To:	Ho Lau City of Winnipeg	From:	Stantec Consulting Ltd. & Landmark Planning & Design Inc.
Project/File:	111220808	Date:	January 27, 2024

REFERENCE: ENGINEERING REVIEW FEES COMPARATOR ANALYSIS MEMORANDUM

SUMMARY OF TASK

The City of Winnipeg's (City) Water and Waste Department has recently conducted a review and assessment of municipal servicing for water, sewer, and land drainage development. This review and assessment included a review of the City's internal development application review process, a market scan of comparable municipalities development application review processes, and final recommendations for how the City can improve their process. As a follow up, the City asked our team to review the mechanisms other municipalities use for cost recovery, particularly for managing preliminary servicing inquiries and providing general information.

This memorandum includes a comparator analysis of six municipality's engineering review fees along with recommendations for how Winnipeg's engineering review fees should be structured.

COMPARATOR ANALYSIS

The engineering review fees comparator analysis will consist of the following cities: Calgary, AB; Edmonton, AB; Regina, SK; Saskatoon, SK; Hamilton, ON; and Mississauga, ON. These cities were determined to be comparable to Winnipeg, MB by population, location, similar economics, or for being an overall benchmark city when it comes to engineering reviews.

Table 1 below provides a brief summary of the engineering review fee structure for each of the selected cities. Some municipalities have multiple different fee structures for each type of engineering review, but generally they follow either a flat fee or fee per hectare structure.

Table 1 Engineering Review Fees Comparator Analysis

City	Fee Structure
Calgary, AB	Flat Fee
Edmonton, AB	Fee per Hectare
Regina, SK	Flat Fee
Saskatoon, SK	Flat Fee
Hamilton, ON	Flat Fee
Mississauga, ON	Flat Fee (some based on hectares)

As each City has a unique fee structure, a direct comparison between fee and process is not straightforward. Tables 2 through 6 below outline each comparator city's fee structure for engineering reviews. It is important to keep in mind that each of the cities review processes could vary, meaning similar fees in different municipalities may have varying inclusions. Clarification on what is included for each fee in each city is analyzed below, followed by our recommendations based on this analysis.

Calgary, AB

The City of Calgary's Engineering Review Fees are not explicitly stated on their website. The City has multiple Building, Planning, and Licensing 2025 fee schedules available online, however engineering review fees are not included. Upon discussions with the City, it was confirmed that the engineering review fees are incorporated into each planning application fee. A Majority of these fees from the City are a flat fee based on application/development type, as shown in Table 2 below.

Table 2 City of Calgary Planning Application Fees

Fee Classification	Fee Details	2025 Fee
Residential –Additions	to Manufactured Home – 10m2 and under	$182
	to Manufactured Home – over 10m2	$450
	to Single, Semi-detached, & Duplex Dwellings in the Developed Area – 10 m2 and under	$395
	to Single, Semi-detached, & Duplex Dwellings in the Developed Area – over 10 m2	$1,247
Residential –New	Secondary Suite / Backyard Suite	$0
	Contextual Dwellings in the Developed Area	$1,078
	Development Design Guidelines (tract housing)	$620
	Home Occupation – Class 2	$457
	Manufactured Home	$795
	Developments of Three or More Dwelling Units – Discretionary Use or Relaxations	$1,058 + $47/unit
	Developments of Three or more Dwelling Units – Permitted Use	$1,028 + $47/unit
	Single-detached, Semi-detached, & Duplex Dwellings in the Developed Area	$1,859
Residential – Relaxations	Proposed Structures that do not meet all the rules of Land Use Bylaw 1P2007	$550
	Existing Structures that do not meet all rules of Land Use Bylaw 1P2007	$189
Residential – Renovations	Developments of Three or More Dwelling Units – Permitted Use	$811
	Development of Three or more Dwelling Units – Discretionary Use or Relaxations	$841
	Commercial Buildings	$263 + $0.76/sqm of GFA ($1,734 minimum)

Commercial / Industrial / Mixed Use – Additions / New	Mixed Use Buildings	$263 + $0.76/sqm of commercial GFA ($1,734 minimum) + $795 + $47 per dwelling unit
	Mezzainine / Interior Second Floor Addition – Permitted Use (No Relaxations)	$745
	Mezzainine / Interior Second Floor Addition – Discretionary Use or Relaxations	$775
Commercial / Industrial / Mixed Use – Change of Use	Permitted Use (No Relaxations, No Changes to Site Plan)	$190
	Discretionary Use or Relaxations Required (No Changes to Site Plan)	$624
Commercial / Industrial / Mixed Use – General	Excavating, Stripping & Grading	$1,144
	Outdoor Cafes	$0
	Retaining Walls (Commercial/Industrial Sites and Sites That Span Multiple Parcels)	$1,116
	Special Function / Event	$624
	Surface Parking Lots	$1,377
	Temporary Structures (Including Portable Classrooms)	$961
Commercial / Industrial / Mixed Use – Renovations	Change(s) to Site Plan (i.e. Landscaping, Parking, Access)	$1,737
	Exterior Renovations	$775
Commercial / Industrial / Mixed Use – Signs	Permitted Use (No Relaxations)	$95
	Discretionary Use or Relaxations Required	$821
Subdivision – Outline Plan	0 – 10 Hectares (No Growth Management Overlay is in Place in Whole or in Part at Time of Submission)	$5,669
	Over 10 Hectares (No Growth Management Overlay is in Place in Whole or in Part at Time of Submission)	$567/hectare
Subdivision – Comprehensive Developments	Conforming, Bareland Condominium, or Half Acre in East Springbank Area, 2 - 10 Lots	$3,361
	Conforming, Bareland Condominium, or Half Acre in East Springbank Area, Over 10 Lots	$337/lot
	Non-Conforming - Minor (No-Recirculation), 2 - 10 Lots	$3,513
	Non-Conforming - Minor (No-Recirculation), Over 10 Lots	$354/lot
	Non-Conforming - Major (Re-Circulation Required), 2 - 10 Lots	$4,613
	Non-Conforming - Major (Re-Circulation Required), Over 10 Lots	$479/lot

	Non-Conforming - Major (Re-Circulation Required), Over 10 Lots	$6,178
	No Outline Plan, or Non-Residential, Redivision of Previous Outline Plan Parcel, Over 10 Lots	$457/lot
Subdivision – Single & Two-family Dwellings	1-2 Lots	$1,115
	3-10 Lots	$3,361
	Subdivision by Instrument	$1,115
Subdivision – Reverse Parcels	Subdivision of a Reserve Parcel	$1,115
Additional Fees	Pre-application (DART Review)	$1,000
	Recirculation Fee	$1,143

As shown in the above table, the City of Calgary has a very specific fee structure for planning applications. Most applications are charged a fixed fee. In addition to the fixed fee, some with a applications levy an additional charge based on a per lot or per hectare basis.

Edmonton, AB

The City of Edmonton's engineering review fees are outlined on their website under Urban Planning and Design, specifically on the Fees & Assessments page. Table 3 below outlines the fee classifications and fees.

Table 3 City of Edmonton Engineering Review Fees

Fee Classification	Fee Details	Current Fee
Inspection Fee	Fee for reviewing engineering drawings and inspecting various municipal improvements	$9,410/hectare plus GST with a minimum value based on 3.0 hectares
Expansion Assessment Charge	Applied to all new land developments that did not have an approved neighbourhood structure plan on January 1, 1998, that identified a downstream receiving system	$25,186/hectare (hectares of entire property

Regina, SK

The City of Regina has an engineering review fee outlined within the Development Application Fee Bylaw, 2008, as amended (Bylaw No. 2024-58). Appendix "A" of this Bylaw outlines development application fees, where the Site Servicing Capacity Check Fee is $1,100. No other engineering review fees have been identified within the By-law.

Saskatoon, SK

The City of Saskatoon's engineering review fees are outlined in Schedule "A" – Building Permit Fees of the Building Bylaw, 2017 (Bylaw No. 9455). Table 4 below outlines the engineering review classification and associated fee.

Table 4 City of Saskatoon Engineering Review Fees

Building Permit Fee	2025 Fee
Construction and design plan review fee	$483
Water and sewer plan review fee	$712

Hamilton, ON

The City of Hamilton's engineering review fees are outlined within their Growth Management Fees and Charges, Effective January 1, 2025. Table 5 below outlines the engineering review classification along with the associated fee.

Table 5 City of Hamilton Engineering Review Fees

Engineering Design Review and Sanitary Sewer and Water Drawing Review	2025 Fee
Engineering Review Fee (for Subdivision)	$4,605.00
Engineering Review Fee – Additional Cost per Unit / Residential *for Subdivision)	$350.00
Engineering Review Fee – Additional Cost / Hectare / Non Residential (For subdivision)	$330.00
Engineering Review Fee (3 to 10 units)	$7,500.00
Engineering Resubmission Review Fees (3 to 10 units) (3rd and subsequent)	$1,610.00
Note: The following fee exemptions apply to charitable and not-for-profit organizations proposing affordable housing projects: **1. Engineering Review fees (3 to 10 units)** **2. Engineering Resubmission Review Fees (3rd and subsequent)**	Fee Waived
MECP / ECA Sewer Application Process (MECP / ECA Review Fee)	$1,100.00
Resubmission of Engineering Drawings for review and approval (per page)	$495.00
Review of Special Study Administration Fee (Note: for special studies including but not limited to Karst, Geomorphology, Hydrology, Traffic, etc.)	$2,035.00

Engineering Special Studies	Consultant Fee + 25% Project Management Fee
Engineering Consultation Pre-Application	$3,440.00
Sewer and Water Drawing Review Fee – for Site Plans Major	$2,070.00
Sewer and Water Drawing Review Fee – for Site Plans Minor	$1,045
Wastewater Allocation Processing Fee	$580
Video Inspection (Review and Inspection for Rehabilitation or Replacement of Existing Sewer Service)	$627
Disconnection of Services Request	$235

It is important to note that Engineering Design Review is a fixed cost which includes 3 submissions of Engineering drawings. Any additional submissions are subject to revision fees in accordance with the above fee schedule. Design review fees are also applied to each and all phases of servicing of the draft plan of subdivision.

Mississauga, ON

The City of Mississauga engineering review fees are outlined in Schedule 'A' and Schedule 'B' of the Planning Act Processing Fees and Charges By-law, effective January 1, 2025. Table 6 below outlines the fee name, fee details, and the 2025 fee. Engineering fees are calculated as a percentage of the municipal infrastructure/servicing

Table 6 City of Mississauga Engineering Review Fees

Fee Name	Fee Details	2025 Fee
Site Plan Control – Limited Circulation	Transportation and Works – Storm Drainage Review	$452
	Transportation and Works – Storm Drainage Review	$139
	Transportation and Works – Environmental Review	$138
	Transportation and Works – Traffic Review	$509
Development Application Review Committee (DARC) Meeting	Removal of (H) Holding Symbol: For applications within CC1 to CC4 and CCOS City Centre Base, Exception Zones or H removal applications require engineering review	$9,417
Municipal Infrastructure/Servicing Costs	Application Fee (non-refundable deposit)	$1,500
	Less than $100,000	10%
	$100,000 to $250,000	8% with a minimum of $10,000
	$250,000 to $500,000	6% with a minimum of $20,000

	$500,000 to $750,000	5% with a minimum of $30,000
	$750,000 to $1.5 million	4.5% with a minimum of $37,500
	Greater than $1.5 million	3.5% with a minimum of $67,500
Interim Servicing Submission Review	0 to 20 hectares (0 to 50 acres)	$1,500 per submission
	20 to 40 hectares (50 to 100 acres)	$2,000 per submission
	Over 40 hectares (over 100 acres)	$3,000 per submission
	Municipal Services Inspection Relating to Condominiums	Range of $1,000 to $2,500 per development, based on the complexity of the project.
Phasing of Development after Initial Submissions have been Reviewed	0 to 20 hectares (0 to 50 acres)	$1,500 per submission for each phase
	20 to 40 hectares (50 to 100 acres)	$2,000 per submission for each phase
	Over 40 hectares (over 100 acres)	$3,000 per submission for each phase

RECOMMENDATIONS

As shown through Tables 2 to 6 above, there is no pattern between the different municipalities and their engineering review fees. Each municipality has a vastly different fee structure. While direct comparison is difficult, fixed fees based on the type of planning application are more prevalent than area-based charges.. Some of the fixed fees do, however, have an additional fee based on an area or per unit calculation.

Based on the results of the above comparator analysis, it is our professional recommendation to implement the following engineering review fee structure in Winnipeg:

Engineering Servicing Capacity Search Fee – $220

i. This fee is to be charged when a brief review is needed to determine the servicing capacity of a property before progressing through the formal application process.

ii. The recommended fee is based on data provided by the City of Winnipeg. A range of current staff at different classification levels reviewed each inquiry request. The cost of review for each request was determined by the number of hours spent by each classification level.

iii. By applying statistical analysis to the cost per review, we recommend using the 80th percentile on a Bell curve. The recommended fee is $220 - which includes a recommended administrative margin of ten percent to manage the system (collecting fees, documentation, etc.).

The City was primarily interested in the initial fee related to inquiries. Since we had access to other types of fees charged by municipalities, we are providing these additional recommendations to be considered at some point in the future.

Reference: Engineering Review Fees Comparator Analysis Memorandum

Planning Application Review Fee – $1000-$3000 depending on actual costs

i. This fee is to be administrated based on the type of planning application, and the amount of work required to complete the review. Our proposed range is based on the range of charges used by the other municipalities, but ultimately, the City should satisfy itself that the fee reflects cost recovery.

Detailed Engineering Review Fee – Many municipalities have a fee based on development size

i. This fee is to be charged for applications which require a detailed engineering review, such as subdivision applications, and will follow the following development size fee structure based on property size. We recommend the following threshold for fees:

    i. Property under 2.5 hectares.

    ii. Property between 2.5 and 10 hectares.

    iii. Property above 10 hectares.

This recommendation allows the engineering review fees to be relatively simple to administer, while still capturing the various levels of effort required for each review.

Best regards,

Stantec Consulting Ltd. & Landmark Planning & Design Inc.

Stephen Willis RPP, MCIP, PLE
Infrastructure, Canada Federal Sector Lead
Stantec Consulting Ltd.
Phone: 613-724-4353
stephen.willis@stantec.com

Jeff Pratte RPP MCIP
Senior Planner, Partner
Landmark Planning & Design Inc.
Phone: 204-453-8008
jpratte@landmarkplanning.ca