Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – January 20, 2016

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 12, 2016

Item No. 13 List of Historical Resources – Fortune Block, 232 Main Street

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

The Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development and submitted the following to Council:

1. That the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommendation to add the Fortune Block, 232 Main Street, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014, be concurred in with the following Character-Defining Elements:

    A. Fortune Block, 232 Main Street

        i. Exterior:
            a. Three-storey brick building with flat roof located on the southwest corner of Main Street and St. Mary Avenue, its main facades facing east onto Main Street and north onto St. Mary Avenue, its south façade hidden by the neighbouring buildings and its west façade facing a back lane;
            b. Its main facades (east and north) with entrance and display windows along the east façade and wrapping around the northeast corner, the upper floors with their windows in round-headed openings (some paired) under larger segmental brick arches on the second floor and pointed headed, either single or triple openings, with layered brick arches on the top floor, polychromatic brick accenting, raised brick pilasters, metal fire escape (north) and an unadorned brick parapet;
            c. The small paired windows on the ground floor of the north façade; and
            d. Its rear (west) façade partially covered by a one-storey addition with metal fire escape.

        ii. Interior:
            a. Ornamental tin ceiling;
            b. Coffered ceiling of third floor skylight;
            c. Primary staircase on the south side from the ground floor to the third floor; and
            d. Ornamental moulding in hallways and around windows and doors.

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 12, 2016

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – January 20, 2016

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 12, 2016

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Councillor Orlikow,

That the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development be concurred in and forwarded to Council.

Carried

Councillor Browaty asked to be recorded as having voted against the above motion, in accordance with Rule 47(7) of The Procedure By-law No. 50/2007.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On January 12, 2016, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the matter to the Executive Policy Committee and Council.

Jay Lev, President, Stride Development Corporation, submitted a communication dated January 7, 2016, in opposition to the matter.

John Scoles, Owner, Times Change, submitted a presentation titled "Main Street at St. Mary Avenue", in support of the matter.

Cindy Tugwell, Executive Director, Heritage Winnipeg, submitted a communication dated January 7, 2016, in support of the matter.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On October 15, 2015, the Historical Buildings Committee recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Downtown Development, Heritage and Riverbank Management that the Fortune Block, 232 Main Street, be added to the List of Historical Resources, pursuant to section 8(4) of the Historical By-law 55/2014, with the following character defining elements:

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 12, 2016

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION (continued):

Exterior:

- Three-storey brick building with flat roof located on the southwest corner of Main Street and St. Mary Avenue, its main facades facing east onto Main Street and north onto St. Mary Avenue, its south façade hidden by the neighbouring buildings and its west façade facing a back lane;

- Its main facades (east and north) with entrance and display windows along the east façade and wrapping around the northeast corner, the upper floors with their windows in round-headed openings (some paired) under larger segmental brick arches on the second floor and pointed headed, either single or triple openings, with layered brick arches on the top floor, polychromatic brick accenting, raised brick pilasters, metal fire escape (north) and an unadorned brick parapet;

- The small paired windows on the ground floor of the north façade; and

- Its rear (west) façade partially covered by a one-storey addition with metal fire escape.

Interior:

- Ornamental tin ceiling;

- Coffered ceiling of third floor skylight;

- Primary staircase on the south side from the ground floor to the third floor; and

- Ornamental moulding in hallways and around windows and doors.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: Addition to the List of Historical Resources, Fortune Block, 232 Main Street

Critical Path: Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage, and Downtown Development – EPC - Council

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO/COO
K. McKim	J. Kiernan	n/a	M. Jack COO

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That Council concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add the Fortune Block, 232 Main Street, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014, with the following Character-Defining Elements:

   A. Fortune Block, 232 Main Street

      i) Exterior:

         a. Three-storey brick building with flat roof located on the southwest corner of Main Street and St. Mary Avenue, its main facades facing east onto Main Street and north onto St. Mary Avenue, its south façade hidden by the neighbouring buildings and its west façade facing a back lane;

         b. Its main facades (east and north) with entrance and display windows along the east façade and wrapping around the northeast corner, the upper floors with their windows in round-headed openings (some paired) under larger segmental brick arches on the second floor and pointed headed, either single or triple openings, with layered brick arches on the top floor, polychromatic brick accenting, raised brick pilasters, metal fire escape (north) and an unadorned brick parapet;

         c. The small paired windows on the ground floor of the north façade; and

         d. Its rear (west) façade partially covered by a one-storey addition with metal fire escape.

      ii) Interior

         a. Ornamental tin ceiling;

         b. Coffered ceiling of third floor skylight;

         c. Primary staircase on the south side from the ground floor to the third floor; and

         d. Ornamental moulding in hallways and around windows and doors.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to effect the intent of the foregoing.

REASON FOR THE REPORT

The building at 232 Main Street was on the Inventory of Buildings under the former Historical Buildings By-law 1474/77, and pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 8(4), it was deemed Nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources on the date that the new Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 came into effect. Under the By-law, nominated resources are protected from demolition.

Subject to this nomination, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) reviewed this resource and, on October 15, 2015, recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage, and Downtown Development (SPC on PDHDD) that it be added to the List of Historical Resources because of its outstanding architectural and historical significance and the heritage value that it embodies.

Pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 17, subject to requests for postponements by the owner, the SPC on PDHDD must consider the recommendations from the HBRC within 90 days after receiving the recommendations. The Director is authorized to provide a report with respect to the nomination for consideration by the SPC on PDHDD at the time it considers the recommendations of the HBRC.

As per section 27(3), the SPC on PDHDD must consider whether the resource continues to embody heritage values sufficient to justify its continued inclusion on the List, and if applicable, the hazard posed by the resource and may, in addition, consider the economic viability of conserving the resource using the following criteria from section 18(2):

a. The condition of the resource;

b. The costs of the continued repair and maintenance of the resource;

c. The importance and value derived from the conservation or continued conservation of the resource;

d. The efforts that have been made by the owner to date to conserve the resource; and

e. The merits of alternative proposals for the resource or the site on which it is located, other than conserving the resource by adding it to the List.

As per section 20(1), the determinations of the SPC on PDHDD concerning an application to remove from the List of Historical Resources are recommendations to Council that must be considered by Council within 60 days of the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations were made.

As per section 20(3), after considering the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee and the SPC on PDHDD together with the recommendations made by the Executive Policy Committee, Council may add or decline to add the building to the List of Historical Resources.

As per section 21(1 & 2), the determinations of the SPC on PDHDD are deemed to be final decisions that are not to be considered by Council and may not be appealed if:

a) They are identical to the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee; and
b) The owner does not formally oppose the recommendations

The owner is deemed not to oppose the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee if her or she neither:

a) Appears in person or by agent at the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations are considered to advise of his or her opposition; nor
b) Advises the City Clerk in writing of his or her opposition to the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee prior to the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations are considered.

The owners of the building are opposed to the HBRC's recommendation to add the building to the List of Historical Resources. The owners have provided a written submission which notes that various aspects of the building are in a condition of disrepair due to water damage and neglect (see Appendix C). An engineer's condition assessment report has not been submitted.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommends that the building at 232 Main Street be added to the List of Historical Resources with protected Character-Defining Elements as noted because of the building's outstanding historical and architectural significance in the heritage value it embodies.

The owners of the building are not supportive of the HBRC's recommendation and do not want the building to be added to the List of Historical Resources. The owners have provided a written submission which notes that various aspects of the building are in a condition of disrepair due to water damage and neglect. An engineer's condition assessment report has not been submitted.

As a nominated building under the Historical Resources By-law, the building is protected from demolition. A developer has recently expressed interest to the Department to purchase, demolish, and redevelop this property, as well as the other properties at 214 & 226 Main Street (Winnipeg Hotel and McDonald Block) and the vacant lot at 220 Main Street. The redevelopment would include the demolition of all three buildings. Neither plans nor permit applications concerning this proposed redevelopment have been reviewed by the Department because the building is currently nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources and is protected from demolition.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

Fortune Block, 232 Main Street, will be added to the List of Historical Resources:

- A Historic Property Notice (caveat) will be filed against the title of the building with the Winnipeg Land Titles Office of the Property Registry as per City of Winnipeg Charter Section 157.1(3) in order to notify the owner(s) and potential purchasers that the properties are identified on the List of Historical Resources, and as such are subject to the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- Any alterations to the Character-Defining Elements will require approval under a Heritage Permit as per the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- The resource will not be able to be demolished.
- The resource will be eligible for applicable heritage grants issued under the Province of Manitoba and the City of Winnipeg, and will be viewed favourably by other heritage granting agencies.

HISTORY

As a part of the nomination process, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) toured this building on September 3, 2015 in order to identify the proposed Character-Defining Elements of the resource that should be protected.

The building is partially occupied with a drinking establishment/live music venue on the main floor; the second and third floors of the building are unoccupied.

The owners are not supportive of adding the building to the List of Historical Resources (*see Appendix C for owners' submission*).

The building at 232 Main Street, Fortune Block, is deemed to embody heritage values attributed to the following:

1. the building was constructed in 1882, which makes it an extremely rare example of an early 1880s structure in Winnipeg;
2. Mark Fortune (1847-1912), well-known and successful businessman, politician and developer, developed the property;
3. C.M. Willmot and G.W. Stewart were the architects that designed the building. They were likely responsible for the design of the Macdonald Block (Commercial Hotel) at 226 Main Street, built in 1883 immediately south of this building;
4. the building is an early example of a solid brick structure designed in the High Victorian Italianate style;
5. the building is an integral part of a rare, pre-1890 half-block streetscape on South Main Street; and
6. the design features of the upper storeys of the main façade have not been severely altered.

On October 15, 2015, the HBRC recommended to the SPC on PDHDD that this building be added to the List of Historical Resources because it embodies heritage values of widespread importance to both the city and the downtown community and because of its outstanding architectural and historical significance.

Shortly prior to the meeting of the HBRC in which the recommendation was made to add this building to the List of Historical Resources, a developer had expressed interest to the Department to purchase and redevelop this property as well as the properties at 214 & 226 Main Street and the vacant lot at 220 Main Street (refer to Appendix D for a historical image & plate 3, Appendix E for a recent image). The redevelopment would include the demolition of all three buildings. Neither plans nor permit applications concerning this proposed redevelopment have been reviewed by the Department because the building is protected from demolition under the Historical Resources By-law.

The Public Service is taking action to conserve pre-WWI buildings that contribute to important commercial streetscapes that are within the Downtown Boundary both inside and outside of the Exchange District National Historic Site (EDNHS). Some examples of these historic streetscapes, which are illustrative of downtown development outside of the EDNHS and that include buildings that are nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources, are as follows (see Appendix E):

- West side of Main Street, south of St. Mary Avenue
- West side of Main Street, north of Alexander Avenue
- South side of Notre Dame, between Portage Avenue and Garry Street

There are currently 117 buildings that are nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources. Of these, 35 are Pre-WWI Commercial Buildings, outside of the EDNHS and within the Downtown Boundary (see Appendix F).

**See Appendix A for a History of 232 Main Street, Fortune Block*

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement Date: December 14, 2015

Project Name:

Addition to the List of Historical Resources, 232 Main Street

COMMENTS:

That the Council concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add the Fortune Block at 232 Main Street to the List of Historical Resources.

There are no financial implications associated with this recommendation.

"Original Signed By"
Mike McGinn, CA
Manager of Finance

CONSULTATION

In preparing this report there was consultation with:

City of Winnipeg Historical Buildings and Resources Committee

OURWINNIPEG POLICY ALIGNMENT

The recommendation to add 232 Main Street to the List of Historical Resources aligns with policies under OurWinnipeg Section 02 A Sustainable City, 02-3 Heritage:

Winnipeg has a rich and complex history. Our heritage resources are inseparably tied to our culture, identity, cultural perspective, collective consciousness and sense of place. In Winnipeg, heritage resources support and represented by a distinct mix of cultures, ideas and values. This facet of our identity provides us with variety in neighbourhood design and architecture, expresses various social values, and provides an invaluable legacy of resources that are distinctly our own.

The conservation and reuse of existing buildings can also align with numerous sustainability objectives such as waste minimization, natural resource protection and compact urban form.

Direction 2: Conserve, protect and celebrate the significant heritage resources that illustrate the broad range of Winnipeg's heritage values by:

- *Recognize the importance of a broad range of tangible heritage resources throughout the city that illustrate a unique sense of place and community pride.*
- *Identify, designate, and protect the City's most significant heritage resources.*

Direction 3: Provide leadership in heritage conservation that links to broader civic goals of economic development, sustainability and neighbourhood planning.

- *Strive to link heritage conservation to sustainable development initiatives, including economic, environmental and social initiatives.*
- *Work with other governments, community groups, and building owners to conserve heritage resources.*

Direction 4: Conserve downtown's rich legacy of heritage resources that provide significant and sustainable development opportunities.

- *Work with downtown community stakeholders to identify and support key projects and heritage conservation initiatives that encourage and support downtown living, and facilitate strategic economic and cultural initiatives.*

Direction 6: Plan for the sustainable development of healthy neighbourhoods based on their particular historic identity and character by:

- *Work with community stakeholders to identify unique identities and neighbourhood legacy elements.*
- *Encourage the sustainable reuse of existing building stock and historic infrastructure.*

SUBMITTED BY

Department: Planning, Property and Development
Division: Planning and Land Use
Prepared by: Rina Ricci
Date: December 15, 2015
File No.: O:\Reports Directive\Planning and Land Use\Heritage\2015\Additions to the List of Historical Resources, 232 Main.doc

Appendix A
Fortune Block, 232 Main Street



Mark Fortune (1847-1912) was one of many land speculators who took advantage of Winnipeg's 1881-1882 real estate boom to amass a large personal fortune. Unlike many of his contemporaries, however, his wealth did not vanish with the collapse of property values after 1882. Over the next three decades, Fortune's influence in the city would grow; he was an alderman on City Council (1879-1881) and was considered a member of Winnipeg's elite when he and his 19-year-old son died on the *Titanic* on April 10, 1912 (his wife and three of his daughters survived). In 1882, however, Fortune joined a growing list of investors by using some of his profits to construct a commercial block, at the southwest corner of Main Street and St. Mary Avenue, and then selling it.

The three-storey solid brick Fortune Block features two similarly designed main façades, east and north. Originally, the ground floor of the east elevation was designed with large display windows and multi-pane transoms, set in either cast iron or wood frames wrapping around the northeast corner of the building and running a short distance along the St. Mary Avenue façade. Above the windows was an ornamental cornice, likely tin, with protrusions along its length (removed by 1926). Numerous renovations have been made to this area of the building as new tenants renovated to suit their needs. Much more original are the second and third floors: the polychromatic brickwork of the upper storeys; the brick pilasters; the round-headed windows with some paired openings under larger segmental brick arches on the second floor; and the pointed headed windows, either singles or triples, with layered brick arches on the top floor. An unadorned brick parapet has replaced the original metal cornice that finished the building above a corbelled brick band. Many of these elements are also found on the north façade. The plainer west façade has been partially covered by a one-storey addition completed in 1957.

Fortune sold the block shortly after its construction to Scottish-born wholesale grocer Alexander Macdonald who then built a nearly identical building at the south end of the Fortune Block. The Fortune Block and its southern twin were designed in the exuberant High Victorian Italianate style, the architects were Charles Mancel Willmot and George W. Stewart, Ontarians who produced several major edifices during their brief partnership from 1882-c.1884. Their projects included the Richardson, Carruthers and Stobart blocks, Winnipeg General Hospital and Mark Fortune residence on Broadway, all now demolished. Willmot subsequently returned to Ontario, while Stewart remained in Winnipeg until 1887, then moved to the United States where he practised in Dallas, Texas, Atlanta, Georgia and St. Petersburg, Florida.

The block was used as a mixed retail and office/residential facility for many years; long-term tenants included Holman Brothers butchers and grocer Thomas Jobin. The upper floors, which continue to feature some original woodwork around doors and windows, original door hardware and the magnificent main staircase along the building's south wall, has been vacant since the late 1970s.

Although alterations over the years have upset the exterior unity of the Macdonald and Fortune buildings, the Fortune Block and its twin, along with the two buildings to the south, form a rare intact pre-1890 streetscape.

Appendix C
Owners' Written Submission to the HBRC

CITY CLERKS WPG '15 SEP 28 09:49

Winnipeg

Planning, Property & Development Department • Service de l'urbanisme, des biens et de l'aménagement

Planning and Land Use Division • Division de l'urbanisme et de l'usage des sols

In reply please refer to / Référence à rappeler :

Rina Ricci
Tel. : 204-986-4722
Fax / Téléc. : 204-986-3045
email: rricci@winnipeg.ca

WRITTEN SUBMISSION

Concerning the Nomination to be added to the List of Historical Resources

Building Name and Address: **Fortune Block, 232 MAIN ST**

Building Owner (please print): George & Shirley Landes

Building Owner (signed): [signature]

Date: Sept 20/2015

Evaluation Date: **Thursday, October 15, 2015 at 3:00 pm**

Please mark appropriate line with an (X):

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the List of Historical Resources

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the Commemorative List

_✓_ I prefer that the building cited above have no heritage status

Comments (continue on reverse if necessary):

See Over.

All windows and doors of the first floor commercial areas have been replaced in recent years. None of the flooring is original. The entire second and third floor space has been shut down and unoccupied for approximately fourty-five years and together with shifting of the building, water damage and neglect, the ceilings have fallen in and door frames, staircases and flooring have suffered irreparable damage. Almost all exterior windows have broken glass and very deteriorated frames. The roof has broken structural members and the last significant roof repair was 1970. The exterior brickwork is unstable.

In other words the building is beyond repair and placing any impediment to demolition and redeveloping the site would be economically unfeasible and a disservice to the community.

Appendix D
Historical Image of 214, 220, 226 & 232 Main Street



West side of Main Street, south of St. Mary Avenue, 1926. 214 Main Street (#1), 220 Main Street, demolished (#2), 226 Main Street (#3), and 232 Main Street (#4)

Appendix E
Pre-WWI streetscapes outside of the EDNHS



Plate 1. West side of Main Street, north of Alexander Avenue



Plate 2. South side of Notre Dame, between Portage Avenue and Garry Street



Plate 3. West side of Main Street, south of St. Mary Avenue. 214 Main Street (#1), 226 Main Street (#2), and 232 Main Street (#3)

Appendix F
Nominated Resources List of Pre-WWI Commercial Buildings Outside of the EDNHS and within the Downtown Boundary

Name	Address	Date of Construction
1. Douglas & Company Building	52 Adelaide Street	1910
2. W.J. Guest Fish Company Warehouse	90 Alexander Avenue	1905
3. Manitoba Club	194 Broadway	1904
4. Masonic Temple	335 Donald	1895
5. Bell Block	370 Donald	1905
6. Aldous Building	376 Donald	1905
7. Vendome Hotel	308 Fort Street	1900
8. HBC Warehouse	115 Garry Street	1907
9. Garrick Hotel	287 Garry Street	1912
10. Clark Brothers Warehouse	448 Hargrave Street	1907
11. Manitoba Telephone Building	474 Hargrave Street	1896
12. Union Shoe & Leather (Black) Building	80 Lombard Avenue	1873
13. Winnipeg Hotel	214 Main Street	1873
14. MacDonald Block (Commercial Hotel)	226 Main Street	1882
15. Fortune Block	232 Main Street	1882
16. McLaren Hotel	554 Main Street	1885
17. Maycock Block	586 Main Street	1904
18. Allman Block	594 Main Street	1902
19. Guest Block	598 Main Street	1902
20. McKercher Block	600 Main Street	1912
21. Calder (Kaplan) Building	661 Main Street	1902
22. Oxford Hotel	216 Notre Dame Avenue	1905
23. Argyle Block	224 Notre Dame Avenue	1908
24. Johnstone Block	209 Pacific Avenue	1910
25. Scott-Bathgate Building	149 Pioneer Avenue	1905
26. Keewayden Block (Jacob Crawley Building)	138 Portage Avenue	1909
27. Sterling Bank Building	283 Portage Avenue	1911
28. Somerset Building	294 Portage Avenue	1906
29. McLaughlan Motor Car Co. Building	208 Princess Street	1902
30. Thomas Scott Memorial Orange Hall	216 Princess Street	1902
31. Cockshutt Plow Company Building (J. Werier and Company Building)	238 Princess Street	1902
32. Canadian Fairbanks – Morse Company Warehouse (Massey-Harris Warehouse)	300 Princess Street	1911
33. Leadley Building (Bill Worb Furs)	306 Ross Avenue	1905
34. Paulin-Chambers Building	311 Ross Avenue	1904
35. Lauzon Block (Winnipeg Trading Post Building)	339 William Avenue	1905