Agenda – Executive Policy Committee – January 11, 2017

Report "A" – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – December 5, 2016

Item No. 1 List of Historical Resources – Nomination of Power Building, 428 Portage Avenue

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On December 5, 2016, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the following to Council:

1. That the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add 428 Portage Avenue, Power Building, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014, be approved, with the following Character-Defining Elements:

    A. Exterior:

        i. Six-storey stone clad building with flat roof located at the southeast corner of Portage Avenue and Vaughan Street, its main facade facing north onto Portage Avenue and west onto Vaughan Street, its east facade partially hidden by the neighbouring building and its south facade facing the back lane;

        ii. Its main (north) facade divided into five bays, a recessed doorway with stepped pointed arch frame at the east end, the upper floors with stepped stone pilasters with stylized lettering and designs on the fifth and sixth floors, paired rectilinear window openings on each floor and flat roofline finished by the raised, squared heads of the pilasters;

        iii. Its Vaughan Street facade (west) with its stepped pilasters, paired windows in rectilinear openings on the upper floors and flat roof with raised, squared pilaster heads;

        iv. The visible uninterrupted brick wall of the east elevation; and

        v. Its rear (south) facade with common clay brick walls and windows in rectilinear openings on all floors.

Agenda – Executive Policy Committee – January 11, 2017

Report "A" – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – December 5, 2016

B. Interior:

i. Metal and wood finishes of the mid-building staircase.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Agenda – Executive Policy Committee – January 11, 2017

Report "A" – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – December 5, 2016

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On December 5, 2016, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the matter to the Executive Policy Committee and Council.

Rocky Neufeld and Calvin Polet submitted a communication titled "Historical Designation Evaluation – 428 Portage Avenue, Winnipeg, Manitoba" dated June 16, 2016, in opposition to the recommendation of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee.

On October 11, 2016, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development laid over the matter to its meeting on December 5, 2016.

Rocky Neufeld, on behalf of the building owner, submitted a communication dated September 13, 2016, requesting that the matter be adjourned to the December 5, 2016 meeting of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On June 16, 2016, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development that the Power Building, 428 Portage Avenue be added to the List of Historical Resources, pursuant to section 8(4) of the Historical By-law 55/2014, with the following character defining elements:

Exterior:

- Six-storey stone clad building with flat roof located at the southeast corner of Portage Avenue and Vaughan Street, its main facade facing north onto Portage Avenue and west onto Vaughan Street, its east facade partially hidden by the neighbouring building and its south facade facing the back lane;

Report "A" – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – December 5, 2016

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION (continued):

Exterior (continued):

- Its main (north) facade divided into five bays, a recessed doorway with stepped pointed arch frame at the east end, the upper floors with stepped stone pilasters with stylized lettering and designs on the fifth and sixth floors, paired rectilinear window openings on each floor and flat roofline finished by the raised, squared heads of the pilasters;

- Its Vaughan Street facade (west) with its stepped pilasters, paired windows in rectilinear openings on the upper floors and flat roof with raised, squared pilaster heads;

- The visible uninterrupted brick wall of the east elevation; and

- Its rear (south) facade with common clay brick walls and windows in rectilinear openings on all floors

Interior:

- Metal and wood finishes of the mid-building staircase.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: Addition to the List of Historical Resources, 428 Portage Avenue, Power Building

Critical Path: Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – Executive Policy Committee - Council

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO
J. Hansell	J. Kiernan	n/a	D. McNeil

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommends that the building at 428 Portage Avenue be added to the List of Historical Resources with the protected Character-Defining Elements as noted because of the building's outstanding historical and architectural significance in the heritage value that it embodies.

The owner of the building is not supportive of the HBRC's recommendations. The owner prefers that the building has no heritage status at all and that the building not be added to the List of Historical Resources.

The building is a rare example of a substantial downtown mixed use block built between the World Wars (see photographs, attached as Appendix C).

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That Council concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add 428 Portage Avenue, Power Building, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 with the following Character-Defining Elements:

   A. Exterior:

      i. Six-storey stone clad building with flat roof located at the southeast corner of Portage Avenue and Vaughan Street, its main facade facing north onto Portage Avenue and west onto Vaughan Street, its east facade partially hidden by the neighbouring building and its south facade facing the back lane;

      ii. Its main (north) facade divided into five bays, a recessed doorway with stepped pointed arch frame at the east end, the upper floors with stepped stone pilasters with stylized lettering and designs on the fifth and sixth floors, paired rectilinear window openings on each floor and flat roofline finished by the raised, squared heads of the pilasters;

      iii. Its Vaughan Street facade (west) with its stepped pilasters, paired windows in rectilinear openings on the upper floors and flat roof with raised, squared pilaster heads;

iv. The visible uninterrupted brick wall of the east elevation; and

v. Its rear (south) facade with common clay brick walls and windows in rectilinear openings on all floors

B. Interior:

i. Metal and wood finishes of the mid-building staircase

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

REASON FOR THE REPORT

The building at 428 Portage Avenue was on the Inventory of Buildings under the former Historical Buildings By-law 1474/77, and pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 8(4), it was deemed Nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources on the date that the new Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 came into effect.

Subject to this nomination, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) reviewed this resource and, on June 16, 2016, recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage, and Downtown Development (SPC on PDHDD) that it be added to the List of Historical Resources because of its outstanding architectural and historical significance and the heritage values that it embodies.

Pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 17, subject to requests for postponements by the owner, the SPD on PDHDD must consider the recommendations from the HBRC within 90 days after receiving the recommendations. The Director is authorized to provide a report with respect to the nomination for consideration by the SPC on PDHDD at the time it considers the recommendations of the HBRC.

As per section 27(3), the SPC on PDHDD must consider whether the resource continues to embody heritage values sufficient to justify its continued inclusion on the List, and if applicable, the hazard posed by the resource and may, in addition, consider the economic viability of conserving the resource using the following criteria from section 18(2):

a. The condition of the resource;

b. The costs of the continued repair and maintenance of the resource;

c. The importance and value derived from the conservation or continued conservation of the resource;

d. The efforts that have been made by the owner to date to conserve the resource; and

e. The merits of alternative proposals for the resource or the site on which it is located, other than conserving the resource by adding it to the List.

As per section 20(1), the determinations of the SPC on PDHDD concerning a nomination are recommendations to Council that must be considered by Council within 60 days of the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations were made.

As per section 20(3), after considering the recommendations of the HBRC and the SPC on PDHDD, together with the recommendations made by the Executive Policy Committee, Council may add or decline to add the buildings to the List of Historical Resources.

As per section 21(1 and 2), the determinations of the SPC on PDHDD are deemed to be final decisions that are not to be considered by Council and may not be appealed if:

a) They are identical to the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee; and
b) The owner does not formally oppose the recommendations

The owner is deemed not to oppose the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee if her or she neither:

a) Appears in person or by agent at the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations are considered to advise of his or her opposition; nor

b) Advises the City Clerk in writing of his or her opposition to the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee prior to the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations are considered.

In advance of the HBRC's recommendation, the owner had provided a written submission through the office of the City Clerks stating that the owner prefers that the building has no heritage status at all and that it not be added to the List of Historical Resources (sees Appendix B).

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

428 Portage Avenue, Power Building, will be added to the List of Historical Resources:

- A Historic Property Notice (caveat) will be filed against the title of the building with the Winnipeg Land Titles Office of the Property Registry as per City of Winnipeg Charter Section 157.1(3) in order to notify the owner and potential purchasers that the properties are identified on the List of Historical Resources, and as such are subject to the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- Any alterations to the Character-Defining Elements will require approval under a Heritage Permit as per the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- The resource will not be able to be demolished.
- The resource will be made eligible for heritage grants and incentive programs issued under the Province of Manitoba and the City of Winnipeg, and will be viewed favourably by other heritage granting agencies.
- Effective October 1, 2016, if the listed resource is vacant and unless an owner provides evidence that the listed resource was not built using shallow foundations as defined by the Manitoba Building Code, the basement or crawlspace of the resource must be heated to a temperature of 10 degrees Celsius so as to prevent undue shifting, heaving or "frost-jacking" of the listed resource.

HISTORY/DISCUSSION

As a part of the nomination process, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee toured this building on March 3, 2016 in order to identify the proposed Character-Defining Elements of the resource that should be protected.

The owner is not supportive of adding the building to the List of Historical Resources.

The building at 428 Portage Avenue**,** is deemed to embody heritage values attributed to the following:

1. its age, built in 1928, makes it a rare example of a substantial downtown mixed use block built between the World Wars;
2. its long-term association with the Winnipeg Electric Company, the block's main tenant into the 1950s, which used parts of the building for showroom, retail, and office uses;
3. its architects, R.B. Pratt and D.A. Ross, were well-known practitioners in the city;
4. its design, materials, and construction methods are all excellent examples of the period;
5. it is located on the south side of Portage Avenue, in the middle of two blocks of similarly built and designed structures; and
6. many of its original exterior features and finishes are intact.

On June 16, 2016, the HBRC recommended to the SPC on PDHDD that this building be added to the List of Historical Resources because it embodies heritage values of widespread importance to both the city and the downtown community and because of its outstanding architectural and historical significance (see Appendix A).

This building is part of an important section of Portage Avenue, one of downtown Winnipeg's busiest thoroughfares and is an integral part of a streetscape that includes the massive Hudson's Bay Company Store at its western terminus. It is similar in design, cladding and alignment with adjacent structures from the same period. (see photographs, attached as Appendix C).

For more information, please see Appendix A for a History of 428 Portage Avenue, Power Building.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement

Date: August 17, 2016

Project Name:

Additions to the List of Historical Resources, 428 Portage Avenue

COMMENTS:

That the Standing Policy Committee on Property & Development, Heritage, and Downtown Development concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add 428 Portage Avenue to the List of Historical Resources.

There are no financial implications associated with this recommendation.

"Original Signed By"
Mike McGinn, CPA, CA
Manager of Finance

CONSULTATION

Historical Buildings and Resources Committee

OURWINNIPEG POLICY ALIGNMENT

The recommendation to add 428 Portage Avenue to the List of Historical Resources aligns with policies under OurWinnipeg Section 02 A Sustainable City, 02-3 Heritage:

"Winnipeg has a rich and complex history. Our heritage resources are inseparably tied to our culture, identity, cultural perspective, collective consciousness and sense of place. In Winnipeg, heritage resources support and represented by a distinct mix of cultures, ideas and values. This facet of our identity provides us with variety in neighbourhood design and architecture, expresses various social values, and provides an invaluable legacy of resources that are distinctly our own.

The conservation and reuse of existing buildings can also align with numerous sustainability objectives such as waste minimization, natural resource protection and compact urban form.

Direction 2: Conserve, protect and celebrate the significant heritage resources that illustrate the broad range of Winnipeg's heritage values.

- Recognize the importance of a broad range of tangible heritage resources throughout the city that illustrate a unique sense of place and community pride.
- Identify, designate, and protect the City's most significant heritage resources.

Direction 3: Provide leadership in heritage conservation that links to broader civic goals of economic development, sustainability and neighbourhood planning.

- Strive to link heritage conservation to sustainable development initiatives, including economic, environmental and social initiatives.
- Work with other governments, community groups, and building owners to conserve heritage resources.

Direction 4: Conserve downtown's rich legacy of heritage resources that provide significant and sustainable development opportunities.

- Work with downtown community stakeholders to identify and support key projects and heritage conservation initiatives that encourage and support downtown living, and facilitate strategic economic and cultural initiatives.

Direction 6: Plan for the sustainable development of healthy neighbourhoods based on their particular historic identity and character.

- Work with community stakeholders to identify unique identities and neighbourhood legacy elements.
- Encourage the sustainable reuse of existing building stock and historic infrastructure."

SUBMITTED BY

Department:	Planning, Property and Development
Division:	Urban Design
Prepared by:	R. Ricci
Date:	August 24, 2016
File No.:	O:\Reports Directive\Planning and Land Use\Heritage\2016\Addition to the List of Historical Resources, 428 Portage.doc

Appendix A
Power Building, 428 Portage Avenue



After 1905, Winnipeg's Portage Avenue had grown into the city's major commercial centre, with office buildings and retail properties locating on both sides of the avenue. T. Eaton Company and the Hudson's Bay Company both chose to open mammoth department stores on Portage Avenue, Eaton's officially opening on July 15, 1905 and the Hudson's Bay Company on November 18, 1926.

In 1928, the six-storey Power Building was constructed on the corner of Vaughan Street. This limestone-clad retail/office building is an excellent and locally rare example of the Modern Gothic or Late Gothic Revival Style which can be traced back to the medieval, especially church, architecture of England and France. Emerging as a popular North American style in the early 1900s, familiar elements include pointed arches, intricate tracery, buttresses, spires, oriel and bay windows, and pinnacles. By the 1920s, the style had refined – the use of reinforced concrete and steel frame construction allowed for taller, stronger buildings. Gothic ornamentation was simplified in favour of clean, straight lines and reduced ornamental treatments. The Wheat Pool Building, 423 Main Street (built in 1929), the Manitoba Telephones Building, 166 Portage Avenue (1930) and the Federal Building, 269 Main Street (1935) are three other excellent examples.

The partnership of Ralph Benjamin Pratt (1872-1950) and Donald Aynsley Ross (1878-1956) was responsible for the design of the Power Building. Pratt was born and trained in England, Ross was born in Winnipeg and educated in Toronto. The pair both worked in the railway sector for the Canadian Northern Railway prior to forming their architectural firm in 1906. The firm remained active into the 1940s. Among their more notable works are: Garry Block (Belgica Block), 290 Garry St. (1911) – Grade III; Electric Railway Chambers, 213 Notre Dame Ave. (1913) – Grade II; Scott Block, reconstruction after a fire, 272 Main St. (1915) – Grade III; Northern Electric Building (with J.O. Despatie of Montreal), 65 Rorie St. (1928) – Grade III; Sherbrook Pool, 381 Sherbrook St. (1930) – Grade III; and Structural Engineers and Mechanical Equipment Supervisors for the Winnipeg Civic Auditorium (now Provincial Archives of Manitoba), 200 Vaughan St. (1932-1933).

The building measures approximately 39.7 x 26.8 x 25.0 metres, is built on a reinforced concrete and steel frame and its exterior walls are clad in stone (front [north] and west façades) and brick (rear [south] and east façades). Total cost of construction of the building was $345,000.

The building has two main façades, north and west and both are similarly designed. The Portage Avenue (north) elevation is divided into five bays, the ground floor bays filled with large square-headed openings and several recessed and lighted entrances. A plain stone belt course divided the ground floor from the second floor and ran the entire length of the Portage Avenue and Vaughan Street façades. On the upper floors, stepped stone pilasters created vertical emphasis, the pilasters embellished with stylized lettering and designs on the fifth and sixth floors. Windows on each of the upper floors were paired within each bay, originally double-hung units with undivided glass panes. The flat roofline was animated with raised sections above and between the pilasters, creating a crenellated appearance.

The west or Vaughan Street side carried on the design elements of the front façade and again featured recessed entrances. Much of the ground floor has seen alteration as new tenants modernized their entrances. The upper portion of the building, however, remains almost completely unchanged.

The rear of the building is clad in common clay brick and features numerous square headed windows on all levels. The east side is partially hidden by the neighbouring building; the visible section to the rear is also clad in clay brick and features plain windows in rectilinear openings.

The building's interior has changed significantly over time, with upgrades and renovations changing the layout and finishes of almost the entire building save for portions of the basement and the metal and wood accented rear staircase.

The Power Building was a rental property originally owned by local real estate, finance and insurance company Oldfield, Kirby and Gardner. The original and main tenant of the building was the Winnipeg Electric Company, which used the space as a showroom and retail store, promoting its new line of gas and electrical appliances beyond its lucrative streetcar service. The Portage Avenue location was perfect for the company, which remained in the Power Building into the mid-1950s. Tenancy over the years has been extremely diverse

Appendix B
Owner's Written Submission

Winnipeg

Planning, Property & Development Department • Service de l'urbanisme, des biens et de l'aménagement

Planning and Land Use Division • Division de l'urbanisme et de l'usage des sols

In reply please refer to / Référence à rappeler :

Rina Ricci
Tel. : 204-986-4722
Fax / Téléc. : 204-986-3045
email: rricci@winnipeg.ca

WRITTEN SUBMISSION

Concerning the Nomination to be added to the List of Historical Resources

Building Name and Address: **Power Building, 428 PORTAGE AVE**

Building Owner (please print):

Building Owner (signed): _

Date: 3 JUNE 2016

Evaluation Date: **Thursday, June 16, 2016 at 3:00 pm**

Please mark appropriate line with an (X):

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the List of Historical Resources

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the Commemorative List

X I prefer that the building cited above have no heritage status

Comments (continue on reverse if necessary):

Embrace the spirit • Vivez l'esprit
Unit 15 – 30 Fort Street • 30, rue Fort, unité 15 • Winnipeg • Manitoba R3C 4X5
http://www.winnipeg.ca/ppd/

Page 4 of 6

Appendix C
Building in Context over Time



Looking west down Portage Avenue, between Memorial Blvd and Kennedy Street, 1932.
426 Portage Avenue, Bank of Montreal (#1 - Listed), 428 Portage Avenue, Power Building (#2 – Nominated), 450 Portage Avenue, Hudson Bay Store (#3 – Nominated)



Looking west down Portage Avenue, between Memorial Blvd and Kennedy Street, 2015.
424 Portage Avenue, Singer Sewing Machine Building (#1 – Nominated), 426 Portage Avenue, Bank of Montreal (#2 - Listed), 428 Portage Avenue, Power Building (#3 – Nominated), 450 Portage Avenue, Hudson Bay Store (#4 – Nominated)

Attachment A – Request for Adjournment

From: Rocky Neufeld
Sent: Tuesday, September 13, 2016 10:54 AM
To: Poitras, Andrew
Subject: 428 Portage - heritage - Standing Policy Committee

Andrew,
I will be out of the country on October 11, part work/part holiday.
The owner wishes me to represent in person.
Is it possible to re-schedule, and consult on available dates (as I have a heavy LVAC, Municipal Board, and Board of Revision schedule).
It is also likely that a second building will come before this committee, 317 McDermot, being heard at Historical on Sep 22.

Rocky Neufeld, BA, AACI, P.App
Appraiser
Colliers International Realty Advisors
5th Floor - 305 Broadway
Winnipeg, MB R3C 3J7
Canada

Dir: 204.926.3841
Fax: 204.943.4793
Cell: 204.229.7769



www.colliers.mb.ca