Minutes – Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management – April 10, 2015

REPORTS

Item No. 1 Application for 272 Main Street to be removed from the List of Historical Resources under the terms of the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

The Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management further laid over the matter for up to 180 days.

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Councillor Orlikow,

That the matter be further laid over for up to 180 days.

Carried

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On April 21, 2015, Mark Buleziuk submitted a communication requesting that the matter be further laid over.

On September 8, 2014, the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management laid over the matter for up to 180 days.

On July 17, 2014, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management that the application for removal from the List of Historical Resources, for the building located at 272 Main Street, be denied.

On June 19, 2014, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee laid over the matter to its meeting on July 17, 2014.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: Application for 272 Main Street to be Removed from the List of Historical Resources under the terms of the Historical Resources By-law No.55/2014

Critical Path: Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management, EPC, Council

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO
J. Kiernan	B. Thorgrimson	N/A	M. Jack A/CAO

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That Council approve the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to not remove the Scott Block at 272 Main Street from the List of Historical Resources.

REASON FOR THE REPORT

The Public Service has received an application from the building owner to remove the Scott Block at 272 Main Street from the List of Historical Resources under the terms of the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.

Pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 section 27(2), the Director of Planning, Property and Development is authorized to provide a report with respect to the application for consideration by the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management at the time it considers the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee.

As per the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 section 21, the owner is entitled to appear before the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management to express their support or opposition to the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee. Alternatively, the owner can advise the City Clerk in writing of his or her opposition to the recommendations of the Historic Buildings and Resources Committee prior to this meeting.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

- The building will remain on the List of Historical Resources and will continue to:
  - Have a Historic Property Notice filed against the title of the building with the Winnipeg Land Titles Office as per City of Winnipeg Charter section 157.1(1) in order to notify the owner(s) and potential purchasers that the property is identified on the List of Historical Resources, and as such is subject to the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
  - Require approval under a Heritage Permit for all alterations to the outlined Character-Defining Elements as per the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
  - Not be eligible for demolition without the approval of City Council.
  - Be eligible for the City of Winnipeg's Heritage Conservation Tax Credit Program.
  - Be eligible for grants under the Province of Manitoba's "Designated Heritage Buildings Grant" Program, and will be viewed favourably by other granting agencies.

HISTORY

In 2011, the current building owner had restored key elements of the building by his own initiative and applied to have the building listed as an Historical Resource. The Historical Buildings and Resources Committee evaluated the building on September 15, 2011. Based on its age, architectural and historical significance, including the building's pedigree as a pre-1920s retail structure on Main Street and connections to prominent Manitoban, Thomas Scott, the building received a recommendation to be listed as an Historical Resource.

The structure was listed as an Historical Resource on October 4, 2012 with the following *Character-Defining Elements*:

Exterior:

- The east facing structure with main façade fronting Main Street
- Irregular plan with window wells on the 2nd - 5th floors on the north and south façades
- The primary (east) façade featuring roughly dressed red (Port Wayne) sandstone, regularly placed square headed window openings on the second to fourth floors, and square headed and arched window openings on the fifth floor
- Recessed main (east) storefront entrance with metal columns flanking the doorway
- Details throughout including regularly placed arched windows with roughly dressed limestone sills, loading bay on the rear (west) façade, etc.

As a part of its designation, suitable exterior alterations and modifications are permitted upon design review and the issuance of a Heritage Permit from Heritage Planning. There are no restrictions regarding interior alterations for this building.

As a part of the rehabilitation process, the building owner engaged the services of a structural engineer to design a concrete topping to level or even the floors of the building. The work for the topping was carried out by a contractor, but the work has failed to satisfy the recommendations of the engineer. Due to this issue brought about by the construction work done to-date, the building now requires additional structural remediation prior to occupancy.

The owner has expressed that the delays caused by the remediation work and associated issues have created a financial burden, and he has elected to sell the building. However, it is his feeling that the building will be easier to sell if it does not carry a heritage designation. He has submitted an application to remove the building from the List of Historical Resources.

After reviewing two engineering reports that were provided by the owner, on July 17, 2014, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee made the recommendation to decline the request to delist the building citing that the structural deficiencies as outlined in the engineering reports compromise neither the heritage value nor the Character-Defining Elements of the building. The reports also confirm that the structural deficiencies can be remediated, and therefore, the building as a whole can be conserved.

The Historical Buildings and Resources Committee has made the recommendation to decline the application to remove the building from the List of Historical Resources.

***See Appendix A for a History of this building.*

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement Date: August 22, 2014

Project Name:

Application for 272 Main Street to be Removed from the List of Historical Resources

COMMENTS:

That Council approve the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to not remove the Scott Block at 272 Main Street from the List of Historical Resources.

There are no financial implications associated with this recommendation.

"Original Signed By"

Mike McGinn, CA
Manager of Finance

CONSULTATION

In preparing this report there was consultation with:

City of Winnipeg Historical Buildings and Resources Committee
City of Winnipeg Development and Inspections Division
City of Winnipeg Urban Planning, Downtown

SUBMITTED BY

Department:	Planning, Property and Development
Division:	Planning and Land Use
Prepared by:	Rina Ricci
Date:	August 22, 2014
File No.:	O:\Reports Directive\Planning and Land Use\Heritage\2014 Reports\Application to Remove 272 Main from List of Historical Resources.doc

2014-107

Appendix A
272 Main Street – Former Scott Block





The Scott Block represents the type of investment made by a successful, local company in the early stages of the 20th century. Buoyed with optimism for development in Winnipeg and Western Canada, many entrepreneurs moved to expand by financing and constructing larger, more modern facilities.

Constructed in 1904 to designs by architect James H. Cadham, the building was the home of the Scott Furniture Company. Founded in 1874 by Lieutenant-Colonel Thomas Scott, the building was one of the tallest structures on Main Street upon opening, and boasted being "the largest exclusively furniture house in Canada." Born in Ontario, Scott was a prominent military figure who came to the Red River Settlement in 1871 as a commander in the Fenian Raids. Settling in Manitoba, he began his furniture company following his retirement from the militia. Scott is also notable for his various political roles including School Trustee (1875-77); Councillor in Winnipeg's first City Council (1875); Mayor in 1876, returned by acclamation in 1877; M.L.A. (1878/79); M.P. (1880-87), followed by an appointment as Collector of Customs in Winnipeg until 1910. Scott died in Winnipeg in 1915, after which time his son, Fred W. Scott, assumed control of the company.

June 13, 1905 marked the beginning of a series of unusual trials for the building when lightning caused a fire that completely destroyed the back half of the structure and its contents. The north wall crumbled, destroying the building next door – the furniture company's former home. Although the company quickly rebuilt, another major fire occurred on March 23, 1914, again completely destroying the building's side and rear walls. This time reconstruction was headed by well-known local firm Pratt and Ross, due to Cadham's passing. The 1915 plans required a new concrete frame for stability, but mimic the original design minus the top storey, and with window wells added to the north and south walls starting at the second floor.

Subsequently, the Scott Furniture Company occupied much less space in the building, leasing out the upper floors. Tenants varied, including the Canadian Northern Railway Company, dentists, lumber dealers, insurance agents, oil companies, etc. By the 1930s the building was sold to the Canada National Fire Insurance Company.

Today, the building is a mix of changed and unchanged areas. Categorized as Romanesque Revival, the façade has remained consistent despite the fires and reconstructions, heavy in appearance with low-profile ornamentation, rough surfaces and arched windows. The ground floor features large storefront windows framing a central recessed entrance, topped by a modest cornice. The upper storeys are

finished in cut red (Port Wayne) sandstone, with a galvanized iron cornice, frieze and stone parapet. The west (rear), south and north façades are of solid clay brick.

The façade was obscured for a period beginning in the 1960s in an effort to modernize the building when the ground floor was clad in smooth cut Tyndall stone, and the upper floors with vertical metal louvers. The Ikon Company logo appeared on the north elevation, and the rebranded building became a downtown landmark in its own right. In 2011, under new ownership, the cladding was removed, re-exposing the 1915 sandstone façade unknown to generations of Winnipeggers.

The interior has been upgraded as tenants came and went. Remaining original spaces include the main staircase, basement partitioning, washrooms (marble stalls, etc.) and some light fixtures and pressed tin ceilings throughout. Today the building is one of only two pre-1920 structures that remains standing on Main Street between Graham and St. Mary Avenues.