**Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – January 20, 2016**

**Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 12, 2016**

**Item No. 12 Additions to the List of Historical Resources, Winnipeg Hotel (214 Main Street) and the MacDonald Block (226 Main Street) (Fort Rouge-East Fort Garry Ward)**

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

The Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development and submitted the following to Council:

1. That the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommendation to add the Winnipeg Hotel, 214 Main Street, and the MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel), 226 Main Street, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014, be concurred in with the following Character-Defining Elements:

    A. Winnipeg Hotel, 214 Main Street

        i. Exterior:
            a. Three-storey brick and stone building with flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Main Street south of St. Mary Avenue, its main façades facing east onto Main Street, its south façade facing a large building, its north façade facing a vacant lot/parking lot and its rear (west) façade facing a back lane;
            b. The front (east) façade with its centrally located, raised main entrance topped by a large arched window, second storey windows in arched openings with stone lug sills, pilasters with stone capitals at either end and a stone belt course, third storey windows in rectilinear openings with stone lug sills, the central opening framed by paired attached columns leading to bracketing for the pediment at roof level and a roofline highlighted by an ornate metal entablature with bracketing, floral embellishments and the words “THE WINNIPEG”;
            c. The common clay brick walls with windows in rectilinear and arched openings and stone and wood sills of the south and north façades; and
            d. The rear (west) façade with its rusticated stone base, common clay brick wall with windows and doors in arched openings with stone lug sills.

ii. Interior:
   a. Third floor leaded glass.

B. MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel), 226 Main Street

i. Exterior:
   a. Three-storey brick building with flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Main Street south of St. Mary Avenue, its main façade facing east onto Main Street, its south façade facing a vacant lot, its north façade hidden by the neighbouring building and its rear (west) façade facing a back lane;
   b. Its main (east) façade with its upper storeys clad in polychromatic brick, divided into two bays by a centrally-place brick pilaster, a second brick pilasters at the south end and windows in thin round-headed openings under larger segmental brick arches (some with patterned brickwork) on the second floor and windows in pointed headed openings with layered brick arches on the top floor, a metal fire escape along the south end and an ornate metal cornice at the roofline; and
   c. Its uninterrupted common clay brick south façade.

ii. Interior:
   a. Ornamental tin clad light well.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

**Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – January 20, 2016**

**Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 12, 2016**

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Councillor Orlikow,

That the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development be concurred in and forwarded to Council.

Carried

Councillor Browaty asked to be recorded as having voted against the above motion, in accordance with Rule 47(7) of The Procedure By-law No. 50/2007.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On January 12, 2016, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the matter to the Executive Policy Committee and Council.

Jay Lev, President, Stride Development Corporation, submitted a communication dated January 7, 2016, in opposition to the matter.

Cindy Tugwell, Executive Director, Heritage Winnipeg, submitted a communication dated January 7, 2016, in support of the matter.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On July 16, 2015, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management that the Winnipeg Hotel, 214 Main Street, be added to the List of Historical Resources, pursuant to section 8(4) of the Historical By-law 55/2014, with the following character defining elements:

Exterior:

- Three-storey brick and stone building with flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Main Street south of St. Mary Avenue, its main façades facing east onto Main Street, its south façade facing a large building, its north façade facing a vacant lot/parking lot and its rear (west) façade facing a back lane;

**Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 12, 2016**

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION (continued):

- The front (east) façade with its centrally located, raised main entrance topped by a large arched window, second storey windows in arched openings with stone lug sills, pilasters with stone capitals at either end and a stone belt course, third storey windows in rectilinear openings with stone lug sills, the central opening framed by paired attached columns leading to bracketing for the pediment at roof level and a roofline highlighted by an ornate metal entablature with bracketing, floral embellishments and the words "THE WINNIPEG";

- The common clay brick walls with windows in rectilinear and arched openings and stone and wood sills of the south and north façades; and

- The rear (west) façade with its rusticated stone base, common clay brick wall with windows and doors in arched openings with stone lug sills.

Interior:

- Third floor leaded glass.

George Wayne Towns, owner of the Winnipeg Hotel, 214 Main Street, made a written submission dated July 9, 2015, stating his preference that the building have no heritage status.

On July 16, 2015, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management that MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel), 226 Main Street, be added to the List of Historical Resources, pursuant to section 8(4) of the Historical By-law 55/2014, with the following character defining elements:

Exterior:

- Three-storey brick building with flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Main Street south of St. Mary Avenue, its main façade facing east onto Main Street, its south façade facing a vacant lot, its north façade hidden by the neighbouring building and its rear (west) façade facing a back lane.

**Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 12, 2016**

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION (continued):

- Its main (east) façade with its upper storeys clad in polychromatic brick, divided into two bays by a centrally-place brick pilaster, a second brick pilasters at the south end and windows in thin round-headed openings under larger segmental brick arches (some with patterned brickwork) on the second floor and windows in pointed headed openings with layered brick arches on the top floor, a metal fire escape along the south end and an ornate metal cornice at the roofline; and

- Its uninterrupted common clay brick south façade.

Interior:

- Ornamental tin clad light well.

George Wayne Towns, owner of the MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel), 226 Main Street, made a written submission dated July 9, 2015, stating his preference that the building have no heritage status.

# ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

**Title:** Additions to the List of Historical Resources, Winnipeg Hotel, 214 Main Street, and the MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel), 226 Main Street

**Critical Path:** Standing Policy Committee on Property & Development, Heritage, and Downtown Development – EPC - Council

## AUTHORIZATION

| Author | Department Head | CFO | CAO/COO |
|---|---|---|---|
| K. McKim | J. Kiernan | n/a | M. Jack<br>COO |

## RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That Council concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add the Winnipeg Hotel, 214 Main Street, and the MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel), 226 Main Street, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 with the following Character-Defining Elements:

   A. Winnipeg Hotel, 214 Main Street

      i) Exterior

         a. Three-storey brick and stone building with flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Main Street south of St. Mary Avenue, its main façades facing east onto Main Street, its south façade facing a large building, its north façade facing a vacant lot/parking lot and its rear (west) façade facing a back lane;

         b. The front (east) façade with its centrally located, raised main entrance topped by a large arched window, second storey windows in arched openings with stone lug sills, pilasters with stone capitals at either end and a stone belt course, third storey windows in rectilinear openings with stone lug sills, the central opening framed by paired attached columns leading to bracketing for the pediment at roof level and a roofline highlighted by an ornate metal entablature with bracketing, floral embellishments and the words "THE WINNIPEG";

         c. The common clay brick walls with windows in rectilinear and arched openings and stone and wood sills of the south and north façades; and

         d. The rear (west) façade with its rusticated stone base, common clay brick wall with windows and doors in arched openings with stone lug sills.

      ii) Interior:

         a. Third floor leaded glass.

   B. MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel), 226 Main Street

      i) Exterior

         a. Three-storey brick building with flat roof located mid-block on the west side of Main Street south of St. Mary Avenue, its main façade facing east onto Main Street, its south façade facing a vacant lot, its north façade hidden by the neighbouring building and its rear (west) façade facing a back lane;

b. Its main (east) façade with its upper storeys clad in polychromatic brick, divided into two bays by a centrally-place brick pilaster, a second brick pilasters at the south end and windows in thin round-headed openings under larger segmental brick arches (some with patterned brickwork) on the second floor and windows in pointed headed openings with layered brick arches on the top floor, a metal fire escape along the south end and an ornate metal cornice at the roofline; and

c. Its uninterrupted common clay brick south façade.

ii) Interior:

a. Ornamental tin clad light well.

2) That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to effect the intent of the foregoing.

## REASON FOR THE REPORT

The buildings at 214 & 226 Main Street were on the Inventory of Buildings under the former Historical Buildings By-law 1474/77, and pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 8(4), they were deemed Nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources on the date that the new Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 came into effect.

Subject to these nominations, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) reviewed these resources and, on July 16, 2015, recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Property & Development, Heritage, and Downtown Development (SPC on PDHDD) that they both be added to the List of Historical Resources because of their outstanding architectural and historical significance and the heritage values that they embody.

Pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 17, subject to requests for postponements by the owner, the SPD on PDHDD must consider the recommendations from the HBRC within 90 days after receiving the recommendations. The Director is authorized to provide a report with respect to the nomination for consideration by the SPC on PDHDD at the time it considers the recommendations of the HBRC.

As per section 27(3), the SPC on PDHDD must consider whether the resource continues to embody heritage values sufficient to justify its continued inclusion on the List, and if applicable, the hazard posed by the resource and may, in addition, consider the economic viability of conserving the resource using the following criteria from section 18(2):

a. The condition of the resource;

b. The costs of the continued repair and maintenance of the resource;

c. The importance and value derived from the conservation or continued conservation of the resource;

d. The efforts that have been made by the owner to date to conserve the resource; and

e. The merits of alternative proposals for the resource or the site on which it is located, other than conserving the resource by adding it to the List.

As per section 20(1), the determinations of the SPC on PDHDD concerning a nomination are recommendations to Council that must be considered by Council within 60 days of the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations were made.

As per section 20(3), after considering the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee and the SPC on PDHDD together with the recommendations made by the Executive Policy Committee, Council may add or decline to add the buildings to the List of Historical Resources.

As per section 21(1 & 2), the determinations of the SPC on PDHDD are deemed to be final decisions that are not to be considered by Council and may not be appealed if:

a) They are identical to the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee; and
b) The owner does not formally oppose the recommendations

The owner is deemed not to oppose the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee if her or she neither:

a) Appears in person or by agent at the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations are considered to advise of his or her opposition; nor
b) Advises the City Clerk in writing of his or her opposition to the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee prior to the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations are considered.

The owner of the buildings is opposed to the HBRC's recommendation to add the buildings to the List of Historical Resources. The owner has provided a written submission to the Department stating that he prefers that the buildings have no heritage status (see Appendix C).

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommends that the buildings at 214 and 226 Main Street be added to the List of Historical Resources with the protected Character-Defining Elements as noted because of the buildings' outstanding historical and architectural significance in the heritage value that they embody.

The owner of the buildings is not supportive of the HBRC's recommendation and does not want the buildings added to the List of Historical Resources. The owner has provided a written submission to the Department stating that he prefers that the buildings have no heritage status (see Appendix C).

As nominated buildings under the Historical Resources By-law, these buildings are protected from demolition. A developer has recently expressed interest to the Department to purchase, demolish, and redevelop these properties, as well as the adjacent vacant lot at 220 Main Street, and the property at 232 Main Street (Fortune Block). The redevelopment would include the demolition of all three buildings. Neither plans nor permit applications concerning this proposed redevelopment have been reviewed by the Department because the buildings are currently nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources and are protected from demolition.

## IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

Winnipeg Hotel, 214 Main Street, and the MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel), 226 Main Street will be added to the List of Historical Resources:

- A Historic Property Notice (caveat) will be filed against the titles of each building with the Winnipeg Land Titles Office of the Property Registry as per City of Winnipeg Charter Section 157.1(3) in order to notify the owner(s) and potential purchasers that the properties are identified on the List of Historical Resources, and as such are subject to the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- Any alterations to the Character-Defining Elements will require approval under a Heritage Permit as per the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- The resources will not be able to be demolished.
- The resources will be eligible for applicable heritage grants issued under the Province of Manitoba and the City of Winnipeg, and will be viewed favourably by other heritage granting agencies.

## HISTORY

As a part of the nomination process, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) toured these two buildings on June 4, 2015 in order to identify the proposed Character-Defining Elements of the resources that should be protected.

The building at 214 Main Street is currently fully occupied with a drinking establishment on the main floor and residential units on the upper two floors. The building at 226 Main Street is unoccupied on the main floor and occupied on the upper two floors with residential units.

Both buildings are owned by the same owner. The owner is not supportive of adding either of them to the List of Historical Resources.

The building at 214 Main Street, Winnipeg Hotel, is deemed to embody heritage values attributed to the following:

1. construction on the building began in 1873, which makes the building an extremely rare example of a pre-1880 structure in Winnipeg;
2. the building stands as one of Winnipeg's and Western Canada's oldest continuously operated hotels;
3. since 1901, it has had additions and alterations by some of the city's renowned architects;
4. the building is an early example of a brick veneer structure;
5. the building is an integral part of a rare, pre-1890 half-block streetscape on South Main Street; and
6. the design features of the upper storeys of the main façade have not been severely altered since construction in 1895.

The building at 226 Main Street, MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel), is deemed to embody heritage values attributed to the following:

1. the building was constructed in 1883, which makes it an extremely rare example of an early 1880s structure in Winnipeg;
2. Alexander Macdonald (1844-1928), well-known and successful wholesale grocer, developed the property;
3. the architects responsible for the design of the building are likely Wilmott and Stewart - the architects responsible for the Fortune Block (232 Main Street) built in 1882 immediately to the north;
4. the building is an early example of a solid brick structure designed in the High Victorian Italianate style;
5. the building is an integral part of a rare, pre-1890 half-block streetscape on South Main Street; and
6. the design features of the upper storeys of the main façade have not been severely altered.

On July 16, 2015, the HBRC recommended to the SPC on PDHDD that these buildings be added to the List of Historical Resources because they embody heritage values of widespread importance to both the city and the downtown community and because of their outstanding architectural and historical significance.

Since the meeting of the HBRC in which the recommendations were made to add these buildings to the List of Historical Resources, a developer has expressed interest to the Department to purchase and redevelop these two properties as well as the vacant lot at 220 Main Street and the building at 232 Main Street, Fortune Block (refer to Appendix D for a historical image & plate 3, Appendix E for a recent image). The redevelopment would include the demolition of all three buildings. Neither plans nor permit

applications concerning this proposed redevelopment have been reviewed by the Department because the buildings are currently protected from demolition under the Historical Resources By-law.

The Public Service is taking action to conserve pre-WWI buildings that contribute to important commercial streetscapes that are within the Downtown Boundary both inside and outside of the Exchange District National Historic Site (EDNHS). Some examples of these historic streetscapes, which are illustrative of downtown development outside of the EDNHS and that include buildings that are nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources, are as follows (see Appendix E):

- West side of Main Street, south of St. Mary Avenue
- West side of Main Street, north of Alexander Avenue
- South side of Notre Dame, between Portage Avenue and Garry Street

There are currently 117 buildings that are nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources. Of these, 35 are Pre-WWI Commercial Buildings, outside of the EDNHS and within the Downtown Boundary (see Appendix F).

**See Appendix A for a History of 214 Main Street, Winnipeg Hotel*

**See Appendix B for a History of 226 Main Street, MacDonald Block*

## FINANCIAL IMPACT

## Financial Impact Statement **Date:** November 18, 2015

## Project Name:

### Addition to the List of Historical Resources, 214 & 226 Main Street

**COMMENTS:**

That Council concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add the Winnipeg Hotel at 214 Main Street and the MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel) at 226 Main Street to the List of Historical Resources.

There are no financial implications associated with this recommendation.

*"Original Signed By"*
Mike McGinn, CA
Manager of Finance

## CONSULTATION

**In preparing this report there was consultation with:**
City of Winnipeg Historical Buildings and Resources Committee

## OURWINNIPEG POLICY ALIGNMENT

The recommendation to add 214 & 226 Main Street to the List of Historical Resources aligns with policies under OurWinnipeg Section 02 A Sustainable City, 02-3 Heritage:

*Winnipeg has a rich and complex history. Our heritage resources are inseparably tied to our culture, identity, cultural perspective, collective consciousness and sense of place. In Winnipeg, heritage resources support and represented by a distinct mix of cultures, ideas and values. This facet of our identity provides us with variety in neighbourhood design and architecture, expresses various social values, and provides an invaluable legacy of resources that are distinctly our own.*

*The conservation and reuse of existing buildings can also align with numerous sustainability objectives such as waste minimization, natural resource protection and compact urban form.*

*Direction 2: Conserve, protect and celebrate the significant heritage resources that illustrate the broad range of Winnipeg's heritage values by:*

- *Recognize the importance of a broad range of tangible heritage resources throughout the city that illustrate a unique sense of place and community pride.*
- *Identify, designate, and protect the City's most significant heritage resources.*

*Direction 3: Provide leadership in heritage conservation that links to broader civic goals of economic development, sustainability and neighbourhood planning.*

- *Strive to link heritage conservation to sustainable development initiatives, including economic, environmental and social initiatives.*
- *Work with other governments, community groups, and building owners to conserve heritage resources.*

*Direction 4: Conserve downtown's rich legacy of heritage resources that provide significant and sustainable development opportunities.*

- *Work with downtown community stakeholders to identify and support key projects and heritage conservation initiatives that encourage and support downtown living, and facilitate strategic economic and cultural initiatives.*

*Direction 6: Plan for the sustainable development of healthy neighbourhoods based on their particular historic identity and character by:*

- *Work with community stakeholders to identify unique identities and neighbourhood legacy elements.*
- *Encourage the sustainable reuse of existing building stock and historic infrastructure.*

## SUBMITTED BY

Department: Planning, Property and Development
Division: Planning and Land Use
Prepared by: Rina Ricci
Date: December 1, 2015
File No.: O:\Reports Directive\Planning and Land Use\Heritage\2015\Additions to the List of Historical Resources, 214 & 226 Main.doc

**Appendix A**
Winnipeg Hotel, 214 Main Street



The Winnipeg Hotel stands at the southern end of Main Street, one of the City's oldest continuously operated hotels.

The Winnipeg Hotel occupies a site on the west side of Main between York and St. Mary Avenues acquired in 1872 from the Hudson's Bay Company (HBC) by Charles Garratt, operator of Garratt House. The following summer, a two-storey, L-shaped frame building with a false front was erected on the lot and operated as the Garry Saloon. Under James S. Wheeler, this business subsequently was known as Garry House (or Hotel).

The timing and location was fortuitous. It was located near the busy HBC and Dominion land offices as the 1881 construction of the Canadian Pacific Railway's (CPR's) transcontinental line sparked a major population and real estate boom. Living space was at a premium as thousands of workers, settlers and fortune-seekers besieged the city.

Wheeler, assisted by a new partner, Thomas Montgomery, seized the opportunity to expand, re-opening his facility in early September 1881 as the Winnipeg Hotel. While available records are incomplete, the evidence suggests that this three-storey, 57-room structure likely incorporated a portion of the original building.

The otherwise plain wood frame hotel featured a brick-veneer front (east) façade composed of native brick with bands and quoins in contrasting red brick. The main floor contained an asymmetrical arrangement of openings, including two entrances and windows set in round arches. Segmental arches and flat tops marked openings along the second and third storeys, respectively. A small wooden balcony protruded over the off-centre main entrance, while a huge hotel sign surmounted the wooden cornice. The building had a well-stocked bar, modern dining room, sample rooms and three parlours.

The Wheeler-Montgomery partnership dissolved in 1883. Montgomery continued the business until 1893 when he took on one of his brothers, Oswald, as a partner. Two years later, they employed architect Walter Chesterton to direct about $20,000 in renovations, mainly to modernize the main (east) façade.

Chesterton, an English-trained architect who practised in Ottawa before relocating to Winnipeg in 1881, used elements of the Classical Revival style to achieve a more imposing image for the hotel. New brick veneer was applied to the entire building, including Twin Cities red brick and Battle River sandstone on the front. Two large openings replaced the main floor windows, each containing English plate glass with stained and leaded transom lights. The wooden balcony was replaced by one of wrought iron, while the balcony door was set in a large rounded arch. These elements were flanked by pilasters leading up to a pedimented, galvanized iron cornice.

In 1901, the Montgomerys invested a further $14,000 in a three-storey, solid brick rear addition on a stone foundation, increasing capacity to 80 rooms. However, plans to build another five-storey extension immediately to the north did not proceed.
The utilitarian 1901 wing was designed by Samuel Hooper, another Englishman who pursued stone carving and monument making in London, Ontario and Winnipeg before returning to the architectural profession in 1895. He served as Manitoba's first Provincial Architect from 1904 until his death in 1911.

The Montgomerys sold the Winnipeg Hotel in 1904 to Maurice Noakes, formerly of the Imperial Hotel at Main Street and Alexander Avenue. A succession of owners followed, as did several unsympathetic building alterations - most notably, covering the facade with white paint (probably in the early 1930s) and remodelling of the entrance in 1959.

After the 1881-1882 boom, many of the Winnipeg Hotel's competitors disappeared and their sites were redeveloped to other uses. As well, the entire hotel industry shifted north toward the CPR station at Main Street and Higgins Avenue. However, arrival at the Forks of the Northern Pacific and Manitoba Railway (late 1880s), followed by the Canadian Northern and Grand Trunk Pacific railways (early 1900s) brought new activity and competition such as the short-lived but elegant Manitoba Hotel at Main Street and Water Avenue and conversions of existing buildings to the Commercial and Empire hotels.

The Winnipeg Hotel is one of the city's oldest standing buildings and one of the oldest continuously operated hotels. As well, it is an integral part of the last surviving half-block of pre-1890 development on South Main.

**Appendix B**
Macdonald Block (Commercial Hotel), 226 Main Street



Despite the collapse of Winnipeg's 1881-1882 real estate boom, wholesale grocer Alexander Macdonald proceeded with construction of this substantial twin to the Fortune Block on Main Street, confident in the city's - and his own - longer-term commercial prospects.

The Scottish-born Macdonald immigrated to Canada in the latter 1860s, working first near Seaforth, Ontario and then relocating to Winnipeg in 1871 where he became a clerk in W. Palmer Clark's general store. He soon began investing in land, while also establishing his own grocery (1876) and providing supplies to outlying traders through a chain of Red River carts.

These were the beginnings of the Alexander Macdonald Company that was incorporated in 1890 and grew by 1912 to include a factory and 10 wholesale grocery outlets across western Canada.

During the boom in 1882, Macdonald purchased a new, three-storey, retail-office block built at the southwest corner of Main and St. Mary Avenue by Mark Fortune, a realtor and former alderman. This solid brick structure on a stone foundation was designed in the flamboyant High Victorian Italianate style by architects Charles Mancel Willmot and George W. Stewart. It was constructed of plain local brick at a cost of $35,000 by Grant and Gelley.

The next year, Macdonald had an almost identical extension erected for $16,000 on the south side of the Fortune Block. While this building's architects are unknown, similarities in design point to Willmot and Stewart, Ontarians who produced several major edifices during a brief partnership from 1882-c.1884. Their projects included the Richardson, Carruthers and Stobart blocks, Winnipeg General Hospital and Mark Fortune residence on Broadway, all now demolished. Willmot subsequently returned to Ontario, while Stewart remained in Winnipeg until 1887, then moved to the United States where he practised in Dallas, Texas, Atlanta, Georgia and St. Petersburg, Florida.

The Macdonald and Fortune blocks formed an impressive visual landmark at the southern edge of the business district. Along the main floor of the front (east) façade were cast iron or carved wood columns and large plate glass windows with multi-pane transoms. Above, brick pilasters rose to an elaborate metal cornice highlighted by protrusions, wrought-iron cresting and a decorative fascia. Round-headed or Romanesque-style windows appeared along the second storey, some paired within larger segmental brick arches, while third-floor openings were set in layered arches with pointed heads. Further ornamentation was provided by a brick string course; use of coloured brick on window caps and second-storey arches; and corbelled brickwork below the cornice.

Macdonald's wholesale operations initially occupied the ground floor of 226-228 Main but soon expanded to the upper-storey offices. In 1895, continued growth demanded that two more buildings be erected behind the Main Street property at St. Mary and Fort Street. During this period, Macdonald also was active in civic politics, including a term as mayor in 1892, and in several other local corporations.

In 1901, construction began on a new brick and stone warehouse at 116-118 Market Avenue to which Macdonald subsequently relocated. He sold the business in 1912 to his two sons and a number of employees. The company shortly thereafter completed yet another new facility on Pacific Avenue. In 1924, the various branches were grouped under the name of Macdonald's Consolidated Ltd. Within a year of Macdonald's death in 1928, this firm was absorbed by Safeway Stores, predecessor of Canada Safeway.

The Macdonald Block was sold in 1902 to Sam Spence who converted it to the Commercial Hotel early the next year. The renovations, costing $3,500 were designed by H.S. Griffiths and completed by contractor S.B. Ritchie. At one point, Spence also leased a portion of the Fortune Block as a staff residence and possibly an annex for guests.

The interior, designed around two-storey light well clad in ornamental tin, features rooms on both sides of the O-shaped hallways, with staircases at both the east and west ends and common washroom and bathing facilities on each floor.

The Commercial continued in operation until the mid-1980s, after which the main floor was occupied by a private club and the upper levels were left as rooms.

Alterations over the years upset the exterior unity of the Macdonald and Fortune buildings – the most serious was the modernization of the ground floor. The Macdonald Block is an excellent example of an early 1880s development and, in combination with the adjacent Fortune Block and Winnipeg Hotel, forms part of a rare intact pre-1890 streetscape.

**Appendix C**
Owner's Written Submissions to the HBRC

Winnipeg

**Planning, Property & Development Department • Service de l'urbanisme, des biens et de l'aménagement**

***Planning and Land Use Division • Division de l'urbanisme et de l'usage des sols***

**In reply please refer to / Référence à rappeler :**

**Rina Ricci**
**Tel. : 204-986-4722**
**Fax / Téléc. : 204-986-3045**
**email: rricci@winnipeg.ca**

## WRITTEN SUBMISSION

Concerning the Nomination to be added to the List of Historical Resources

Building Name and Address: **Winnipeg Hotel, 214 MAIN ST**

Building Owner (please print): GEORGE WAYNE TOWNS

Building Owner (signed): Wayne Towns

Date: July 9/2015

Evaluation Date: **Thursday, July 16, 2015 at 3:00 pm**

**Please mark appropriate line with an (X):**

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the List of Historical Resources

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the Commemorative List

__✓__ I prefer that the building cited above have no heritage status

Comments (continue on reverse if necessary):

Winnipeg

**Planning, Property & Development Department - Service de l'urbanisme, des biens et de l'aménagement**

***Planning and Land Use Division • Division de l'urbanisme et de l'usage des sols***

**In reply please refer to / Référence à rappeler :**

**Rina Ricci**
**Tel. : 204-986-4722**
**Fax / Téléc. : 204-986-3045**
**email: rricci@winnipeg.ca**

## WRITTEN SUBMISSION

Concerning the Nomination to be added to the List of Historical Resources

Building Name and Address: **Commercial Hotel, 226 MAIN ST**

Building Owner (please print): GEORGE WAYNE TOWNS

Building Owner (signed): Wayne Towns

Date: July 9 / 2015

Evaluation Date: **Thursday, July 16, 2015 at 3:00 pm**

**Please mark appropriate line with an (X):**

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the List of Historical Resources

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the Commemorative List

__✓__ I prefer that the building cited above have no heritage status

Comments (continue on reverse if necessary):

**Appendix D**
*Historical Image of 214, 220, 226 & 232 Main Street*




West side of Main Street, south of St. Mary Avenue, 1926. 214 Main Street (#1), 220 Main Street, demolished (#2), 226 Main Street (#3), and 232 Main Street (#4)

**Appendix E**
*Pre-WWI streetscapes outside of the EDNHS*



Plate 1. West side of Main Street, north of Alexander Avenue



Plate 2. South side of Notre Dame, between Portage Avenue and Garry Street




Plate 3. West side of Main Street, south of St. Mary Avenue. 214 Main Street (#1), 226 Main Street (#2), and 232 Main Street (#3)

**Appendix F**
Nominated Resources List of Pre-WWI Commercial Buildings Outside of the EDNHS and within the Downtown Boundary

| Name | Address | Date of Construction |
|---|---|---|
| 1. Douglas & Company Building | 52 Adelaide Street | 1910 |
| 2. W.J. Guest Fish Company Warehouse | 90 Alexander Avenue | 1905 |
| 3. Manitoba Club | 194 Broadway | 1904 |
| 4. Masonic Temple | 335 Donald | 1895 |
| 5. Bell Block | 370 Donald | 1905 |
| 6. Aldous Building | 376 Donald | 1905 |
| 7. Vendome Hotel | 308 Fort Street | 1900 |
| 8. HBC Warehouse | 115 Garry Street | 1907 |
| 9. Garrick Hotel | 287 Garry Street | 1912 |
| 10. Clark Brothers Warehouse | 448 Hargrave Street | 1907 |
| 11. Manitoba Telephone Building | 474 Hargrave Street | 1896 |
| 12. Union Shoe & Leather (Black) Building | 80 Lombard Avenue | 1873 |
| 13. Winnipeg Hotel | 214 Main Street | 1873 |
| 14. MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel) | 226 Main Street | 1882 |
| 15. Fortune Block | 232 Main Street | 1882 |
| 16. McLaren Hotel | 554 Main Street | 1885 |
| 17. Maycock Block | 586 Main Street | 1904 |
| 18. Allman Block | 594 Main Street | 1902 |
| 19. Guest Block | 598 Main Street | 1902 |
| 20. McKercher Block | 600 Main Street | 1912 |
| 21. Calder (Kaplan) Building | 661 Main Street | 1902 |
| 22. Oxford Hotel | 216 Notre Dame Avenue | 1905 |
| 23. Argyle Block | 224 Notre Dame Avenue | 1908 |
| 24. Johnstone Block | 209 Pacific Avenue | 1910 |
| 25. Scott-Bathgate Building | 149 Pioneer Avenue | 1905 |
| 26. Keewayden Block (Jacob Crawley Building) | 138 Portage Avenue | 1909 |
| 27. Sterling Bank Building | 283 Portage Avenue | 1911 |
| 28. Somerset Building | 294 Portage Avenue | 1906 |
| 29. McLaughlan Motor Car Co. Building | 208 Princess Street | 1902 |
| 30. Thomas Scott Memorial Orange Hall | 216 Princess Street | 1902 |
| 31. Cockshutt Plow Company Building (J. Werier and Company Building) | 238 Princess Street | 1902 |
| 32. Canadian Fairbanks – Morse Company Warehouse (Massey-Harris Warehouse) | 300 Princess Street | 1911 |
| 33. Leadley Building (Bill Worb Furs) | 306 Ross Avenue | 1905 |
| 34. Paulin-Chambers Building | 311 Ross Avenue | 1904 |
| 35. Lauzon Block (Winnipeg Trading Post Building) | 339 William Avenue | 1905 |