Agenda – Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management – September 21, 2015

REPORTS

Item No. 4 Addition to the List of Historical Resources - 188 Princess Street, Carnefac Block

WINNIPEG PUBLIC SERVICE RECOMMENDATION:

1. That the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add the Carefac Block, the resource located at 188 Princess Street, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 with the following Character-Defining Elements:

    a) Exterior:

        i. Two-storey brick and stone building with a flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Princess Street, its main façade facing east onto Princess Street, its north façade partially hidden by the neighbouring building, its south façade facing a back lane and its rear façade facing west and partially hidden by the neighbouring building;

        ii. Front (east) façade with its windows in arched openings with stone lug sills and radiating brick heads on the second floor and a band of ornamental brickwork leading to the plain brick parapet; and

        iii. The south façade with its windows in arched openings with stone lug sills and radiating brick heads on both floors and the continuation of the roofline ornamentation at its east end.

    b) Interior:

        i. Original elevator; and

        ii. Heavy timber mill structural system

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On June 18, 2015, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management that Carnefac Block, 188 Princess Street, be added to the List of Historical Resources, with the following character defining elements:

Exterior:

- Two-storey brick and stone building with a flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Princess Street, its main façade facing east onto Princess Street, its north façade partially hidden by the neighbouring building, its south façade facing a back lane and its rear façade facing west and partially hidden by the neighbouring building;

- Front (east) façade with its windows in arched openings with stone lug sills and radiating brick heads on the second floor and a band of ornamental brickwork leading to the plain brick parapet; and

- The south façade with its windows in arched openings with stone lug sills and radiating brick heads on both floors and the continuation of the roofline ornamentation at its east end

Interior:

- Original elevator; and

- Heavy timber mill structural system

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: Addition to the List of Historical Resources - 188 Princess Street, Carnefac Block

Critical Path: Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO/COO
J. Kiernan	M. Pittet	n/a	M. Jack COO

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add the Carefac Block, the resource located at 188 Princess Street, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 with the following Character-Defining Elements:

a) Exterior:

   i. Two-storey brick and stone building with a flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Princess Street, its main façade facing east onto Princess Street, its north façade partially hidden by the neighbouring building, its south façade facing a back lane and its rear façade facing west and partially hidden by the neighbouring building;

   ii. Front (east) façade with its windows in arched openings with stone lug sills and radiating brick heads on the second floor and a band of ornamental brickwork leading to the plain brick parapet; and

   iii. The south façade with its windows in arched openings with stone lug sills and radiating brick heads on both floors and the continuation of the roofline ornamentation at its east end.

b) Interior:

   i. Original elevator; and

   ii. Heavy timber mill structural system

REASON FOR THE REPORT

This building was on the Inventory of Buildings under the former Historical Buildings By-law 1474/77, and pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 8(4), it was deemed nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources on the date that the new Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 came into effect.

Subject to this nomination, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) reviewed this resource on June 18, 2015 and and recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management (SPC DDHRM) that the Carefac Block, 188 Princess Street, be added to the List of Historical Resources because of its outstanding architectural and historical significance and the heritage value it embodies.

Pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 17, the SPC on DDHRM must consider the recommendations from the HBRC within 90 days after receiving the recommendation. The Director is authorized to provide a report with respect to the nomination for consideration by the SPC on DDHRM at the time it considers the recommendations of the HBRC.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Public Service and the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommend that this building be added to the List of Historical Resources because of its outstanding historical and architectural significance in the heritage value it embodies.

The owner of the building is supportive of the recommendation.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

188 Princess Street, Carnefac Block, will be added to the List of Historical Resources:

- A Historic Property Notice (caveat) will be filed against the title of the building with the Winnipeg Land Titles Office as per City of Winnipeg Charter Section 157.1(3) in order to notify the owner(s) and potential purchasers that the property is identified on the List of Historical Resources, and as such is subject to the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- Any alterations to the Character-Defining Elements (above) will require approval under a Heritage Permit as per the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- The resource will not be able to be demolished without the approval of City Council.
- The resource will be eligible for applicable heritage grants issued under the Province of Manitoba and the City of Winnipeg, and will be viewed favourably by other granting agencies.

HISTORY

As a part of the nomination process, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) toured the resource on May 7, 2015 in order to identify the proposed Character-Defining Elements of the resource that should be protected.

The owner of the building is supportive of the Listing (*see Appendix B for owner's submission*). The building is currently occupied.

The building is deemed to embody heritage values attributed to the following:

1. Its construction in 1901 makes it an early building in Winnipeg's warehouse district and illustrative of the type of development occurring in the area in the early 20th century;
2. Its long association with the Douglas family and their successful firm, Carnefac Stock Food Company;
3. Its architect, J.H.G. Russell, was a well-known and prolific designer in the early 20th century in Winnipeg;
4. Its design, materials and construction method are all good examples for the period;
5. It is located within the Exchange District National Historic Site on one of the district's premier thoroughfares; and
6. Some of its original exterior features have remained intact.

The Public Service is taking action to conserve architecturally and historically significant buildings within the Exchange District National Historic Site (EDNHS). Out of over 130 buildings that are nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources, 32 of these are within the EDNHS boundary.

**See Appendix A for a History of 188 Princess Street, Carnefac Block*

**See Appendix C for a listing of buildings within the EDNHS that have been nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014*

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement Date: July 2, 2015

Project Name:

Addition to the List of Historical Resources, 188 Princess Street

COMMENTS:

That the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage, and Riverbank Management concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add the Carnefac Block at 188 Princess Street to the List of Historical Resources.

There are no financial implications associated with this recommendation.

"Original Signed By"
Mike McGinn, CA
Manager of Finance

CONSULTATION

In preparing this report there was consultation with:

City of Winnipeg Historical Buildings and Resources Committee

OURWINNIPEG POLICY ALIGNMENT

The recommendation to add 188 Princess Street to the List of Historical Resources aligns with policies under OurWinnipeg Section 02 A Sustainable City, 02-3 Heritage:

Winnipeg has a rich and complex history. Our heritage resources are inseparably tied to our culture, identity, cultural perspective, collective consciousness and sense of place. In Winnipeg, heritage resources support and represented by a distinct mix of cultures, ideas and values. This facet of our identity provides us with variety in neighbourhood design and architecture, expresses various social values, and provides an invaluable legacy of resources that are distinctly our own.

The conservation and reuse of existing buildings can also align with numerous sustainability objectives such as waste minimization, natural resource protection and compact urban form.

Direction 2: Conserve, protect and celebrate the significant heritage resources that illustrate the broad range of Winnipeg's heritage values by:

- *Recognizing the importance of a broad range of tangible heritage resources throughout the city that illustrate a unique sense of place and community pride.*
- *Identifying, designating, and protecting the City's most significant heritage resources.*

Direction 4: Conserve downtown's rich legacy of heritage resources that provide significant and sustainable development opportunities.

Direction 5: Enhance the viability of the Exchange District National Historic Site.

Direction 6: Plan for the sustainable development of healthy neighbourhoods based on their particular historic identity and character by:

- *Encouraging the sustainable reuse of existing building stock and historic infrastructure.*

SUBMITTED BY

Department:	Planning, Property and Development
Division:	Planning and Land Use
Prepared by:	Rina Ricci
Date:	July 9, 2015
File No.:	O:\Reports Directive\Planning and Land Use\Heritage\2015\Addition to the List of Historical Resources, 188 Princess.doc

Appendix A
Carnefac Block, 188 Princess Street



This two-storey brick building, modest when compared to the massive brick and stone warehouses found elsewhere in Winnipeg's warehouse district, has nevertheless been an important part of the neighbourhood since its construction in 1901.

The block was built by Ontario-born William Griggs Douglas (1863-1936) to house his animal feed business, the Carnefac Stock Food Company, and included warehouse space, a showroom and a retail store.

The original front (east) façade was very different than the present elevation – the original ground floor included an arched doorway at the south end and four large display windows, two on either side of the main entrance to the Carnefac Stock Food Company store. Below each of the display windows was a panel of what appears to have been wood cladding. A modest corbelled brick band above the display windows divided the first and second floors. The original upper floor has not been significantly altered and included six windows set in plain wooden frames with radiating brick heads and rough-cut stone lug sills. The southernmost bay protruded slightly on the second floor. A pilaster finished the wall on the north end. Above the windows was a band of ornamental brick that led to a plain brick parapet. Significant changes in 1961 and 1980 have redesigned the main floor to its present layout.

The ground floor of the north wall is covered by the one-storey retail store next door and the second storey is unadorned. The present south façade dates to 1980 alterations when two arched entrances and an access ramp were added and all window openings were bricked in. The rear (west) façade of the building is partially covered by a one-storey warehouse; the open wall surface features only one window, now bricked in.

Like the exterior, the interior of this block has seen extensive renovation. Originally, the front (east end) of the ground floor was occupied as a retail store, with offices, a walk-in vault, washrooms and a public counter with much of the ceiling clad in ornamental tin. It is likely that the rear of the ground floor was used as storage and for loading/unloading goods. The second floor office space was accessed from stairs in the southeast corner of the building or by an elevator (still in use). The structure includes oversized wood columns and beams and heavy timber flooring throughout – providing a greater level of support than would normally be the case in a structure of this scale.

In 1961, the east end was reorganized into a mix of public space with counters and private offices, all accessed from the south end entrance. In 1980, the building was purchased and converted into a social club. The basement was divided into offices, washrooms and recreation rooms, the ground floor featured washrooms and serving facilities at the south end and an open seating area in the north. The upper floor was divided into kitchen/bar space (west side), washrooms and cloak rooms along the south wall and open seating in the remainder of the space. Little of the interior has changed since this last renovation.

John Hamilton Gordon Russell (1862-1946) is the architect for this building. Russell came to Winnipeg in the early 1890s after several years of work in the United States and by 1895 had a private practice. His career would span many decades and he was responsible for the design of many of the city's finest commercial, residential, institutional and religious structures. Local contractors D.D. Wood (masonry) and G.A. Mitchell (carpentry) built the structure.

W.G. Douglas, along with brothers Robert A. and Thomas J. Douglas, formed the Carnefac Stock Feed Company which operated out of this building until 1920s. W.G. Douglas was also a City Councillor and chaired the Police Commission, the Board of Health and was Controller of City Works and Bridges. Carnefac Stock Food Company owned the building until 1942, when it was sold to Samuel Koff, manager of the Fort Rouge Jobbing Company. Tenants during this period included Johns-Manville, asbestos shingles and insulation (1929) and Dominion General, jobbers and Northwest Mail Order (1939). By the late 1940s, the building was owned and occupied by Dairy

Supplies Limited, who sold it in the 1980s to the Winnipeg Police Athletic Association, converting it into a social hall. Today, the building is used by a congregation as a church and drop-in centre.

Appendix B
Owner's Written Submission to the HBRC

Winnipeg

Planning, Property & Development Department • Service de l'urbanisme, des biens et de l'aménagement

Planning and Land Use Division • Division de l'urbanisme et de l'usage des sols

In reply please refer to / Référence à rappeler :

Rina Ricci
Tel. : 204-986-4722
Fax / Téléc. : 204-986-3045
email: rricci@winnipeg.ca

PROPOSED CHARACTER-DEFINING ELEMENTS

for Listing as a Historical Resource of: **Carnefac Block, 188 PRINCESS ST**

Exterior:

- Two-storey brick and stone building with a flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Princess Street, its main façade facing east onto Princess Street, its north façade partially hidden by the neighbouring building, its south façade facing a back lane and its rear façade facing west and partially hidden by the neighbouring building;
- Front (east) façade with its windows in arched openings with stone lug sills and radiating brick heads on the second floor and a band of ornamental brickwork leading to the plain brick parapet; and
- The south façade with its windows in arched openings with stone lug sills and radiating brick heads on both floors and the continuation of the roofline ornamentation at its east end.

Interior:

- Original elevator; and
- Heavy timber mill structural system.

The above recommendations were made by the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee on MAY 14, 2015.

Suggested Changes (use reverse if required):

Approved

(Owner or Owner's Representative)

June 9/2015

Date

Embrace the Spirit • Vivez l'esprit

Winnipeg

Planning, Property & Development Department • Service de l'urbanisme, des biens et de l'aménagement

Planning and Land Use Division • Division de l'urbanisme et de l'usage des sols

In reply please refer to / Référence à rappeler :

Rina Ricci
Tel. : 204-986-4722
Fax / Téléc. : 204-986-3045
email: rricci@winnipeg.ca

WRITTEN SUBMISSION

Concerning the Nomination to be added to the List of Historical Resources

Building Name and Address: **Carnefac Block, 188 PRINCESS ST**

Building Owner (please print): Norbert Bargen

Building Owner (signed): [signature]

Date: June 9/2015

Evaluation Date: **Thursday, June 18, 2015 at 3:00pm**

Please mark appropriate line with an (X):

X I prefer that the building cited above be added to the List of Historical Resources

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the Commemorative List

_____ I prefer that the building cited above have no heritage status

Comments (continue on reverse if necessary):

Appendix C
Buildings within the EDHNS that have been nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014

	Name	Address	Date of Construction	Status
1	Albert Street Burger	58 Albert Street	1921	
2	Former Reliable Service Station	98 Albert Street	1901	
3	Anne (Blue Ribbon) Building	88 Arthur Street	1901	Listed
4	Former Ryan Bros. Building	110 James Avenue	1910	
5	Former De Laval Co. Warehouse	128 James Avenue	1912	Listed
6	Burrows, Stewart & Milne Company Warehouse	130 James Avenue	1910	
7	Former Richards & Brown Warehouse	132 James Avenue	1911	
8	Carruthers Building	124 King Street	1916	
9	Former Crane & Ordway Building	93 Lombard Avenue	1906	
10	Former Great West Life Annex (Bailey's)	185 Lombard Avenue	1900	
11	Wheat Pool Building	423 Main Street	1928	Listed
12	Duffin Block	474 Main Street	1881	
13	Former Ashdown's Store Annex	480 Main Street	1951	
14	Former Leckie Building	216 McDermot Avenue	1900	
15	Silvester & Willson Building	222 McDermot Avenue	1904	
16	Former A. MacDonald Co. Warehouse	133 Market Avenue	1910	
17	Former Steele Briggs Building	139 Market Avenue	1912	
18	Former Stanley Brock Building	145 Market Avenue	1916	
19	Christie Building	245 Notre Dame Avenue	1906	
20	Former Del Block Annex	54 Princess Street	1905	
21	Former Winnipeg Hydro Showroom	55 Princess Street	1919	
22	Former Del Block	62 Princess Street	1904	
23	Former Bole Drug Co. Building	70 Princess Street	1903	
24	Deer & Almond Restaurant	85 Princess Street	1959	
25	Former Kilgour-Rimer Building	87 Princess Street	1901	
26	Former G.F. Galt Block	103 Princess Street	1887	
27	Carnefac Building	188 Princess Street	1901	
28	Former Toronto Hide & Wool Co. Building	200 Princess Street	1893	
29	Maw Block	280 William Avenue	1907	
30	Former Winnipeg Saddlery Block	284 William Avenue	1903	
31	Soudack Building	288 William Avenue	1947	
32	Former Tees & Persse Warehouse	315 William Avenue	1905	