Agenda – Executive Policy Committee – April 12, 2017

Report "A" – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 17, 2017

Item No. 2 List of Historical Resources – Nomination of Reliable Service Station, 98 Albert Street

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On January 17, 2017, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the following to Council:

1. That the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add 98 Albert Street, Reliable Service Station, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 be approved, with the following Character-Defining Elements:

    A. Exterior:

        i. One storey, north facing structure with sloping tiled roof located at the south end of a pie-shaped open lot formed by the meeting of Albert and Arthur streets; and

        ii. Original light fixture housing in soffits on north side

    B. Interior:

        i. None.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Report "A" – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 17, 2017

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

COUNCIL DECISION:

On March 22, 2017, Council concurred in the recommendation of the Executive Policy Committee and adopted the following:

1. That the matter be laid over to the April 12, 2017 meeting of the Executive Policy Committee.

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On March 8, 2017, the Executive Policy Committee submitted to Council that the matter be further laid over to the April 12, 2017 meeting of the Executive Policy Committee.

COUNCIL DECISION:

On February 22, 2017, Council concurred in the recommendation of the Executive Policy Committee and adopted the following:

1. That the matter be laid over to the March 8, 2017 meeting of the Executive Policy Committee.

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On February 8, 2017, the Executive Policy Committee submitted to Council that the matter be laid over to the March 8, 2017 meeting of the Executive Policy Committee.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On January 17, 2017, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the matter to the Executive Policy Committee and Council.

On December 5, 2016, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development laid over the matter to its meeting on January 17, 2017.

Report "A" – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – January 17, 2017

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On October 20, 2016, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development that the Reliable Service Station, 98 Albert Street, be added to the List of Historical Resources, pursuant to section 8(4) of the Historical By-law 55/2014, with the following character defining elements:

Exterior:

- One storey, north facing structure with sloping tiled roof located at the south end of a pie-shaped open lot formed by the meeting of Albert and Arthur Streets; and

- Original light fixture housing in soffits on north side

Interior:

- None

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: Addition to the List of Historical Resources, 98 Albert Street, Reliable Service Station

Critical Path: Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO
R. Zanewich/Acting Mgr.	J. Kiernan	N/A	D. McNeil

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommends that the building at 98 Albert Street be added to the List of Historical Resources with the protected Character-Defining Elements as noted because of the building's historical and architectural significance and the heritage value that it embodies.

Prior to the meeting of the HBRC, the owners of the building provided a written submission stating their preference for the building to be added to the Commemorative List (See Appendix B).

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add 98 Albert Street, Reliable Service Station, to the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 be approved, with the following Character-Defining Elements:

   A. Exterior:
      i. One storey, north facing structure with sloping tiled roof located at the south end of a pie-shaped open lot formed by the meeting of Albert and Arthur streets; and
      ii. Original light fixture housing in soffits on north side

   B. Interior:
      i. None.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

REASON FOR THE REPORT

The building at 98 Albert Street was on the Inventory of Buildings under the former Historical Buildings By-law 1474/77, and pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 8(4), it was deemed Nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources on the date that the new Historical Resources By-law 55/2014 came into effect.

Subject to this nomination, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) reviewed this resource and, on October 20, 2016, recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage, and Downtown Development (SPC on PDHDD) that it be added to the List of Historical Resources because of its outstanding architectural and historical significance and the heritage values that it embodies.

Pursuant to the provisions of the Historical Resource By-law 55/2014 section 17, subject to requests for postponements by the owner, the SPD on PDHDD must consider the recommendations from the HBRC within 90 days after receiving the recommendations. The Director is authorized to provide a report with respect to the nomination for consideration by the SPC on PDHDD at the time it considers the recommendations of the HBRC.

As per section 27(3), the SPC on PDHDD must consider whether the resource continues to embody heritage values sufficient to justify its continued inclusion on the List, and if applicable, the hazard posed by the resource and may, in addition, consider the economic viability of conserving the resource using the following criteria from section 18(2):

a. The condition of the resource;

b. The costs of the continued repair and maintenance of the resource;

c. The importance and value derived from the conservation or continued conservation of the resource;

d. The efforts that have been made by the owner to date to conserve the resource; and

e. The merits of alternative proposals for the resource or the site on which it is located, other than conserving the resource by adding it to the List.

As per section 20(1), the determinations of the SPC on PDHDD concerning a nomination are recommendations to Council that must be considered by Council within 60 days of the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations were made.

As per section 20(3), after considering the recommendations of the HBRC and the SPC on PDHDD, together with the recommendations made by the Executive Policy Committee, Council may add or decline to add the buildings to the List of Historical Resources.

As per section 21(1 and 2), the determinations of the SPC on PDHDD are deemed to be final decisions that are not to be considered by Council and may not be appealed if:

a) They are identical to the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee; and

b) The owner does not formally oppose the recommendations

The owner is deemed not to oppose the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee if he or she neither:

a) Appears in person or by agent at the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations are considered to advise of his or her opposition; nor

b) Advises the City Clerk in writing of his or her opposition to the recommendations of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee prior to the meeting of the SPC on PDHDD at which the recommendations are considered.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

98 Albert Street, Reliable Service Station, will be added to the List of Historical Resources:

- A Historic Property Notice (caveat) will be filed against the title of the building with the Winnipeg Land Titles Office of the Property Registry as per City of Winnipeg Charter Section 157.1(3) in order to notify the owner and potential purchasers that the property is identified on the List of Historical Resources, and as such is subject to the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- Any alterations to the Character-Defining Elements will require approval under a Heritage Permit as per the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- The resource will not be able to be demolished.
- The resource will be made eligible for heritage grants and incentive programs issued under the Province of Manitoba and the City of Winnipeg, and will be viewed favourably by other heritage granting agencies.
- Effective October 1, 2016, if the listed resource is vacant and unless an owner provides evidence that the listed resource was not built using shallow foundations as defined by the Manitoba Building Code, the basement or crawlspace of the resource must be heated to a temperature of 10 degrees Celsius so as to prevent undue shifting, heaving or “frost-jacking” of the listed resource.

HISTORY/DISCUSSION

As a part of the nomination process, a historical report on the building was prepared, and on August 21, 2014, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee toured this building in order to identify the proposed Character-Defining Elements of the resource that should be protected.

The building at 98 Albert Street is deemed to embody heritage values attributed to the following:

1. its age, 1925, makes it a rare post-World War I structure in the warehouse district and one of only a handful of automobile service stations in the area;
2. its architect/contractor was Boland Brothers, a long-standing local construction firm;
3. its design, materials and construction methods are all good examples of the period;
4. it is located in the heart of the Exchange District National Historic Site at the south end of an unusually shaped lot that had historically included open space to its north; and
5. some of its original exterior features and finishes are intact.

On October 20, 2016, the HBRC recommended to the SPC on PDHDD that this building be added to the List of Historical Resources because it embodies heritage values of widespread importance to the Exchange District National Historic Site (EDNHS) and because of its architectural and historical significance (see Appendix A).

Prior to the meeting of the HBRC, the owners of the building provided a written submission stating their preference for the building to be added to the Commemorative List. (see Appendix B). Inclusion of a resource on the Commemorative List is intended solely to recognize significant historical and architectural resources and to encourage their conservation. It does not restrict the owner of the resource from developing or demolishing the resource.

The Public Service is taking action to conserve architecturally and historically significant buildings within the Exchange District National Historic Site (EDNHS). Out of over 130 buildings that are nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources, 32 of these are within the EDNHS boundary (Appendix C).

For more information, please see Appendix A for a History of 98 Albert Street, Reliable Service Station.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement

Date: October 27, 2016

Project Name:

Additions to the List of Historical Resources, 98 Albert Street

COMMENTS:

That the Standing Policy Committee on Property & Development, Heritage, and Downtown Development concur with the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to add 98 Albert Street to the List of Historical Resources.

There are no financial implications associated with this recommendation.

"Original Signed By"
Mike McGinn, CPA, CA
Manager of Finance

CONSULTATION

Historical Buildings and Resources Committee

OURWINNIPEG POLICY ALIGNMENT

The recommendation to add 98 Albert Street to the List of Historical Resources aligns with policies under OurWinnipeg Section 02 A Sustainable City, 02-3 Heritage:

"Winnipeg has a rich and complex history. Our heritage resources are inseparably tied to our culture, identity, cultural perspective, collective consciousness and sense of place. In Winnipeg, heritage resources support and represented by a distinct mix of cultures, ideas and values. This facet of our identity provides us with variety in neighbourhood design and architecture, expresses various social values, and provides an invaluable legacy of resources that are distinctly our own.

The conservation and reuse of existing buildings can also align with numerous sustainability objectives such as waste minimization, natural resource protection and compact urban form.

Direction 2: Conserve, protect and celebrate the significant heritage resources that illustrate the broad range of Winnipeg's heritage values.

- Recognize the importance of a broad range of tangible heritage resources throughout the city that illustrate a unique sense of place and community pride.
- Identify, designate, and protect the City's most significant heritage resources.

Direction 3: Provide leadership in heritage conservation that links to broader civic goals of economic development, sustainability and neighbourhood planning.

- Strive to link heritage conservation to sustainable development initiatives, including economic, environmental and social initiatives.
- Work with other governments, community groups, and building owners to conserve heritage resources.

Direction 4: Conserve downtown's rich legacy of heritage resources that provide significant and sustainable development opportunities.

- Work with downtown community stakeholders to identify and support key projects and heritage conservation initiatives that encourage and support downtown living, and facilitate strategic economic and cultural initiatives.

Direction 5: Enhance the viability of the Exchange District National Historic Site.

- Collaborate on the development of a renewed vision for the Exchange District as a vibrant area of conserved heritage that is an exciting place to live, work and visit.

Direction 6: Plan for the sustainable development of healthy neighbourhoods based on their particular historic identity and character.

- Work with community stakeholders to identify unique identities and neighbourhood legacy elements.
- Encourage the sustainable reuse of existing building stock and historic infrastructure."

SUBMITTED BY

Department:	Planning, Property and Development
Division:	Urban Design
Prepared by:	R. Ricci
Date:	November 1, 2016
File No.:	O:\Reports Directive\Planning and Land Use\Heritage\2016 Reports\Addition to the List of Historical Resources- 98 Albert.doc

Appendix A

Reliable Service Station, 98 Albert Street



One of the Exchange District's most unusual buildings due to its original use and location is the Reliable Service Station which has occupied part of its pie-shaped lot for many decades in the heart of Winnipeg's Exchange District National Historic Site. The lot, formed by the convergence of Albert and Arthur Streets, ends in a point at Bannatyne Avenue and has been home to a number of different businesses starting in the mid-1890s when small residential structures were built at the south end of the property. This followed an established trend that had seen the entire area develop as a residential neighbourhood, with single family dwellings, duplexes and terraces built in the late 1870s and 1880s.

Some of the residential properties on this block were converted into commercial space by the late 1890s and in 1901, this entire block underwent significant change, with the construction along McDermot Avenue of the Alexandra Block (which became the Mariaggi Hotel) in 1901 and to the north, the Schmidt Foundry Building, 90 Albert Street, also in 1901. Both structures were substantial brick buildings and were part of the evolution of the region from a residential neighbourhood to a warehouse/commercial district.

Closer to Bannatyne Avenue, a long, one-storey brick commercial building was completed facing Albert Street and filled with a number of retail tenants. During World War I, this building was purchased by Frank Watson, owner of the Watson Tire Company and converted into an automobile tire retail and repair shop. By 1922 the Reliable Station had expanded into most of the building and sought to build more modern premises on the site. The 1901 block was demolished in favour of a new gas station and service garage, the Reliable Service Station, which opened in 1925 backing onto the Schmidt Foundry Building and featuring a pair of gasoline pumps and a small patch of grass with signage at Bannatyne Avenue.

The station was designed and built by local contractors Boland Brothers. The three brothers, Charles F., William F. and James M., had taken over the construction company in 1908 which their father, James R. Boland, had founded in 1878. They were a small-scale company that incorporated in 1928 and were advertising themselves in the 1930s and 1940s as house and machinery movers, foundation repair experts and used building materials dealers. The company still operated locally in the late 1970s.

The station itself is a one-storey building that originally included two windows on the east side, a series of five windows and two doors on the front (north) façade and a large vehicle entrance at the south end of the north façade. Electric lights were placed in the wooden soffits along the front façade below the overhanging tile roof. This original design has been altered over the years, as the tenancy and use of the building has changed. The east façade still features two large windows but the front includes only one doorway and the west elevation features a large window and no other opening. Some of the original lighting remains along the front façade. It is unknown from documentation and photographs if the stucco cladding is original or a later addition.

According to the original plans, the solid brick structure measured 6.1 metres on Arthur Street, 6.7 metres on Albert Street, 13.7 metres on its front (north) façade and 16.5 metres on the rear (south). Exterior walls were all 30.5 centimetres solid brick, interior tile walls were 15.2 centimetres thick. The south wall is actually that of the neighbouring building, 90 Albert Street. The ceilings were 2.7 metres high and the reinforced concrete slab floor was 15.2 centimetres thick. Red brick was used to cap the roof and window sills.

The Reliable Service Station operated at the location for many decades and in the 1930s, A. Hicks was listed as the proprietor. By the late 1930s, Karl Norek was listed as the owner of the property and the business, which operated until the early 1970s. The next tenant of the building was the State Window and Building Cleaning Company, founded by Gregory "Roy" Royko after World War II. This business remained in the

building until the 1980s when it was converted into a restaurant with an outdoor patio and has been an important part of the Exchange District and Old Market Square redevelopment.

Building in Context over Time



Looking south along Arthur Street from Bannatyne Avenue, 1926
98 Albert Street (#1 - Nominated), 335 Main Street (#3 – Listed)



Looking north along Albert Street near McDermot Avenue, 2015.
98 Albert Street (#1 - Nominated), 90 Albert Street (#2 – Listed), 100 Arthur Street (#3 - Listed), 211 Bannatyne Avenue (#4, Listed) , 466 Main Street/93 Albert Street (#5 – Listed), 91 Albert Street (#6 – Listed)

Appendix B
Written Submission by Owner, prior to the HBRC Meeting

Winnipeg

Planning, Property & Development Department • Service de l'urbanisme, des biens et de l'aménagement

Planning and Land Use Division • Division de l'urbanisme et de l'usage des sols

In reply please refer to / Référence à rappeler :

Rina Ricci
Tel. : 204-986-4722
Fax / Téléc. : 204-986-3045
email: rricci@winnipeg.ca

WRITTEN SUBMISSION

Concerning the Nomination to be added to the List of Historical Resources

Building Name and Address: **Reliable Service Station, 98 ALBERT ST**

Building Owner (please print): 7366052 Manitoba Ltd

Building Owner (signed): [signature], President

Date: October 6, 2016

Evaluation Date: **Thursday, October 20, 2016 at 3:00 pm**

Please mark appropriate line with an (X):

_____ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the List of Historical Resources

__X__ I prefer that the building cited above be added to the Commemorative List

_____ I prefer that the building cited above have no heritage status

Comments (continue on reverse if necessary):

Please see attached.

7366052 Manitoba Ltd.

[redacted]

Historic Buildings and Resources Committee
City of Winnipeg
Attn: Ms. Rina Ricci, Heritage Planner

Dear Committee Members,

Re: Notice of Evaluation to List as a Historical Resource: Reliable Service Station, 98 Albert St. dated September 9, 2016

We would like to take this opportunity to voice our position on the historic status of 98 Albert St., Winnipeg, Manitoba. We have reviewed the May 2014 report entitled "98 Albert Street - Reliable Service Station".

It is our understanding that the property is nominated for heritage status and can either be included in the Commemorative List or added to the protected building inventory on the List of Historical Resources. We propose that the building and site to be included on the Commemorative List.
We feel that there are important factors that should guide the decision to either commemorate or add the property to the protected inventory.

1) Period Considerations
The report's title and content focuses on the period of approximately 50 years when the property was a service station from 1925 to the 1970s.

a. We question the choice of this period as the focus of the report. Several building configurations have been documented on the site starting prior to 1895. This includes a variety of businesses before and after the service station period.

b. Prior to the period of use as a service station, the site was occupied by small-scale storefront businesses in both one-storey and two-story buildings extending close to the north end of the site (see Plates 5 and 6[1] - photos from 1905 and 1910).

It seems at odds with the site's history to focus the report and its decision on the service station period. We urge the Committee to consider the varying configurations during the past 120 years.

2) Massing and open space
Currently, north of the one-storey building is a pie-shaped area enclosed by a mostly transparent barrier of glass with steel posts approximately four feet high. This area is partially opened and used for surface vehicle parking in winter months and is enclosed for outdoor restaurant dining during the summer months. In the 1980s and 1990s a more solid wooden fence enclosed the space (see Plates 21 and 22[1] – photos from 1984 and 1999)

In ca. 1895 the site's massing included one or two two-storey buildings and limited open space (see Plate 3[1] - photo from ca. 1895). By 1905, a combination of one and two-storey buildings occupied

[1] References to Plates are from Peterson, M., (May 2014), "98 Albert Street - Reliable Service Station", City of Winnipeg

most of the site up to near the point of the pie-shaped property. Numerous small businesses operated on the site until 1925, when it was reconfigured and a service station then operated for approximately 50 years.

a. We feel that the open pie-shaped space should not be considered a historical resource because it has had significant use as a site for buildings in addition to its current use as a surface parking lot/enclosed patio. We propose that it be commemorated.

b. The proposed selection of current massing and open areas on the site as historical resources seems arbitrary to us. Historical massing has included the present small, one-storey structure and at other times has included larger structures.

c. The report states that several examples of small-scale retail structures with the main architectural feature being a shallow tile roof are extant in Winnipeg, which implies there are other opportunities to preserve such examples.

d. Since 1925, the open area in front of the building has been used for either vehicular traffic or servicing or restricted for the sole use of the building occupancy, including current seasonal surface parking. It is unclear from the report what history and motivations have guided the recommendation to protect the massing and open area of the current one-storey building and open pie-shaped space in front.

In light of the many historical configurations and site uses, we suggest that the Committee's consideration should include more than simply the one with a small building and open space.

With reference to the character-defining elements "original light fixture housing in soffits on north side" proposed for listing as a Historical Resource, we note that not all of the housings in the soffits on the north side are original; one or more appear to be new electrical housings (see photo attached). We propose that the light fixture housings be added to the Commemorative List.

We ask that the Committee consider these factors in deciding whether to commemorate the building and site or to place them in the protected list as a historical resource. We believe that the report is unclear as to how it addresses the uses prior to 1925 and the current restricted (and occupant-driven) uses. We feel that it is confusing as to what is guiding the Committee's decision in this regard.

We believe that it is more appropriate to recognize that the site has transformed many times in the past 120 years and that it is hard to pinpoint the significance of the current building and site. For this reason, we request the Committee include the building and site on the Commemorative List rather than add it to the List of Historical Resources (protected in its current state). This will allow the site to be transformed once again into a vibrant contributor to the fabric and history of the Exchange District.

Sincerely,
7366052 Manitoba Ltd.



John Knowles, President



Kathryn Knowles, Vice-President

Appendix C

Buildings within the EDHNS that were deemed nominated to be added to the List of Historical Resources on June 1, 2014

	Name	Address	Date of Construction
1	Albert Street Burger	58 Albert Street	1921
2	Former Reliable Service Station	98 Albert Street	1901
3	Anne (Blue Ribbon) Building	88 Arthur Street	1901
4	Former Ryan Bros. Building	110 James Avenue	1910
5	Former De Laval Co. Warehouse	128 James Avenue	1912
6	Burrows, Stewart & Milne Company Warehouse	130 James Avenue	1910
7	Former Richards & Brown Warehouse	132 James Avenue	1911
8	Carruthers Building	124 King Street	1916
9	Former Crane & Ordway Building	93 Lombard Avenue	1906
10	Former Great West Life Annex (Bailey's)	185 Lombard Avenue	1900
11	Wheat Pool Building	423 Main Street	1928
12	Duffin Block	474 Main Street	1881
13	Former Ashdown's Store Annex	480 Main Street	1951
14	Former Leckie Building	216 McDermot Avenue	1900
15	Silvester & Willson Building	222 McDermot Avenue	1904
16	Former A. MacDonald Co. Warehouse	133 Market Avenue	1910
17	Former Steele Briggs Building	139 Market Avenue	1912
18	Former Stanley Brock Building	145 Market Avenue	1916
19	Christie Building	245 Notre Dame Avenue	1906
20	Former Del Block Annex	54 Princess Street	1905
21	Former Winnipeg Hydro Showroom	55 Princess Street	1919
22	Former Del Block	62 Princess Street	1904
23	Former Bole Drug Co. Building	70 Princess Street	1903
24	Deer & Almond Restaurant	85 Princess Street	1959
25	Former Kilgour-Rimer Building	87 Princess Street	1901
26	Former G.F. Galt Block	103 Princess Street	1887
27	Carnefac Building	188 Princess Street	1901
28	Former Toronto Hide & Wool Co. Building	200 Princess Street	1893
29	Maw Block	280 William Avenue	1907
30	Former Winnipeg Saddlery Block	284 William Avenue	1903
31	Soudack Building	288 William Avenue	1947
32	Former Tees & Persse Warehouse	315 William Avenue	1905