PLAN B: An Acceptable Solution for the Six City-Owned Museums

INTRODUCTION

The following document enumerates the Clerk's Department 10 recent recommendations tabled as part of a report to the Standing Policy on Protection, Parks and Community Services (SPC) on November 14, 2019, and a new "PLAN B" meant to articulate a better way forward (in lieu of a Special Operating Agency model) that is acceptable to the six City-owned museums, and is in keeping with the spirit and intent of the Mayor's Task Force on Heritage, Culture and Arts' original recommendations.

To quote Councillor Orlikow from the SPC meeting: *"The problem I have is I heard **no one** saying this is a great idea, including WAC. But I still haven't heard any better ideas... If there is another possibility out there, we should give it one more kick at the can."* Our Plan B is the other kick at the can – one with actual stakeholder engagement and support.

RECOMMENDATIONS

	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	PLAN B:	DIFFERENCE:
No. 1	That a Special Operating Agency for museums not be established. [CONCURRED AT SPC]	That a Special Operating Agency for museums not be established.	none
	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	**PLAN B:**	**DIFFERENCE:**
No. 2	That the City of Winnipeg Museum's Board be disbanded. [CONCURRED AT SPC]	That the City of Winnipeg Museum's Board be disbanded effective January 1, 2020.	The intent of the amendment is to expressly permit the Museums Board the opportunity to hold a final meeting where they can make motions, on the record, to support these PLAN B recommendations – including their own disbandment (which was originally their idea). The members of the Museums Board believe it would be disrespectful not to allow this given all the volunteer hours they have contributed to the City on this matter.

	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	PLAN B:	DIFFERENCE:
No. 3	That beginning with the 2020 budget, the current annual grant of $764,934 be provided annually to the Winnipeg Arts Council (referred to as Museum Grant Funds), to be taken from the Council approved museum grant funds. [LAID OVER FOR UP TO 6 MONTHS AT SPC]	That beginning with the 2020 budget, the current annual operating budget for City-owned museums of $764,934 be provided annually to the City of Winnipeg Library Services Department, for distribution as set out in Recommendation #4.	(quoting the Task Force report): "The City must recognize its own unique relationship to the six City-owned museums for which it is responsible." The stakeholders strongly believe that the Library Services Department is the most suitable area within the Winnipeg Public Service for our six City-owned museums, given their similar mandates of managing collections and providing public programming, as well as the obvious opportunity for collaboration. The six museums can work together as 'The City of Winnipeg Museums and Collections' within Library Services.
	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	PLAN B:	DIFFERENCE:
No. 4	That beginning with the 2020 budget, the Museums Grant Funds provided to WAC above, be delivered in the first year to the six museums currently receiving those grants totaling $764,934 in the same annual amounts they have received previously. [LAID OVER FOR UP TO 6 MONTHS AT SPC]	That beginning with the 2020 budget, the annual operating budget for City-owned museums provided to the Library Services Department above, be delivered annually to the six museums currently receiving those funds totaling $764,934 in the same annual amounts they have received previously.	The City recognizes that these are operating dollars – annual funding for operations required to manage, maintain, and make available to the public the City's own buildings and collections, distinctly opposed to project/program grants like those which make up the pool of the Museums Grant Fund provided to WAC starting in 2019 for other museums located in the City of the Winnipeg (which have no direct affiliation to the City of Winnipeg through Board appointments, physical assets, bylaws, City Charter responsibilities, etc.).
	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	PLAN B:	DIFFERENCE:
No. 5	That beginning with the 2020 budget, the remaining $45,580, previously allocated to the City of Winnipeg Museum's Board for administration, be reallocated to the Winnipeg Arts Council to administer the $764,934. [LAID OVER FOR UP TO 6 MONTHS AT SPC]	That beginning with the 2020 budget, the majority of the remaining $45,580 ($40,000), previously allocated to the City of Winnipeg Museum's Board for administration, be forfeited back to the City of Winnipeg budget committee to be reallocated at Council's discretion towards other priority needs. That only $5,580 from $45,580 previously allocated to the City of Winnipeg Museums Board for administration be reallocated to the Library Services Department to carry out the new mandate noted under Recommendation Number 9.	The Plan B recommendation is net positive $40,000 to that which was proposed by the Clerk's Department. The City of Winnipeg has now gained $40,000 per year to put towards something of value to citizens. With WAC no longer administering a juried grant process for these six City-owned museums, and Library Services working with the museums on fixed operating budgets, such a large administration budget is no longer required.

Plan B

	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	PLAN B:	DIFFERENCE:
No. 6	That the Winnipeg Arts Council be directed, in consultation with museums in Winnipeg, to determine through appropriate polices and processes for distribution of the Museum Grant Funds to all qualifying museums in Winnipeg in time for the calendar year 2022, and to administer and distribute those Museum Grant Funds annually thereafter as a transparent, juried process open to all qualifying museums. [LAID OVER FOR UP TO 6 MONTHS AT SPC]	That beginning in 2020, the Library Services Department be directed, in consultation with the six City-owned museums, to determine through appropriate policies and processes the most efficient way in which to distribute the operating dollars in a manner that will allow the museums to best leverage those dollars for other sources of funding.	The City of Winnipeg actually gets a return on investment for their own museums operating budget of $764,934. By fixing operating dollar amounts with each of the museums, and streamlining the process, these museums are no longer in competition with one-another and are able to work together and to take their reliable source of funds to leverage opportunities available from other levels of government and private donors.
	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	**PLAN B:**	**DIFFERENCE:**
No. 7	That the City enter into, execute and deliver a grant agreement with the Winnipeg Arts Council that sets out the terms and conditions of the City's grants as set forth in Recommendations 3 to 6, and that the Chief Financial Officer be authorized to negotiate and approve the terms and conditions of such grant agreement in accordance with this report and such other terms and conditions deemed necessary by the Director of Legal Services and City Solicitor to protect the interests of the City. [LAID OVER FOR UP TO 6 MONTHS AT SPC]	That the Clerk's Department responsibility toward City-owned museums be maintained solely for the purpose of governance and board appointments.	WAC is not involved with these six museums, and the Clerk's Department's involvement with these six museums is minimized.
	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	**PLAN B:**	**DIFFERENCE:**
No. 8	That the Public Service be directed to review the current agreement structure in place for each of the following museums and report back to the appropriate committee of Council with recommendations for approval of proper leases and/or agreements to guide the responsibility of operating costs: Le Musee de Saint-Boniface Museum; Transcona Historical Museum; Seven Oaks House Museum; Ross House Museum; The Historical Museum of St. James – Assiniboia; Grant's Old Mill. [CONCURRED AT SPC]	That the Public Service be directed to review the current agreement structure in place for each of the six City-owned museums. That they do so collaboratively with each of the museums individually, in the presence and with the assistance of City Legal Services, prior to formally reporting back to the appropriate committee of Council in writing with recommendations for approval of management agreements (potentially including lease agreements if the circumstances are appropriate) to guide the responsibility and demonstrate transparency of operating costs. That City services provided not be reduced, and fees (e.g., civic accommodation fees) not be increased, from 2019 levels throughout this process.	It's clear that Clerk's Department does not have a strong understanding of the museums landscape and the impact of some of their recommendations, therefore it is imperative that the key stakeholders have a chance to contribute before any further reports related to the six City-owned museums is tabled at a Committee of Council.

Plan B

	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	PLAN B:	DIFFERENCE:
No. 9	That the Human Resource Services Department manage the redeployment of one Transcona Museum CUPE Museum Curator employee per the Letter of Understanding between the City of Winnipeg and CUPE – Redeployment. [CONCURRED AT SPC]	That the Human Resource Services Department manage the redeployment of one Transcona Museum CUPE Museum Curator employee per the Letter of Understanding between the City of Winnipeg and CUPE – Redeployment. That, as per the City Clerk's original recommendations (quote: "this will not impact the budget for the Transcona Museum"), the operating budget allocation to the Transcona Museum is to remain at the same annual amount it has received previously. That the City of Winnipeg employee – the Transcona Museum Curator – be redeployed to a new role as the City of Winnipeg Museums Officer reporting to the Winnipeg Library Services Department, where she will be responsible to: A) Administer the straight distribution of the $764,934 in operating dollars to the six museums in their fixed amounts, and; B) Actively participate in any museum management agreement reviews or negotiations with the six museums, and; C) Capture and maintain records related to other operating services provided by the City to each of the six museums (i.e., repairs and maintenance, snow clearing, lawn care, storage, etc.), and; D) Provide expert knowledge to various departments requiring information pertaining to six museums and collections, and; E) Compile statistics and data for each of the six museums, developing analysis and reporting to various departments as needed, including an annual "State of our City Museums" report to be tabled to Council as information, and; F) Act as a liaison between other City departments and the six museums, and; G) Advocate for, and help to ensure continued progress toward the implementation of the Task Force recommendations relevant to museums (i.e., municipal taxes, civic accommodations, and funding), and; H) Coordinate meetings with representatives from the six museums at least twice per year to share information, create synergies, increase effectiveness (sharing expertise, education, programming goals) and identify efficiencies (sharing services, maximising budgets, etc.).	The Plan B recommendation is cost-neutral to that which was proposed by the Clerk's Department. Furthermore, the solution proposed in Plan B allows a unionized City of Winnipeg employee with specialized expertise to be employed in a role that she is highly qualified to undertake and will greatly benefit the City of Winnipeg, and the six City-owned museums.
	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	PLAN B:	DIFFERENCE:
No. 10	That the proper officers of the City of Winnipeg be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the forgoing.	That the proper officers of the City of Winnipeg be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the forgoing.	none

Plan B

	CLERK'S DEPARTMENT:	PLAN B:	DIFFERENCE:
OVERALL	Ill-informed, ill-advised, and developed in a 14-month window without any consultation whatsoever. It is contrary to the spirit and logic behind the Task Force recommendation for a City SOA, which was later endorsed by the Mayor's Advisory Committee prior to being passed at Council. It gives away over $45,000 annually to a third-party organization (WAC) for no return on investment. It reduces expert services and supports available to the museums. It has no stakeholder support.	Highly innovative, efficient, achievable, and sustainable, and was developed quickly and collaboratively in less than a week. It is directly aligned with the research and recommendations from the Task Force, and respects the direction from Council to keep our City-owned museums under the City umbrella. It returns a net $40,000* annually to the City of Winnipeg budget with no strings attached. It provides – at no additional cost – a permanent home and related leadership and operational expertise for our City-owned museums within the City bureaucracy. It has full stakeholder** support.	Plan B is more collaborative. Plan B is better politically and fiscally. Plan B is more achievable and avoids Councillors having to listen and respond to growing concerns from constituents and interest groups. Plan avoids the very real potential for a grievance from CUPE, resulting in more work and delays for the City. Plan B is better for our City's heritage, and it's the right thing to do.
	*NOTE 1:	**NOTE 2:	
ADDITIONAL NOTES	The museums would like it noted that the $40,000 being forfeited back to the City of Winnipeg budget committee under Recommendation Number 5 would in fact go a long way to assist our museums. While the museums understand the City's current financial predicament and will respect the final decision of Council on this matter, we would like to suggest that the $40,000 be held throughout the management agreement review process and be potentially used to increase some of the individual museum operating budgets, or offset costs of City services. Many City Councillors have acknowledged that our museums have been underfunded for many years now and it's anticipated that the review will uncover inequities and further historical agreements that could be rectified with this remaining $40,000.	Library Services was not consulted.	