Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – February 14, 2023

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development – February 2, 2023

Item No. 2 442 Scotia Street, Leacock House – Removal from the List of Historical Resources (Mynarski Ward)

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

The Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service and submitted the following to Council:

1. That the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to deny the application to remove 442 Scotia Street, Leacock House, from the List of Historical Resources be approved.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Minutes – Executive Policy Committee – February 14, 2023

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development – February 2, 2023

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by Councillor Rollins,

That the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service not be concurred in and forwarded to Council.

Yea:	Rollins	1
Nay:	Gillingham, Browaty, Lukes, Mayes, Orlikow	5

Lost

Moved by Councillor Browaty,

That the recommendation of the Winnipeg Public Service be concurred in and forwarded to Council.

Yea:	Gillingham, Browaty, Lukes, Mayes, Orlikow	5
Nay:	Rollins	1

Carried

Terry Shaw, Area resident and Marymound Board Chair, submitted a communication with respect to the matter.

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On February 2, 2023, due to a tie vote, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development submitted the matter to the Executive Policy Committee and Council without recommendation.

Th following persons submitted communications:

- Nancy Parker, Executive Director, Marymound Inc., submitted a communication dated January 31, 2023, in opposition to the recommendations.
- Natalie Smith submitted a communication in support of the recommendations.

Report – Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development – February 2, 2023

DECISION MAKING HISTORY (continued):

STANDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION (continued):

On November 30, 2022, the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development laid the matter over to its meeting on February 2, 2023.

Lindsay Oster, Prairie Architects In., submitted a communication with respect to the matter.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On July 12, 2022, the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development:

1. That the application for Leacock House, 442 Scotia Street, to be removed from the List of Historical Resources, be denied.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT

Title: 442 Scotia Street, Leacock House – Removal from the List of Historical Resources

Critical Path: Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development – Executive Policy Committee – Council

AUTHORIZATION

Author	Department Head	CFO	CAO
V. Lawson (Acting)	J. Kiernan	N/A	M. Jack

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Public Service concurs with the recommendation of the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC) to deny the application for the removal of 442 Scotia Street, Leacock House (the resource) from the List of Historical Resources (otherwise known as delisting).

The resource is of outstanding architectural and historical significance in the heritage values it embodies. Delisting would result in the resource no longer being protected from demolition and alterations under the Historical Resources By-law (the By-law). The owner plans to demolish the resource to construct a new facility. The Public Service would like the owner to explore other options for the location of the new facility so that the resource can be retained.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the Historical Buildings and Resources Committee's recommendation to deny the application to remove 442 Scotia Street, Leacock House, from the List of Historical Resources be approved.

2. That the Proper Officers of the City do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

REASON FOR THE REPORT

Pursuant to 27(2) of the Historical Resources By-law, the Director is authorized to provide a report with respect to the application for consideration by the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development (SPC-PD) at the time it considers the recommendations of the HBRC.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS

442 Scotia Street, Leacock House will remain on the List of Historical Resources. As such, the following notices, restrictions, and opportunities will continue to apply to the subject property:

- A Historic Property Notice (caveat) will remain on the title of the building with the Winnipeg Land Titles Office of the Property Registry, pursuant to Section 157.1(3) of the City of Winnipeg Charter, in order to notify the owner and potential purchasers that the property is identified on the List of Historical Resources, and as such is subject to the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014.
- Demolition of the Listed Historical Resource will continue to be prohibited, and proposed alterations to the character-defining elements will continue to require approval under a Heritage Permit.
- The owner of a Listed Historical Resource will remain eligible for heritage grants and incentive programs issued under the City of Winnipeg and the Province of Manitoba and will be viewed favourably by other heritage granting agencies.
- Unless an owner provides evidence that the listed resource was not built using shallow foundations as defined by the Manitoba Building Code and if the Listed Historical Resource is vacant, the basement or crawlspace of the resource must be heated to a temperature of 10 degrees Celsius so as to prevent undue shifting, heaving or “frost-jacking” of the listed resource.

HISTORY/DISCUSSION

Heritage Status

On July 12, 2012, Council added 442 Scotia Street, Leacock House, to the List of Historical Resources. The following character-defining elements are protected under the Listing:

1. Exterior elements:
    a. irregular buff brick and stone Queen Anne style structure with three main facades facing north, south and east;
    b. the wrap-around glazed porch;
    c. the ornate brick chimney in the southeast corner with mosaic;
    d. the wood window frames and sashes;
    e. complex roof with windowed dormers; and
    f. details including brick lintels, wood moulding along the eaves, brackets along the south elevation.

2. Interior elements:
    a. original tin ceilings, wood finishes, architectural detailing, original wood doors/frames and wood flooring on the ground floor;
    b. entire volume of space and finishes of the main staircase; and
    c. curved glass windows on the ground floor.

Heritage Values

The Leacock House is deemed to embody heritage values attributed to the following:

- It was built in 1882 as the mansion of Edward Philip “E.P.” Leacock, and in 1911, it became the home of the Sisters of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd as a part of a nurturing environment to care for and rehabilitate young persons in the juvenile detention system, a program initiated by Judge Thomas Mayne Daly. The complex of buildings on the site became the Marymound School in the 1950s, and the sisters remained in the residence until 2014.

- It was designed by a well-known and prolific local architect, Walter Chesterton.

- It is one of a small group of residences from the 1880s in Winnipeg and is an important and rare Queen Anne Revival style building from that period in the city, where few examples remain. The style is one of the most popular of all the residential architectural styles from the 1880s until the First World War. The building features characteristic elements of the style including asymmetrical massing, bay windows, a wrap-around porch, an irregular roofline, ornamented chimneystack with a mid-century mosaic by artist Robert Bruce, varied materials and colours, and interior detailing consisting of tin ceilings and carved wood decorative elements.

- The building was a part of the early suburban development of West Kildonan and is one of five buildings on a large piece of property adjacent to the Red River and at the terminus of Scotia Street.

- The exterior porch has been modified over time and the house is physically connected to the St. Agnes Priory (constructed in 1924), but the remainder of the exterior and interior is intact.

For more information on the heritage values of the Leacock House, please see Appendix A, Historical Report.

Delisting Application

On May 4, 2022, an application to remove the Leacock House at 442 Scotia Street from the List of Historical Resources under the Historical Resources By-law No. 55/2014 was submitted.

The resource is owned by Marymound Inc., which is a not-for-profit organization that provides care for vulnerable youth including crisis stabilization, treatment programs, group homes, treatment foster care, clinical services and cultural healing services based on a Two-Eyed Seeing approach.

Marymound initially planned to conserve and rehabilitate the resource to house a program to support youth between the ages of 13-17 struggling with mental health, substance mis-use issues, trauma and complex needs. However, estimated project costs exceeded their budget. Other revised versions of the project were deemed impractical. Marymound would instead like to delist the resource so that it could be demolished in order to accommodate a new building on the site for this program.

For more information on Marymound and the attempts to rehabilitate the resource, refer to Appendix B, Delisting Application.

HBRC Review

As per section 26(2) of the By-law the HBRC may recommend that a resource be removed from the List if it no longer embodies sufficient heritage values to justify inclusion on the List.

On July 12, 2022, the HBRC recommended to the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development that the application for Leacock House, 442 Scotia Street, to be removed from the List of Historical Resources be denied because the resource embodies outstanding heritage value.

The HBRC's recommendation must be considered by the SPC and will be considered by the Executive Policy Committee (EPC) and Council if the owner is opposed to the recommendations of the HBRC and/or the SPC.

Criteria for decision-making by the SPC, EPC, and Council

As per Section 27(3) of the By-law, the SPC must decide whether the resource continues to embody heritage values sufficient to justify its continued inclusion on the List and, if applicable, the hazard posed by the resource and may, in addition, consider the economic viability of conserving the resource.

A determination of the economic viability of protecting and preserving a resource under this section must be based on the following criteria:

a. The condition of the resource;

b. The costs of the continued repair and maintenance of the resource;

c. The importance and value derived from the conservation or continued conservation of the resource;

d. The efforts that have been made by the owner to date to conserve the resource; and

e. The merits of alternative proposals for the resource or the site on which it is located, other than conserving the resource by adding it to the List.

In considering a nomination, the EPC and Council must use the same criteria as are required to be considered by the SPC.

Public Service Recommendation

The Public Service concurs with the recommendation of the HBRC to deny the delisting application.

The Public Service and the HBRC are sympathetic to Marymound's mission, to their need for a facility to house a youth support program, and to their financial shortfall in rehabilitating the resource. The proposed new use for the Leacock House has proven to be neither economically viable nor compatible with the resource.

The property area is quite large, and an alternative location for the new facility may be possible (refer to Appendix C, Map of 442 Scotia Street). The Public Service, in consultation with the

HBRC, would like Marymound to explore other locations on the property as options for the new facility so that the resource can remain intact and stabilized until a new use for the resource becomes viable.

Work to stabilize the resource may be eligible for funding under the City's Gail Parvin Hammerquist City-Wide Program Capital Project (GPH) Grants and the Province of Manitoba's Heritage Resources Conservation Grants.

In December 2021, a GPH grant of $19,687.50 was paid out for work to stabilize the masonry on the resource.

Should the resource remain on the List of Historical Resources, when planning for the conservation of the resource, the following standards, among others, from the Council-adopted *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* would apply:

- Conserve the heritage value of a historical resource. Do not remove, replace or substantially alter its intact or repairable character-defining elements.
- Conserve heritage value by adopting an approach calling for minimal intervention.
- Protect and, if necessary, stabilize an historical resource until any subsequent intervention is undertaken.
- Find a use for an historical resource that requires minimal or no change to its character-defining elements.
- Repair rather than replace character-defining elements unless they are too severely deteriorated to repair. New elements are to match the forms, materials, and detailing of original elements.
- A new addition, if required to support a new use, is to be physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to, and distinguishable from the historical resource.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Financial Impact Statement

Date: July 26, 2022

Project Name:

442 Scotia Street, Leacock House – Removal from the List of Historical Resources

COMMENTS:

There are no direct financial implications associated with this report.

Mike McGinn July 26, 2022

Mike McGinn, CPA, CA
Manager of Finance

CONSULTATION

This Report has been prepared in consultation with:

- The Historical Buildings and Resources Committee

OURWINNIPEG POLICY ALIGNMENT

The recommendations in this report align with the following policies under OurWinnipeg 2045:
Environmental Resilience
2.14 Heritage Conservation
Identify, designate and conserve heritage resources and districts, including lands and artifacts significant to Indigenous Peoples, that illustrate the broad range of heritage values, as defined in Complete Communities, while supporting efforts toward carbon-neutrality, energy efficiency, and embodied carbon reduction.

City Building
6.43 Heritage Conservation
Conserve cultural, natural, and heritage resources and districts, as defined in Complete Communities, and Indigenous land-based practices to celebrate sense of place through community history, architecture, civic identity and cultural perspectives.

The recommendations in this report align with the following policies under Complete Communities Direction Strategy 2.0:

1.0 Recognize, identify, and designate a broad range of tangible heritage resources throughout the city that illustrate Winnipeg's unique sense of place, community identity, and heritage values.

Identify and maintain local heritage resources
4.1 Work with community stakeholders to identify unique heritage legacy elements at the neighbourhood scale and support the sustainable reuse of existing building stock and historic infrastructure.

WINNIPEG CLIMATE ACTION PLAN ALIGNMENT

N/A

WINNIPEG POVERTY REDUCTION STRATEGY ALIGNMENT

N/A

SUBMITTED BY

Department: Planning, Property, and Development
Division: Urban Planning & Design
Prepared by: R. Ricci

Date: August 2, 2022
File No:

Attachments:

Appendix A – Historical Report

Appendix B – Delisting Application

Appendix C – Map of 442 Scotia Street



Figure 1: 442 Scotia Street. The property line is shown in blue. The Leacock House is shown in red.