Agenda - Council – December 10, 2014

Report - Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management – November 27, 2013

Item No. 2 List of Historical Resources – 200 Berry Street, (St. James Fire Hall No. 1)

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On December 3, 2014, the Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management and submits the following to Council:

1. That 200 Berry Street not be placed on the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Report - Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management – November 27, 2013

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On December 3, 2014, the Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management and submitted the matter to Council.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On November 27, 2014, the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service, did not concur in the recommendation of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee, and submitted the matter to the Executive Policy Committee and Council.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: Addition to the Commemorative List – 200 Berry Street, (St. James Fire Hall No.1)

Critical Path: Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management – EPC – Council

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO
J. Kiernan	B. Thorgrimson	N/A	D. Joshi A/CAO

RECOMMENDATIONS

That City Council concur with the Public Service's recommendation to place 200 Berry Street on the Commemorative List under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014.

.

REASON FOR THE REPORT

Pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 8(4), this building, which was on the Inventory of Buildings under the former Historical Buildings By-law 1474/77, was deemed to be nominated as a resource to be added to the List of Historical Resources on June 1, 2014, the date that the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 came into force.

Pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 17, the Director of Planning, Property and Development is authorized to provide a report with respect to the nomination for consideration by the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage, and Riverbank Management (SPC on DDHRM) at the time it considers the recommendation of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC).

The HBRC reviewed this resource on May 16, 2013 and made the recommendation to add it to the List of Historical Resources because of its architectural and historical significance and because of the heritage value it embodies.

However, because several, far-better examples of historical fire halls are already on the List of Historical Resources, the Public Service recommends this building be placed on the Commemorative List instead, for heritage recognition only.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

- Council has the following options for recognizing the heritage significance of these fire halls:

  1) Add the building to the List of Historical Resources, entailing:
     - A Historic Property Notice will be filed against the title of each building with the Winnipeg Land Titles Office as per City of Winnipeg Charter section 157.1(1) in order to notify the owner(s) and potential purchasers that the property is identified on the List of Historical Resources, and as such is subject to regulation under the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.

- All alterations to the outlined Character-Defining Elements will require approval under a Heritage Permit as per the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- The building will not be permitted to be demolished without the approval of Council.
- The building will be eligible for grants under the Province of Manitoba's "Designated Heritage Buildings Grant" Program, and will be viewed favourably by other granting agencies if ever privately owned.
- In the event that the structure is declared surplus by the City, which it has been, a municipal heritage designation would not encumber a potential sale, although the designation would stand unless Council took steps to remove it.

2) Direct the Director of PP&D to place the building on the Commemorative List, which entails no controls, obligations or cost to owners and would appear on the City's website with basic information and a photo for information only;

3) Remove the building from the Nominated List, with no historical recognition, if deemed to not possess adequate heritage merit.

HISTORY

As buildings owned by the City of Winnipeg, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) evaluated this fire hall on May 16, 2013 as part of a larger inventory review. Due to similarities arising from the use of a standardized plan, this building was deemed to have merit attributed to being:

- illustrative of key civic services required for Winnipeg's growing residential districts pre-World War I;
- representative of fire halls of the era, featuring utilitarian, modestly ornamented designs with elements of the Richardsonian Romanesque style;
- associated to A.R. and W.N. Melville, respected and important early Winnipeg architects noted for developing standardized fire hall plans;
- located at prominent neighbourhood intersections, contributing to the historic streetscape of the area.

Therefore, based on architectural and historical significance, this fire hall received a recommendation to be placed on the List of Historical Resources by the HBRC. With this status, suitable exterior and interior alterations would be permitted.

However, due to the large degree of similarity with six other fire halls already possessing heritage designations, the Public Service recommends that this building not be placed on the List of Historical Resources, but instead be placed on the Commemorative List under the Historic Resources By-law 55/2014.

To date, the City of Winnipeg has been diligent in conserving fire halls of this vintage. The six that are currently on the List of Historical Resources include:

- former Fire Hall No. 3, 56 Maple Street (Firefighter's Museum), former Grade II
- former Fire Hall No. 8, 325 Talbot Ave. (converted to a church), former Grade III
- former Fire Hall No.11, 180 Sinclair (Buddhist Temple), former Grade III
- former Fire Hall No. 12, 1055 Dorchester (converted to condos), former Grade III
- former St. Boniface Fire Hall, 212 Rue Dumoulin (under redevelopment), former Grade II
- former St. Vital Fire Hall, 598 St. Mary's Road (current St. Vital Museum), former Grade III

Of these, none are active fire halls, nor are 524 Osborne and 1466 William (refer to Appendix F for current use). These buildings constitute an excellent sample of Winnipeg fire halls built between 1904 and 1914, including a mix of Class A and B structures (see Appendices D & E). Almost all display exemplary architecture with many interior and exterior elements intact. Five of the six were designed by the Melville brothers; the other, the St. Boniface fire hall, was designed by Victor Horwood, also a prominent local architect, and shares the vocabulary of the standardized plan. All are conspicuous within

their neighbourhood, and many remain in public use. As municipal heritage structures all are subject to design review for alterations, cannot be demolished, and are eligible for heritage grants.

Additionally, five fire halls were placed on the former Inventory of Buildings (current Nominated List) in the late 1970s to await evaluation. Of these, one was removed and demolished in 2011, (former Fire Hall No. 5, 354 Sherbrook, later an Auto glass outlet). Three are currently being considered for heritage designation - 845 Sargent, 524 Osborne and 1466 William. This fire hall at 200 Berry Street had been declared surplus by the City in 2013 and sold to a private owner.

Therefore, of the17 fire halls built in the Winnipeg area between 1904 and 1914, 11 were identified and evaluated for heritage significance. The six not considered include three demolished before 1960, one converted to a private residence, one converted to apartments, and one which remains an active fire hall (349 Burrows.)

***See Appendix A for a History of the Fire Hall being considered in this report*
****See Appendix B & C for a History of the Fire Halls currently on the List of Historical Resources*
****See Appendix D for a list of Winnipeg Fire Halls constructed between 1904 and1915*

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement **Date:** October 14, 2014

Project Name:

Addition to the Commemorative List, 200 Berry Street (St. James Fire Hall No. 1)

COMMENTS:

There are no financial implications associated with the recommendations in this report.

"Original Signed By"
Mike McGinn, CA
Manager of Finance

CONSULTATION

In preparing this report there was consultation with:

City of Winnipeg Historical Buildings and Resources Committee

SUBMITTED BY

Department:	Planning, Property and Development
Division:	Planning and Land Use
Prepared by:	Rina Ricci
Date:	October 14, 2014
File No.:	O:\Reports Directive\Planning and Land Use\Heritage\2014\Addition to the Commemorative List, 200 Berry.doc

UD2014-135

Appendix A

200 Berry Street, Fire Hall No. 1 – Nominated to be Listed as a Historical Resource



With its tall tower, brick façade and important community role, the St. James Fire Hall has been a conspicuous part of the landscape for nearly 100 years.

Built of clay brick, the front (east) façade includes three large equipment doors at the north end and a small personnel entrance at the south. The second floor includes numerous arched windows with stone lug sills. Two areas of corbelled brick separated by brick panels complete the front elevation. The crenellated tower was originally used to hang dry the hoses and features only a few thin openings. The other three façades continue the basic design of the front.

The facility was built without heavy ornamentation in an effort to not only save money and upkeep but to help the large building fit in with its surrounding residential neighbours.

The building appears to be in good structural condition and stands on its original site. The doorways and entrances of the first floor have been changed, causing the bricking in of some spaces and the opening of others. Some of the original brick arches are still visible.

This fire hall had been serving the people of the City of St. James (as Fire Hall No. 1) and then west Winnipeg (as Fire Hall No. 11) for nearly 100 years. In 2013, it was declared surplus by the City in 2013 and sold to a private owner.

Appendix B

212 Rue Dumoulin, Fire Hall No. 1 – Listed as a Historical Resource



The distinctively-designed St. Boniface Fire Hall No. 1 emerged from an era of horsepower and steam to provide more than 60 years of protective service to its Franco-Manitoban municipality.

This 1907 structure, located immediately behind the Hotel de Ville (1906), replaced an older, outmoded fire hall during a period of significant growth in St. Boniface, including construction of major hospital, church and college facilities. Initial plans were drawn by Cecil Goddard, St. Boniface's town engineer. His structure subsequently was incorporated into a design by Victor William Horwood.

Horwood, an Englishman, arrived in Manitoba in 1904 after studies in Eastern Canada and the United States. He became provincial architect in 1911 and, as such, was involved in the design of several public buildings and in the controversy over construction of the Legislative Building in 1913-14. In private practice, he undertook projects in Ontario and Saskatchewan as well as Manitoba. The Hotel de Ville and this fire hall were among his early works.

Plans for the fire station complemented Horwood's city hall design, and, concurrently, departed from the standard Melville design then being applied to fire halls in neighbouring Winnipeg. Developed by architects-engineers William N. and Alexander R. Melville, this model was first tried in 1899 then used for more than 10 other stations between 1903 and 1914. It featured a 2½-storey, single-tower building, usually on a corner site, with a stone foundation, supporting masonry shell, and concrete basement and main floors. The ground level contained the truck room attached to a stable. Firemen's quarters were on the second floor; the third level was used for storage or remained unfinished.

Horwood, like the Melvilles, emphasized function, practicality and convenience. However, his 2½-storey structure with attached two-storey stable has distinctive exterior and interior elements. Predominant among these are his crenellated bell and larger hose-drying towers which flank a central gable on the front (north) facing. Combined with the building's stark Romanesque style, the towers are reminiscent of a medieval fortress.

The station stands on a stone foundation and has large brick supporting posts. Relatively flat buff-brick walls, broken only by rough-cut limestone at the base of the hose-drying tower and by a stone band, sills, lintels and keystones, rise to a corrugated metal roof resting on a metal cornice. The flat roof of the stable contrasts with the gabled roof of the main hall. Round and flat-headed windows provide irregular fenestration on all elevations except the façade. Doors appear at the base of each tower; three large arches around swinging doors originally provided access to the main hall but since have been altered to rectangular openings with motorized doors.

Inside are concrete floors on the basement and ground levels. The main floor has fire resistant metallic ceilings, pressed-tin wall cladding, and tongue-and-groove wainscoting. Spiral metal staircases lead to the basement and upper storeys.

The main floor held the equipment with the stable and a workshop to the rear. At the sound of an alarm, the horses would move into their traces to be quickly harnessed and driven out of the building. Municipal offices were on the second floor and an open dormitory was on the third. In emergencies, firefighters could slide down a pole to the equipment room. Up to 1919, the men were on 24-hour duty and lived at the hall. Introduction of platoon shift systems provided shorter work weeks and the opportunity to live off-site.

The transition to motorized equipment occurred in the inter-war period. The station continued in active service until 1969 with some design modifications. Two exterior staircases and dormers were installed. Basement stone-work recently was repointed and lighting improved to provide workshop space.

The St. Boniface Museum now occupies much of the station, including a display area with fire trucks, photographs and other artefacts. Offices and a senior citizens' drop-in center also are in the building.

Appendix C

56 Maple Street, Fire Hall No. 3 - Listed as a Historical Resource



Some two decades after its reorganization as a full-time, professional body, the Winnipeg Fire Department undertook a major upgrading of its facilities to accommodate the city's expanding needs and changes in fire-fighting technology.

The 1904 program included construction of five stations, the most costly and decorative of which was Firehall No. 3 (later redesignated as Firehall No. 2) on the west side of Maple Street between Higgins and Henry avenues. This facility was near the Main Street business district, the houses and industrial buildings of Point Douglas, and the Canadian Pacific Railway Station.

It was the first enlarged and adorned version of a design prepared by Alexander R. and William N. Melville as an economical, efficient, and adaptable model for Winnipeg's fire stations. As such, the building at 56 Maple was intended to symbolize the extent of the City's commitment to fire protection. The structure also replaced one of three stations built soon after City Council decided in 1882 to transform its volunteer fire brigade into a permanent force. These early halls had been much criticized for unsanitary stable conditions and lack of interior amenities for live-in firemen.

The Melvilles' plan eventually was used for 14 of the City's fire stations. The brothers' firm, which functioned from c.1904 to c.1913, also designed several apartment blocks, theatres, and the Coliseum dance hall. Little is known about William Melville who was practicing as an architect in Winnipeg by 1903 but was no longer on the scene by 1915. The Scottish-born Alexander obtained architectural and civil engineering degrees in Aberdeen before joining his brother in Winnipeg. Alexander remained in private practice until the late 1940s and was a draughtsman for the provincial government prior to his death in 1949.

The two-storey Maple Street firehall is primarily a utilitarian structure, although both Classical and Romanesque elements adorn its facades. Built for $22,000 by general contractors J.B. Flinders and Hugh Hudson, the station has a stone foundation, solid brick walls, stone accents, and a hip roof with gable ends and large, heavy eaves. The front (east) facing also features rusticated stone up to the second-storey windows. The roof is a plain version of the original which had cresting and two small pedimented gable dormers at the front.

Along the ground level of the main façade are four equipment doors and an ordinary entrance set in round-headed stone arches with raised keystones. An oriel window appears on the second storey with a smooth-cut stone base, rough stone lug sill, and single panes of leaded and beveled glass in its three openings. Above, the gable end contains a Palladian window with a continuous rough stone sill, radiating brick heads, and a keystone over its middle opening. Other windows along the second floor are rectangular with ornamental glass, stone sills, and lintels. Openings on the all-brick side and rear walls are similarly designed except that they have radiating brick heads.

The 27.4-metre, hose-drying tower is on the building's north side, its original castellation having been replaced with a plain top. By recessing the central portions of the tower's walls, the Melvilles created the illusion of giant order pilasters running up the corners of this element. Within these central areas the architects placed windows of varying styles, sizes, and finishes.

At the rear of the station is a one-storey extension that housed the stable and hayloft. This area originally had three entrances at grade and three into the loft, but now only the central doors to each level are present.

Much of the building's interior remains intact, attesting to its adaptability as the era of horse-drawn equipment gave way to motorized vehicles, high-pressure pumps and hoses, and other advanced fire-fighting technology, and as live-in firefighters were replaced in 1919 by a platoon system that allowed the men to work shifts and reside off-site.

The ground level, with its tin ceiling, cement floors and walls, initially held wagons and pumpers in the main hall and stalls for up to 12 horses at the rear. The stable subsequently was converted to washroom, kitchen, and storage facilities, while a portion of its ceiling was raised to accommodate aerial ladders and other large equipment. Round-headed doorways between the stable and front area also have been altered or enclosed.

The second floor originally had bedrooms, sitting rooms, and washrooms running off a central hallway. Some of the bedrooms remain, while others have been converted into office and storage space. Four strategically located poles are still used to carry firefighters to their equipment on the main floor when the alarm sounds. The attic, once a locker room and gymnasium, now provides storage space.

This station functioned for many years as the department's North End headquarters. It has a distinguished record. Two of its men were killed and four others injured during one of the city's worst pre-World War I fires – a 1912 blaze set by an arsonist at the Radford-Wright sash and door factory on Main north of Higgins. This hall also garnered a reputation as the "chief factory" since three of its alumni went on to serve as heads of the fire department.

The Maple Street building has been replaced by a new station on Watt Street near Nairn Avenue. The building now functions as a firefighters' museum

Appendix D
Winnipeg & Suburban Fire Halls Built Between 1904 and 1914

ORIGINAL NAME	ADDRESS	YEAR BUILT	CLASS	PRESENT STATUS
No. 4	470 Gertrude Avenue	1904	B	Demolished ca.1959
No. 5	354 Sherbrook Street	1904	B	Demolished 2011
No. 6	66 Pearl Street	1904	B	Demolished
No. 7	349 Burrows Street	1904	B	Active Fire Hall (No. 6)
No. 3	56 Maple Street	1904	A	Firefighters' Historical Society of Winnipeg Museum
St. Boniface	212 rue Dumoulin	1904	-	St. Boniface Fire Hall Museum/Redevelopment
No. 8 (Elmwood)	325 Talbot Street	1906	B	Church
No. 9 (Weston)	1466 William Avenue	1909	B	Day care facility & Firefighters' Historical Society of Winnipeg workshop
No. 10	845 Sargent Avenue	1910	B	Active Fire Hall (No. 5)
No. 11	180 Sinclair Street	1910	B	Buddhist Temple
No. 12	1055 Dorchester Avenue	1911	A	Condos
No. 13	410 Cathedral Avenue	1911	A	Apartments
Transcona	Victoria Avenue West	1912	-	Demolished ca.1955
No. 14	161 Lipton Street	1913	A	Private residence
No. 15	524 Osborne Street	1913	A	City of Winnipeg Fire Department offices
St. James No. 1	200 Berry Street	1913	-	Declared Surplus 2013, Private Ownership
St. Vital	598 St. Mary's Road	1914	A	City of Winnipeg Ambulance Station & St. Vital Museum