hours. It's always the same side of the area that doesn't get done (Osborne Village east of Osborne). People who rely on on-street parking have to

park several kilometres from home. When these streets do get cleared, there's usually a windrow down the middle as a result of the parked cars.

**Suggestions for Consideration:**

- Reduce the size of Zone G, or have two alternating zones, similar to the way Zones B & D are set up in the West End.
- Putting up temporary no-parking signs along streets in high density areas where there is a history of lack of compliance during Know Your Zone operations (i.e., east Osborne Village).

### B. Sidewalk Priorities

**Problem:**

Sidewalks are cleared at the same priority as that of the adjacent street, meaning Fort Richmond sidewalks along Pembina where there is very little pedestrian traffic, will get higher treatment than Roslyn Road, where there is very high pedestrian traffic.

**Suggestions for Consideration:**

Re-evaluate the sidewalk priorities to ensure they are more fitting to the pedestrian traffic and need, rather than that of the adjacent street priority (i.e., where there is more pedestrian density).

### C. Contractor compliance

**Problem:**

I've occasionally received reports of contractor carelessness such as dumping large piles of snow on sidewalks or private property, often for several weeks before it is cleared.

**Suggestions for Consideration:**

Financial or other punitive measures, which can increase based on frequency of occurrences.

### D. Know-Your-Zone Communications

**Problem:**

Difficult to know which neighbourhoods have no on-street parking outside of your own area during Know Your Zone operations. This can be problematic for funerals, public events, or for people in various jobs such as home care workers who travel to several neighbourhoods per day.

**Suggestions for Consideration:**

- Online listings with a schedule about which neighbourhood will be cleared at what time (currently it is set up by zone letter, rather than by neighbourhood).
- Small printed Know Your Zone maps that can be mailed to residents who request them
- Permanent signage that identifies which zone a street is on.

**Problem:**

People who don't have access to the internet have greater difficulty finding out when their zone or other zones will be done.

**Suggestions for Consideration:**

An automated phone call option with listed zone schedules, similar to that of the email alerts, could help with this.

### E. PS3 Priority Street Communications

**Problem:**

Residents along PS3 priority streets don't have access to information about when their streets will be cleared. The clearing doesn't follow the Know Your Zone assigned letter schedule, and these

streets don't have the requirement for no parking during the night, like P2 streets. As a result parked vehicles line the streets during snow plowing operations, resulting in one side never getting plowed and a windrow in the middle of the street. Also, the highlighting around the assigned letter in the online look-up tool is misleading, giving residents the impression that they will be cleared at the same time as the surrounding Zone letter.

**Suggestions for Consideration:**

- Better communication to residents on PS3 streets to inform them of how and when their street clearing is done.
- Putting up temporary no-parking signs along PS3 streets before they are plowed.

## IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

Sidewalk Re-Prioritization:

Annual costs to improve the service levels from P3 to P2 for sidewalk clearing on selected residential streets is estimated to require a $60,000 increase to the 2014 Snow Removal and Ice Control Operating Budget and $150,000 subsequently to the 2015-2017 Annual Operating Budgets. If approved, the Public Service will consult with ward Councillors to confirm the selected sidewalks, prior to implementation.

Snow Contract Re-tendering:

New contracts are to be tendered on a 4 year duration (3 years plus a 1 year mutually agreed upon extension), which will continue to strengthen our commitment towards the industry providing this service. Heavy equipment comes at a great cost which the City of Winnipeg recognizes. By providing longer terms to the snow clearing contracts, the City firmly believes that industry will continue to provide competitive pricing.

During the annual review of the snow contracts, it was also determined that due to the amendments made in 2011 on the Winter Parking Bans, specifically on the Residential Parking Ban, that there was an immediate requirement to adjust the minimum equipment compliment on a number of the snow contracts. The Department considered two options:

Option 1 – Increasing the number of shifts within a contract area from 3 – 12 hour shifts to a maximum of 5 – 12 hour shifts

Option 2 – Increasing the minimum equipment requirement within each contract while maintaining the 3 – 12 hour shift schedule. Additionally, separating the single contract area in the East South into 2 more manageable contracts based on the industry capabilities.

Option 2 was determined to be the most effective based on reduced overall costs to the Snow Removal and Ice Control Program and the logistical impacts to adjusting approximately 30 zones and informing the public of these changes.

It is currently estimated that improvements in the snow contracts as a result of re-tendering will be an additional $600,000 cost to the 2014 Snow Removal and Ice Control Budget and $1,500,000 subsequently to the 2015-2017 Annual Operating Budgets.

Relocation of Garbage and Recycling Containers:

To date, this operation was carried out on an as required basis at an extra cost of $1.00 per container. On a go forward basis, it is estimated that an additional $10,000 will be required annually

to cover the costs of this additional work, based on 3 snowfall events per year, on average. The new contracts will formalize this process.

Downtown Parking:

If odd and even day parking were to be implemented in the winter months on Hargrave Street, Hargrave Place and Carlton Street, south of Broadway, it's estimated that one-time signing costs of $2,000 would be incurred. As well, appropriate amendments would be required to the applicable parking by-laws.

Snow Related Parking Fines:

If authorized by Council, fines for parking offences occurring during a residential parking ban would be increased from the current amount of $150, or $75 for early payment, to $300, with $150 for early payment.

## HISTORY

Sidewalk Re-Prioritization:

Historically, the City of Winnipeg's sidewalk network has received the adjacent street's priority designation for sidewalk clearing. The Council policy for Priority 2 sidewalk clearing is based on a 5cm accumulation of snow and 36 hour timeframe to achieve the completion of the service from the cessation of the snowfall. The Council policy for Priority 3 sidewalk clearing is based on an 8cm accumulation of snow and a five working day service timeframe. Along with the differences in timeframes for servicing, this service variance, as it relates to accumulations, results in Priority 2 networks being serviced roughly 40% more often than the residential sidewalk network.

Current practice is that snow route designations for the street network are reviewed annually but not typically in concert with the adjacent sidewalks. In 2005, school divisions did review bus drop off routes with the Public Service and recommended candidates for higher service, Priority 3 (P3S) streets for school bus pick up/drop off access points, but did not include the adjacent sidewalks in their proposal.

Over time, there have been increases in pedestrian traffic on the sidewalks on Priority 3 streets in areas of higher density development. The pedestrian traffic moving between high density locations and points such as bus routes, various area services and educational institutions appear to be most impacted by the current policy for Priority 3 snow clearing services. Examples of P3 streets where there are higher density locations adjacent to or nearby are sections of Roslyn Road, Niakwa Road, Kildonan Green and King Edward Street. It should be noted, however, that the majority of the snow clearing concerns raised in the last two winter seasons were related to access points around schools.

Snow Contract Tendering:

The Public Service is in the process of re-tendering snow removal contracts for the 2014-15 season. This process has provided the Public Works Department with the opportunity to rationalize some of the zones and associated boundaries, which will dictate the amount of inventory that needs to be serviced by individual contracts. The residential plow zones, as originally designed, have now been in place through two winters. Analysis of the effectiveness of the zones has highlighted the need for changes in some of them.

Relocation of Garbage and Recycling Containers:

The residential plow zones were designed in conjunction with the implementation of the new Garbage and Recycling program. The plow zones are setup to alternate around pickup operations. From time to time and for various reasons, the coordination of these operations has been disrupted. When this has occurred, the contractors, as well as City forces, have been required to use labourers to physically move the bins out of the way ahead of the clearing equipment and then replace them once plowing operations have been completed on that street. Addressing the occasional breaks in coordination in this way not only facilitates the continuous movement of the plowing operation but also reduces the risk of damage to containers.

Downtown Parking:

One of the issues experienced during the winter season is difficulties related to parking in the downtown during both the Annual Snow Route Parking ban and the Declared Snow Route Parking Ban and their impacts to residents during a residential plowing operation. As more and more residential properties are being developed, the demand for on-street parking is increasing. The streets in the Downtown are either P1s or P2s with the exception of Hargrave Street (Broadway – Assiniboine Avenue), Hargrave Place and Carlton Street (Broadway – Assiniboine Avenue), which are designated as P3s. When the Residential Parking Ban is put into effect, the extent of streets that have snow route designations means that there are limited options available for residents on Hargrave Street, Hargrave Place and Carlton Street to relocate their vehicles during plowing operations.

To provide options for addressing the parking complications for the residents south of Broadway on Hargrave Street, Hargrave Place and Carlton Street, and to facilitate effective clearing of these streets, the Public Service recommends that they be directed to explore the logistics and any other implications related to the possible implementation of permitting odd side of the street parking on odd number days (Calendar) and even side of street parking on even number days (Calendar). The timeframe when this would be in effect would be concurrent with the Annual Snow Route Parking Ban. That would allow these P3s to be plowed a half at a time.

Snow Related Parking Fines:

A review of other winter cities that provide similar service levels of plowing activities for residential streets has demonstrated that, in order for any ban to be effective, there must be noticeable financial consequences for non-compliance, including costs for towing if it occurs. On average, approximately 5,000 tickets are issued and 1,000 courtesy tows are completed during each residential parking ban and that number does not appear to be decreasing. The actual demand for courtesy tows far outweighs the available tow truck capacity available during each Residential Parking Ban. Operational costs to ticket and provide courtesy tows are approximately $125.00 during a Residential Parking Ban. It appears that the value of fines for winter parking ban infractions is not sufficiently high to discourage non-compliance.

As a first step in addressing the non-compliance issues related to the winter parking bans, the Public Service recommends that Council consider raising fines for parking offences occurring during residential plowing operations from the current amount of $150, or $75 for early payment, to $300 with $150 for early payment.

## FINANCIAL IMPACT

# Financial Impact Statement

**Date:** August 28, 2014

**Project Name:** **First Year of Program** **2014**

Policy on Snow Clearing and Ice Control Considerations for 2014 and 2015-2017

| | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Capital** | | | | | |
| Capital Expenditures Required | $ - | $ - | $ - | $ - | $ - |
| Less: Existing Budgeted Costs | - | - | - | - | - |
| Additional Capital Budget Required | $ - | $ - | $ - | $ - | $ - |
| **Funding Sources:** | | | | | |
| Debt - Internal | $ - | $ - | $ - | $ - | $ - |
| Debt - External | - | - | - | - | - |
| Grants (Enter Description Here) | - | - | - | - | - |
| Reserves, Equity, Surplus | - | - | - | - | - |
| Other - Enter Description Here | - | - | - | - | - |
| Total Funding | $ - | $ - | $ - | $ - | $ - |
| Total Additional Capital Budget Required | $ - | | | | |
| Total Additional Debt Required | $ - | | | | |
| **Current Expenditures/Revenues** | | | | | |
| Direct Costs | $ 672,000 | $ 1,660,000 | $ 1,660,000 | $ 1,660,000 | $ 1,660,000 |
| Less: Incremental Revenue/Recovery | - | - | - | - | - |
| Net Cost/(Benefit) | $ 672,000 | $ 1,660,000 | $ 1,660,000 | $ 1,660,000 | $ 1,660,000 |
| Less: Existing Budget Amounts | - | - | - | - | - |
| Net Budget Adjustment Required | $ 672,000 | $ 1,660,000 | $ 1,660,000 | $ 1,660,000 | $ 1,660,000 |

**Additional Comments:** The 2014 Direct Costs above include the additional operating costs for sidewalk re-prioritizaton, snow contract re-tendering and relocation of garbage and recycling bins for the snow clearing period of October to December 2014, as well as the one time downtown parking signing costs. The 2015 and future years costs include the cost impacts for the full year of the snow clearing improvements recommended in the report. The future years costs do not account for increase in streets/sidewalk inventory or inflationary costs increases which would be determined annually and included in the future budgets in accordance with the City's Strategic Infrastructure Reinvestment Policy. The financial impact related to the increase in snow related parking fines has not been determined and not included in the amounts above.

"Original signed by H. Schoenfeld CA"
H. Schoenfeld CA
Acting Manager of Finance & Administration

## CONSULTATION

**In preparing this report there was consultation with:**
Water and Waste Department
Winnipeg Parking Authority
Legal Services Department

## SUBMITTED BY

Department: Public Works
Division: Streets Maintenance
Prepared by: J. Berezowsky/B. Sacher
Date: *August 19, 2014*
File No.

Attachments:
Appendix A – Voluntary Payment of Fines By-law
Appendix B - Amendment to Snow Clearing and Ice Control

Appendix A

**THE CITY OF WINNIPEG**

**BY-LAW NO.**

A By-law of THE CITY OF WINNIPEG to amend the Voluntary Payment of Fines By-law

**THE CITY OF WINNIPEG**, in Council assembled, enacts as follows:

**Voluntary Payment of Fines By-law amended**

1. The Voluntary Payment of Fines By-law is amended by replacing

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| *Stand/stop/park in residential zone subject to parking ban (Residential Parking Ban)* | *150* | *75* |

with

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| *Stand/stop/park in residential zone subject to parking ban (Residential Parking Ban)* | *300* | *150* |

**DONE AND PASSED**, this day of , 2014.

_____
Mayor

_____
City Clerk

Approved as to content:

_____
Director of Public Works

Approved as to form:

_____
For Director of Legal Services/City Solicitor

Appendix B – Amendment to Snow Clearing and Ice Control

Winnipeg

**CITY OF WINNIPEG POLICY NO. XXX-XXX**

| **POLICY TITLE**<br>*Snow Clearing and Ice Control* | **ADOPTED BY**<br>*City Council* | **EFFECTIVE DATE**<br>*XXXXXXXX* |
|---|---|---|
| **ORIGIN / AUTHORITY**<br>*Standing Policy Committee on Infrastructure Renewal and Public Works* | **CITY POLICY NO** | **MOST RECENT CONSOLIDATION**<br>*XXX-XXX* |

**1. Purpose:**

That Council approve a reprioritization of sidewalks, as identified by the Public Works Department in consultation with Ward Councillors, for snow clearing on selected high pedestrian use routes within residential neighbourhoods, from P3 to P2.

**2. Amendment to [*Snow Clearing and Ice Control*] Policy**

Sidewalks on Priority III Streets (Near Senior Citizen Complexes).

1.1 Section C: Plowing Sidewalks, Clause C-4:

a) **Repeal the following(Current Policy Approved by Council, September 22, 1993);**

Sidewalk plowing routes on Priority III streets shall be established so as to identify a designated access route from each senior citizen complex to the most logical Priority I or II street.

Sidewalks on these access routes shall normally be maintained to a compacted snow surface. Generally, plowing shall commence when an inspection, following a 5 cm snowfall accumulation or equivalent local drifting conditions, indicates a necessity for a clearing operation.

The snow plowing operation shall be completed within thirty-six hours following the end of an average storm and shall normally be done in conjunction with the sidewalk on the connecting Priority I or II street.

For the purposes of this policy, senior citizen complexes shall be identified as a building that is devoted exclusively to senior citizens and has ten or more dwelling units.

**Replace with the Following;**

Section C: Plowing Sidewalks, Clause C-4

Sidewalks on Priority III Streets (Designated Routes).

Sidewalk plowing routes on Priority III streets shall be established so as to identify a designated access route where applicable to the most logical Priority I or II street.

Sidewalks on these access routes shall normally be maintained to a compacted snow surface. Generally, plowing shall commence when an inspection, following a 5 cm snowfall accumulation or equivalent local drifting conditions, indicates a necessity for a clearing operation.

The snow plowing operation shall be completed within thirty-six hours following the end of an average storm and shall normally be done in conjunction with the sidewalk on the connecting Priority I or II street.

For the purposes of this policy, designated routes will consist of the following;

Senior citizen complexes- shall be identified as a building that is devoted exclusively to senior citizens and has ten or more dwelling units.

High Volume Pedestrian Traffic Areas – schools, high density developments
APPENDIX B – Amendment to Snow Clearing and Ice Control

## 3. Responsibilities

### 3.1 Public Works and City Councillors:

a) In consultation with Ward Councillors, Public Works will prepare a list of designated route sidewalks for servicing under Claus C-4.
b) This assessment will be completed by September of each year.