Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – May 7, 2019

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – April 23, 2019

Item No. 5 Identifying and Prioritizing Heritage Conservation Districts

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

The Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development and submitted the following to Council:

1. That the report be received as information.

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – April 23, 2019

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Councillor Mayes,

That the recommendation of the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development be concurred in and forwarded to Council.

Carried

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On April 23, 2019, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the matter to the Executive Policy Committee and Council.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: Identifying and Prioritizing Heritage Conservation Districts

Critical Path: Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO
B. Smith	J. Kiernan	N/A	D. McNeil

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Per the Council motion from September 2018, the Public Service has developed further consideration on the role of Heritage Conservation Districts (HCDs), when and where they would be applicable and how they fit into the suite of other planning tools communities have at their disposal. As the OurWinnipeg review continues, language is being crafted that links the role of HCDs with higher level goals for the City and its communities. A forthcoming Heritage Conservation Management Plan will house additional policy for heritage evaluation. Based on draft policy direction and a review of HCD in other cities, the primary considerations should be:

- what narratives or themes about the history of Winnipeg are embodied in the district;
- when the neighbourhood was laid out and established;
- age of building stock and other built features;
- the degree to which heritage attributes remain intact;
- the risk of imminent loss of those attributes;
- the presence of properties on the City's List of Historical Resources or Commemorative list;
- the interest and capacity of property owners to participate in HCD planning; and
- how well the boundary is defined and agreed upon by stakeholders.

RECOMMENDATIONS

That this report be received as information.

REASON FOR THE REPORT

On September 4, 2018, Council adopted the Heritage Conservation Districts By-law No. 87/2018 and directed the Public Service to explore processes for identifying and prioritizing potential Heritage Conservation Districts, including the *OurWinnipeg* and *Complete Communities* review process, and report back to the Council within 180 days.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

There are no implications to receiving this report as information. As a next step, the Public Service will explore three potential candidates for the next Heritage Conservation District –

- Crescentwood
- the Exchange District
- Point Douglas

Other applications for nomination (from other areas of the City) received in accordance with the HCD By-law would be considered using the criteria described in this report and may be accepted where financial and staff resources are in place to meet the requirements outlined in the By-law.

HISTORY/DISCUSSION

What is a Heritage Conservation District?

HCDs are prevalent nationally and internationally, existing in jurisdictions big and small for over four decades. While they vary from city to city, commonalities include community input and support, value-based conservation approaches, and protection of the District's unique look and feel via formal planning documents. They include various types of properties, including private and public elements, and are generally tailored to owners' desired levels of control.

A District is implemented via policies and guidelines that pertain to the protection of the heritage elements the community has identified as significant. Usually this is the overall look and feel of the District.

HCD's have implications on the everyday life of the residents, but also create a certainty for development. Much like many new developments, there are guidelines to adhere to in terms of what can be built and how it should look, although not as prescriptive. In general, HCDs will not create increases in property taxes or insurance rates, but can create small rises in property values due to the certainty created by the guidelines.

Because each Plan and HCD are specific to a geographic area and created via the input of owners and residents, each Plan and HCD will be different. However, most HCDs share the following:

- Requirement for a formal study demonstrating how/why an area merits HCD designation;
- Community consultation - needs to be for the community, by the community;
- A clear outline of the boundaries of the HCD;
- A Plan containing policies and design guidelines to assist in the management of the District's character and attributes;
- Guidelines outlining what kind of work/development requires Heritage Permits, and how to apply (usually for exterior alterations, landscape and streetscape design);
- Policies on demolitions; and
- Guidelines to accommodate infill in a context-sensitive manner.

Benefits of a Heritage Conservation District

- Protection and conservation of an area's special and distinct heritage resources;
- Revitalization of an area;
- Potential for economic spin offs and tourism generation;
- Enhancement of community identity, pride and involvement;
- Community sense of place and unique identity; and
- A legacy for future generations.

What a Heritage Conservation District Does Not Do

- An HCD is not intended to regulate land use (for example, conversion of a property to a duplex or multi-unit dwelling or institutional use would go through the standard zoning approval process);
- An HCD does not take the place of a Historical Resources listing for protecting individual buildings of outstanding historic and architectural merit; and
- An HCD does not prohibit demolitions, but rather it places an extra layer of review on any demolition application. The heritage review and permitting process helps review demolition permit applications in the context of the overall character of the neighbourhood.

When is a Heritage Conservation District the Right Approach?

An HCD is one planning tool in the toolbox and may not be suitable for all older neighbourhoods. Secondary plans may be more appropriate for managing changes in land use or density. Design guidelines on their own can be used to achieve better consistency in exterior renovations, additions or new infill development. An HCD helps identify neighbourhood-specific design elements or attributes that characterize the area and illustrate one or more historical themes as outlined in the draft thematic framework for heritage conservation (Attachment 1). Neighbourhoods that represent multiple themes (typically the oldest neighbourhoods) would be a higher priority for heritage conservation. Other criteria for evaluating an HCD nomination would include:

- when the neighbourhood was laid out and established;
- age of building stock and other built features;
- the degree to which historical attributes remain intact;
- the risk of imminent loss of those attributes;
- the presence of properties on the City's List of Historical Resources or Commemorative list;
- the interest and capacity of property owners to participate in HCD planning;
- how well the boundary is defined and agreed upon by stakeholders.

Heritage Conservation Districts in the Context of OurWinnipeg

Updates to OurWinnipeg (in progress) will include policy that links the role of HCD with the goal of fostering healthy neighbourhoods based on their particular historic identity and character. OurWinnipeg is also expected to enable preparation of a Heritage Conservation Management Plan, which will house additional policy and the full thematic framework for heritage conservation.

Resource Implications

For the development of an HCD Study and Plan, the timeframe for designations for any new Heritage Conservation District would be two-years at minimum. This timeline would allow for adequate community consultation, including formal notification mailouts required by the By-law. Preparation of the required documents (the Study and Plan) would be expected to be done as consultant assignments. The anticipated budget for this work, assuming consultant participation in community engagement, would be between $50,000 to $100,000. Where a community group makes the application for nomination, that group would bear the cost for the HCD Study. There are also costs associated with placing caveats on properties (approximately $130/property). With existing staff resources in Planning, Property and Development, only one HCD project could be administered at any one time.

Next Steps

1. Crescentwood –

   On November 19, 2018, Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development directed the Director of Planning, Property and Development to consider the nomination of the proposed Crescentwood Heritage Conservation District. The Public Service would propose to meet with the proponents in Crescentwood to discuss the objectives for a nomination and the level of community interest. City staff can provide an overview of the role of heritage conservation districts and determine expectations around resourcing and timelines.

2. Exchange District –
   There is also some interest in an Exchange District HCD, although the business community and area residents would still need to be consulted to determine overall interest. Based on the criteria bulleted above, the Exchange District would appear to make sense as a high priority. There are, of course, a large number of buildings already protected under the Historical Resources By-law. An HCD would provide guidance on new buildings, change to non-listed buildings and streetscape standards with the intent of creating a cohesive look and feel for the Exchange District National Historic Site area. The Public Service would propose to engage with the Exchange BIZ and Residents of the Exchange District (R:ED) community group as a first step.

3. Point Douglas –
   Stakeholders in Point Douglas have inquired about a potential HCD. Further analysis and discussion with area stakeholders is warranted. Point Douglas emerged around Fort Douglas in the early 19th century and is considered Winnipeg's first non-indigenous residential neighbourhood. North Point Douglas has seen increased infill activity and South Point Douglas is expected to shift away from heavy industrial uses. A number of historic elements still remain in the area.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement

Date: February 26, 2019

Project Name:

Identifying and Prioritizing Heritage Conservation Districts

COMMENTS:

There are no financial implications associated with this report.

"Original Signed By"
Mike McGinn, CPA, CA
Manager of Finance

CONSULTATION

This Report has been prepared in consultation with:
N/A

OURWINNIPEG POLICY ALIGNMENT

The following Directions from the City of Winnipeg's Municipal Development Plan, OurWinnipeg, support the creation of Heritage Conservation Districts:

Section 02-3 Heritage
Direction 2: Conserve, protect and celebrate the significant heritage resources that illustrate the broad range of Winnipeg's heritage values.

- Recognize the importance of a broad range of tangible and intangible heritage resources throughout the city that illustrate a unique sense of place and community pride.
- Identify, designate and protect the City's most significant heritage resources using a Historic Context Statement and a Thematic Framework for evaluation.

Direction 3: Provide leadership in heritage conservation that links to broader civic goals of economic development, sustainability and neighbourhood planning.

- Work with other governments, community groups and building owners to conserve significant heritage resources.
- Develop heritage stewardship policies that will allow the City to act as a leader in heritage conservation initiatives.
- Engage the community in developing long-term heritage resource stewardship strategies.
- Work with heritage stakeholders and other community partners in the establishment, coordination and promotion of community heritage initiatives including public education and heritage awareness.

Direction 6: Plan for the sustainable development of healthy neighbourhoods based on their particular historic identity and character.

- Work with community stakeholders to identify unique heritage identities and neighborhood legacy elements.
- Include heritage values when developing plans for new and existing neighbourhoods.
- Encourage the sustainable reuse of existing building stock and historic infrastructure.

Complete Communities also supports the concept of Heritage Districts.

Section 13 Heritage Conservation: Key Direction: Support the ongoing sustainable development of Winnipeg's urban structure through heritage conservation initiatives that assist in the development of a Complete Community.

SUBMITTED BY

Department: Planning, Property and Development
Division: Urban Planning & Design
Prepared by: Kurtis Kowalke, Principal Planner
Date: February 27, 2019

Attachment A – WINNIPEG HISTORICAL THEMATIC FRAMEWORK

1. Indigenous settlement

- *Original occupation*

  The movement of humans into the region as the last glaciers receded led to the populating of the area and the formation of distinct cultural/linguistic groups.

- *Archaeological sites*

  Important archaeological sites for Indigenous peoples are found along all the rivers because of settlement along the riverbanks at various times throughout the year.

- *The Numbered Treaties*

  The signing of these legal agreements between two sovereign nations, beginning with Treaty No. 1 signed on August 3, 1871 at Lower Fort Garry, created a framework for the transfer of land rights from the Indigenous occupants to the Government of Canada, paving the way for European settlement.

- *Métis*

  The combination of First Nations and European cultures through marriage created the Métis people, crucial to the creation of the Province of Manitoba.

2. Location- The Gateway City

- *Fur trade*

  The availability of natural resources prompted European-based companies to explore, build commercial relationships and ultimately settle the region.

- *Pioneer families*

  Families like McDermot, Bannatyne and Ross translated early commercial success into vast fortunes and economic and political influence.

- *Warehousing – The Freight Rate Deal*

  Recognizing the importance of exploiting their continental location, Winnipeg's political and business leaders negotiated a favourable deal with the Canadian Pacific Railway that guaranteed the growth and success of the warehouse sector.

- *Immigration*

  From fur traders from the British Isles in the 18th century to the mass migration of people from Europe in the late 19th and early 20th century, Winnipeg's immigration population was a prime agent of change, not only in its North End but throughout the City.

- *Banks*

  The financial sector, with capital from Eastern Canada, the United States and especially England, bankrolled the expansion of the West and the establishment of the agriculture economy.

– *Headquarters/Regional Centre*

As Western Canada's premier city from the 1880s to World War I, Winnipeg was home to hundreds of head and regional offices. Many Eastern Canadian, American and International companies chose the city as its western headquarters.

– *Hotels*

The transient nature of the early population, the lack of alternative housing and the rapid growth of extensive business connections with Eastern Canada and the United States supported the development of dozens of small, medium and large hotels throughout the city. The hotels' restaurant and bar were well supported by short-term and long-term guests.

– *Labour and unrest*

The sometimes uneasy relationship between labour and business saw expression in various forms throughout Winnipeg's history, the most dramatic being the 1919 General Strike.

3. Transportation Hub

– *Rivers*

The confluence of the Red and Assiniboine Rivers – The Forks – has been an important meeting place for centuries and the rivers and creeks have been important communication lines and sources of food and fuel. Ferries connected settlements on both sides of the river and later, riverboats transported goods and people from the south until they were replaced by railroads.

– *Main Street and Portage Avenue*

What began as simple prairie paths and Red River cart trails connecting trading posts grew into the modern streets and avenues pushing outward from the downtown, connecting the developed areas that had evolved from Rural Municipalities to towns and cities that would ultimately become part of Greater Winnipeg.

– *The Railroads*

Winnipeg was the undisputed hub of railway transportation in Canada by the early 20th century. Regional, international and transcontinental lines had terminal facilities in Winnipeg, which included many kilometres of downtown spur lines to facilitate the movement of boxcars to and from the warehouses.

– *Warehousing & freighting*

The Exchange District National Historic Site features blocks of intact warehouse buildings mostly dating from the 1880-1920 period when the city's warehouse and freighting functions were at their height. The District housed companies from across the continent distributing every description of manufactured goods from around the world.

– *Power supply and generation*

The supplying of electric power to Winnipeg customers began in the 1870s and expanded because of the heightened use of electric street cars in the 1880s. The production of

electrical power began in 1906 at Pinawa (private company) and Pointe du Bois in 1911 (City Hydro). The expansion of services meant an increase in infrastructure throughout the city, even after electric streetcars ceased to exist (1955).

– *Aviation*

The bush pilots of the 1920s gave way to commercial airlines of the 1930s, using an airfield in the Rural Municipality of St. James named Stevenson Field. Canada's first national airline, Trans-Canada Air Lines, was headquartered in Winnipeg when it was founded in 1936. World War II greatly increased the use of the airfield and this facility has continued to modernize and expand, keeping pace with the airline industry.

4. Building the Modern City

– *Indigenous settlement*

Seasonal settlement allowed the Indigenous population greater yearly flexibility depending on the availability of fuel and food.

– *Surveying the River Lots*

The long, narrow river lots that formed the basis of early agrarian settlement patterns for Métis and European families along the Red and Assiniboine rivers translated into today's unusual street patterns in downtown Winnipeg and beyond.

– *Logs and stones*

Using the skills brought from the Old Country, log and stone buildings provided residential, commercial and spiritual space for the newly arriving European population.

– *Boom town – 1880s*

The coming of the Canadian Pacific Railway in the early 1880s brought not only people but construction material which led to a greater variety and number of structures. This real estate boom also permanently established districts in the downtown – warehouse, commercial, political and residential.

– *Chicago of the North – 1900-1915*

Very few cities on earth grew at a faster pace than Winnipeg did in the 1900 to 1915 period. The city's desire to replicate the growth of the mid-western giant to the south produced Winnipeg's nickname – Chicago of the North. This rapid and wide-spread expansion had far-reaching and not always positive impacts on Winnipeg's society but much of modern Winnipeg is built on the foundation laid during this time.

– *Local materials*

Architects and contractors profited from the growth and development of local building materials, especially Manitoba-made brick and quarried limestone from Tyndall and Garson, Manitoba.

– *Mid-Century buildings & City Planning – 1950-1980*

A number of factors, local, regional, national and international, combined to give Winnipeg's development added impetus after World War II. This translated into some of the most

original and innovative responses – from architecturally significant buildings to an adoption of tenets of modern city planning.

5. Municipal Government to Unicity (From Many to One)

- *Hudson's Bay Company*

  The Hudson's Bay Company, already asserting economic control of the region, had assumed administrative control by the early 19th century. This political control lasted until shortly after the creation of the Dominion of Canada.

- *Provincial status*

  The Dominion of Canada's assumption of control of Western Canada was met with anger and opposition, leading to armed revolt and the negotiation of more favourable terms for the citizens of the new Province of Manitoba.

- *Local governments & municipalities*

  Each government in the municipalities that surrounded the City of Winnipeg felt an increased demand for services within their own boundaries. Police and fire departments, the Winnipeg Aqueduct, the high pressure water system, sewers, roads and bridges, waste removal, power and telecommunications were some of these provided services.

- *Unicity Experiment*

  By the late 1950s, the City of Winnipeg was surrounded by 11 distinct districts: the Rural Municipalities of Charleswood, North Kildonan, Old Kildonan and Fort Garry, the cities of St. James-Assiniboine, St. Boniface, St. Vital, West Kildonan, East Kildonan and Transcona and the Town of Tuxedo. In an effort to foster better planning and area-wide development and growth, the provincial government created the Metropolitan Corporation of Greater Winnipeg or "Metro" to share common services – the second such civic government organization in Canada. It was the foundation of the 1971 City of Winnipeg Act – Unicity – which incorporated all 13 entities as the new City of Winnipeg.

- *Our many Main Streets*

  The surrounding communities developed their own unique commercial centre along a major thoroughfare. Buildings along Provencher Boulevard, Henderson Highway, Portage Avenue, Regent Avenue, Main Street, St. Mary's Road and others are reminders of this localized development of the early 20th century.

6. Art and Society

- *Rise of the Performing Arts*

  Before World War I Winnipeggers could see the world's most famous performers at the Walker Theatre or Pantages or see day-long Vaudeville performances at a number of smaller venues. Winnipeg's extensive history of live performing venues has grown to include iconic facilities like the Civic Auditorium, Rainbow Stage and Royal Manitoba Theatre Centre and produced internationally noted performers. The Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra and Royal Winnipeg Ballet are also important aspects of this history.

- *Movies*

  Like the live stage, movie theatres enjoyed wide-spread popularity whether it was at the small moving picture houses along Main Street or the grand and gaudy movie palaces downtown.

- *Museums & art galleries*

  There has always been strong support for fine arts in the city and art galleries in their various forms are now housed in one of the city's most iconic buildings on Memorial Boulevard. Museums, artefact collections and document archives (both private and public), have long been an important part of the fabric of Winnipeg's society.

- *Religious institutions*

  The spread of organized religion in Western Canada most often began in Winnipeg. With its diverse population, Winnipeg has been home to a wide array of Christian and non-Christian congregations and their religious structures.

- *Growth of Social Conscience and the Poor*

  The darker side of Winnipeg's heightened economic growth and increased population of the early 20th century was the rise in poor, especially among the immigrant inhabitants. City Council and organizations like the Kindergarten Settlement Association, All People's Mission, Associated Charities and others, and leaders like J.S. Woodsworth and Margaret Scott worked with families to better their lives through education and social services.

- *Sports and Recreation*

  Amateur and professional sports have always been an important part of Winnipeg's culture, and facilities have grown and development to meet the demands for modern venues. Community Clubs, scattered throughout Winnipeg and its surrounding municipalities, offered important centres for strengthening neighbourhood bonds.

- *Hospitals*

  Winnipeg General Hospital opened in 1872 to deal with the growing typhoid epidemic caused by the use of polluted river water by most Winnipeggers. This collection of small, unremarkable buildings grew into today's Health Sciences Centre. It and other health facilities throughout the city have grown into our modern health care system.

- *Media*

  Winnipeg was long considered a leader in many aspects of media – newspaper row on McDermot Avenue became a mecca for the printed word. Local publishers, with the help of printers and typesetters and photography studios, produced publications available across the country. The rise of radio and television also had local implications.

- *Libraries*

  The Red River Library was created from the private collections of Selkirk Settlers, and Lord Selkirk himself, in 1848. This was the beginnings of the public library system that has heavily invested in the education of Winnipeggers.

- *Parks*

  Winnipeg's Public Parks Board was established in 1893 to oversee the development of public green spaces throughout the city. What has developed is a series of renowned parks with a variety of resources supporting many activities.

- *Tourism*

  A growing part of the local economy has seen a number of initiatives meant to highlight Winnipeg's unique and attractive features to global visitors.

- *Education – private and public and post-secondary*

  Whether the early, church-based system or the public system transplanted from Ontario, Winnipeg has possessed a highly regarded education system, including some of the finest school buildings of their time, including colleges and universities.

- *Environmentalism*

  The growing awareness of the need for environmental stewardship has heightened citizens' appreciation of environmental issues and shaped the decision-making and planning processes for the city.