Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – February 17, 2021

REPORTS

Item No. 3 Nameless Resume Process

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE DECISION:

The Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service:

1. That the Public Service not proceed with the implementation of a Nameless Resume process.

2. That the Public Service continue to work on initiatives that support Diversity and Inclusion in the workplace and implementing Anti-Racism and Anti-Oppression initiatives as outlined below.

3. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the foregoing.

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Councillor Browaty,

That the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service be concurred in and forwarded to Council.

Yea:	Bowman, Allard, Browaty, Gillingham, Gilroy, Mayes, Rollins	7
Nay:		0

Carried

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On October 20, 2020, the Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Riel Community Committee.

COMMUNITY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On October 1, 2020, the Riel Community Committee passed the following motion:

WHEREAS Winnipeg's population has grown significantly over the last 10 years, largely fueled by immigration, and now represents a very diverse population;

AND WHEREAS Council has recently adopted a Newcomer Welcome and Inclusion Policy that can enhance the lives of newcomers to Winnipeg and better serve their distinct needs;

AND WHEREAS included within the framework of the Newcomer Welcome and Inclusion Policy is the opportunity for employment and assistance;

AND WHEREAS unconscious bias can occur when hiring authorities make judgments about job candidates based on gender, race, or other prohibited factors without even realizing they're doing it, which fuels the problem of marginalization and access to employment;

AND WHEREAS an increasing number of jurisdictions and businesses have adopted the practice of "Nameless Resumes" in an effort to level the playing field for individuals from racialized communities and focuses on the qualifications, skills and experiences of individuals for advertised positions;

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

COMMUNITY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION (continued):

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Riel Community Committee recommends to the Executive Policy Committee:

1. That the Winnipeg Public Service be directed to report back within 120 days with options that will allow the City of Winnipeg Human Resources Department to proceed with a Nameless Resume process, incorporating the following:

    A. A goal to increase the number of diversity hires including but not limited to; women and members of the LGBQT communities;

    B. Provide a transparent process on selection and hiring which includes what information can be redacted, so that it does not identify individuals from racialized communities but focuses on the skills and qualifications of individuals who apply;

    C. Further educate supervisors and managers in hiring authority capacities on unconscious bias and the value of diversity hiring, while enhancing techniques to ask skilled-based interview questions;

    D. Introduce blind hiring practices in incremental steps and for specific roles, to allow for evaluation of the practice and fine-tuning as necessary.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: Nameless Resume

Critical Path: Executive Policy Committee

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO
T. Chatel & J. Greenberg	A. Cusson	N/A	M. Ruta, Interim CAO

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On October 20, 2020, the Winnipeg Public Service was directed to provide options that would allow the City of Winnipeg Human Resources Department to proceed with a Nameless Resume Process.

Through research and conversations with employers and other municipalities it was determined that a Nameless Resume Process is not a widely adopted practice and where it was, there was no proven benefit. Significant financial resources would also be required to implement the process.

The Winnipeg Public Service acknowledges the importance of transparent and unbiased recruitment and selection processes, but believes this is better supported through education, continued work on Diversity and Inclusion initiatives that are currently underway, the implementation of Anti-Racism and Anti-Oppression initiatives and targeted recruitment activities to attract those who are under-represented to gain employment with the City of Winnipeg.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the Public Service not proceed with the implementation of a Nameless Resume process.

2. That the Public Service continue to work on initiatives that support Diversity and Inclusion in the workplace and implementing Anti-Racism and Anti-Oppression initiatives as outlined below.

3. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the foregoing.

REASON FOR THE REPORT

On October 20, 2020, EPC directed the Public Service to report back within 120 days with options that will allow the City of Winnipeg Human Resources Department to proceed with a Nameless Resume process, incorporating the following:

A. A goal to increase the number of diversity hires including but not limited to; women and members of the LGBQT communities;

B. Provide a transparent process on selection and hiring which includes what information can be redacted, so that it does not identify individuals from racialized communities but focuses on the skills and qualifications of individuals who apply;

C. Further educate supervisors and managers in hiring authority capacities on unconscious bias and the value of diversity hiring, while enhancing techniques to ask skilled-based interview questions;

D. Introduce blind hiring practices in incremental steps and for specific roles, to allow for evaluation of the practice and fine-tuning as necessary.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

The Public Service will not implement a nameless resume process but will instead continue to work on initiatives that support Diversity and Inclusion in the workplace and implementing Anti-Racism and Anti-Oppression initiatives.

HISTORY/DISCUSSION

As outlined in the October 20, 2020 motion the Public Service was directed to report back on a number of items that came out of the motion pertaining to the October 1, 2020 Riel Community Committee. Each of the items will be addressed below.

A. A goal to increase the number of diversity hires including but not limited to; women and members of the LGBQT communities;

Work is currently underway to enhance the City of Winnipeg's Self-Declaration Questionnaire and associated processes.

It is optional for employees to self-declare if they are in one of the four protected equity groups (including employees who identify as Female, Indigenous Person, Person with Disability, and Visible Minority). Because it's a voluntary self-declaration process and given an employee's personal situation could change, it is possible the captured statistics in the 2019 Diversity Report, attached as Appendix A, does not accurately reflect the workforce diversity.

The enhanced Self-Declaration Questionnaire will incorporate 'undeclared' (default parameter) and 'prefer not to disclose' (participated, but did not want to disclose) in addition to being more inclusive of all employees beyond the four protected equity groups.

The following groups will be included:

- Women
- Men (New)
- Indigenous Peoples
- Racialized Peoples
- Persons with Disabilities
- Newcomers (New)
- LGBTQ2+ (New)

In alignment with the Federal Anti-Racism Secretariat, the City will be collecting disaggregated data to better understand systematic barriers facing specific groups; for example, Indigenous Peoples to include subgroups of citizens of a First Nation, the Metis Nation or Inuit Homeland.

A comprehensive Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Strategy and associated policies, programs, and education and training are being worked on in order to increase diversity hires as well as programs to retain diverse employees in the Public Service and to promote opportunities for advancement.

The Public Service is in the process of negotiating Equity, Diversity & Inclusion statements in all eight (8) of the City Collective Agreements. In addition, with the recent recruitment of the Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Coordinator, a number of partnerships have been reestablished with external agencies such as Pride at Work to ensure the Public Service is consulting with community experts.

B. Provide a transparent process on selection and hiring which includes what information can be redacted, so that it does not identify individuals from racialized communities but focuses on the skills and qualifications of individuals who apply;

The Public Service believes that a transparent selection and hiring process can be achieved through:

- The implementation of the Anti-Racism initiatives, including the Equity, Diversity & Inclusion Education & Training Program and the Awareness Series (Appendix B)
- The development and implementation of an Equity, Diversity & Inclusion Strategy and corresponding policies (Equity, Diversity & Inclusion Policy and Disruption of Racism Policy) and programs (Bridging and Supported Employment Programs, Leadership Development Program).
- The City of Winnipeg currently has the ability to participate in targeted external recruitment activities including designating positions for various equity seeking groups; negotiate Equity, Diversity & Inclusion commitment statements in all eight (8) collective agreements (ATU & WAPSO have committed to Diversity language.
  Amend current One City One Process recruitment training material to include diversity as part of the internal scoring matrix and provide applicable training to ensure consistency in how and when diversity can be used in the recruitment and selection process.

The Winnipeg Public Service encourages candidates/employees to self-identify when recognizing themselves in the definitions of one or more of the equity groups. This self-

identification allows the Public Service to conduct gap analyses and prioritize targeted equity group members when they are under-represented.

The Human Resource Information System (HRIS), PeopleSoft (PS) cannot accept applications without names. Implementing a Nameless Resume process would result in a manual process to redact the information from each application and resume. This would be an administrative and labour intensive task to complete with an insufficient amount of resources. For context, in 2018 the City received a total of 58,288 applications and in 2019, received 46,098 applications.

Human Resources reached out to other municipalities and local employers. The research obtained did not support a Nameless Resume Process being a best practice or a practice that had been widely adopted. Appendix C is a summary of the findings however, in brief:

- The Federal Government conducted a pilot project, and in the Anonymized Recruitment Pilot Project – final report states that there are no benefits to this approach.
- The Canadian Museum for Human Rights implemented a nameless resume process. The recruiter does not see the name on the resumes as they have another staff member who removes them prior to sharing them. It's a manual process at present.
- Manitoba Hydro, Manitoba Liquor and Lotteries, Red River College, Manitoba Public Insurance, University of Winnipeg and Assiniboine Credit Union all advised that they have never used nameless or anonymous recruitment practices.
- University of Manitoba promoted it as a best practice, but never moved forward with implementation.
- Region of Halton, City of Sudbury, Region of Waterloo, City of Montreal, City of Toronto had not implemented a nameless resume or blind recruitment process.

C. Further educate supervisors and managers in hiring authority capacities on unconscious bias and the value of diversity hiring, while enhancing techniques to ask skilled-based interview questions;

This will be accomplished by the creation and implementation of an Equity, Diversity & Inclusion Education & Training Program. Training for Supervisors and HR staff on bias free recruitment and selection with a focus on unconscious bias and cultural competency.

All interview questions are developed based on the qualifications and skills of the position as outlined in the job bulletin.

D. Introduce blind hiring practices in incremental steps and for specific roles, to allow for evaluation of the practice and fine-tuning as necessary.

To introduce a blind hiring practice, the Public Service would require significant modifications to the current HRIS, PeopleSoft system, including hardware and software. The current system cannot accept nameless applications. This type of system modification would take time to design, build, test and implement; require hardware and software, as well as additional resources. This could have a cost upwards of $1,870,800.00 as detailed in Appendix D. Should this option be contemplated, a funding source would be required.

Implementing a blind hiring practice outside the HRIS, PeopleSoft system would be a manual process that would require resources to redact information from each application, re-saving the application and forwarding the applications to the Human Resource Consultant for screening.

The concept of blind hiring is for the initial screening process, after that step is complete, the Human Resource Consultant would require access to the full resume to begin corresponding with the candidate and to verify education requirements. A tracking system would need to be developed to link the redacted resume to the original, so that when an applicant is short listed; they can be contacted. A numerical tracking system would likely be the easiest, but would be a manual process, so there is a possibility for human error.

Currently, there are not enough resources within Human Resources to implement a blind hiring process; therefore, an increase of approximately eight (8) Clerk B's would be required with an annual salary cost of $338,027.04 - $395,777.60 plus related benefits. This would add a resource to each Department to assist with the redacting of information from applicants resumes. Even with the added resources, the overall time to complete a recruitment would increase as the Human Resource Consultant would need to wait until the resumes have been redacted before being able to complete the screening process, which could have operational service delivery impacts.

The Public Service would like to highlight, that through research and conversation with other employers and municipalities, the Human Resources team learned the Nameless Resume Process was not a widely adopted practice and where it was, there was no proven benefit. Some of the organizations, such as the Canadian Museum for Human Rights, that adopted the process are not of a comparable size to the City of Winnipeg. To note, the Canadian Museum for Human Rights even noted the need to automate the process in the future and they have approximately 200 employees, which does not compare to the City of Winnipeg with 10,500 employees.

There is not strong evidence to suggest that our recruitment and selection processes are excluding those of diverse groups. However, we do have an opportunity to create more equity programs and determine how we can attract diverse candidates to the City of Winnipeg, which is being reviewed within the Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Strategy.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement **Date:** January 20, 2021

Project Name:

Nameless Resume

COMMENTS:

There are no financial implications associated with the recommendations of this report.

If a nameless resume process were to be implemented in the future the full financial impact would need to be assessed.

(Signed electronically by T. Yanchishyn)
Tanis Yanchishyn
Manager of Finance (Campus)
Corporate Finance Department

CONSULTATION

This Report has been prepared in consultation with:
Equity, Diversity & Inclusion Coordinator
Manager HR Systems & Research
Corporate Finance

OURWINNIPEG POLICY ALIGNMENT

N/A

WINNIPEG CLIMATE ACTION PLAN ALIGNMENT

N/A

SUBMITTED BY

Department: Corporate Human Resources Services
Division: Human Resources Services
Prepared by: Tara Chatel & Jordana Greenberg
Date: January 20, 2021
File No:

Attachments:

Appendix A: 2019 Diversity Report

Appendix B: Equity, Diversity & Inclusion Education & Training Program Administration Report, Program Framework, Learning Objectives for Mandatory Modules & Draft Awareness Series.

Appendix C: Summary of Nameless Resume Research

Appendix D: System and Resource Requirements