Request for Proposal: 896-2024

Consensus Matrix Area One

	Requirement	Points	GFL	Proponent #2	MWM Environmental	Proponent #4
	Compliance	**Pass/Fail**	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
	Qualifications	**Pass/Fail**	**	**	Pass	**
B9	**Fees**					
	Bidders shall submit fees in Canadian funds… complete based on Fees clause	**40**	40.00	30.67	39.96	30.70
	~ the price evaluation is on the Matrix Evaluation Calculation tab		$19,640,141.35	$25,613,916.20	$19,659,723.60	$25,585,859.40
B10	**Experience of Proponent**					
B10.1	Proposals should include:					
	(a) details demonstrating the history and experience of the Proponent in providing garbage, recycling and leaf and yard waste services, vehicle routing experience, a strong understanding of general collection services and associated challenges, mitigation techniques and demonstrated ability in reducing liquidated damages as well as the overall management of the project and contract administration services on up to three projects of similar complexity, scope and value.	**6.00**	6.00	5.33	4.00	5.33
	(b) have three (3) years of proven experience in providing residential curbside collection of Garbage and/or Recyclables, using Automated Collection and/or Semi-Automated Collection, to a minimum 50,000 single family household within a single community made up primarily of urban and suburban sections, and areas which require special consideration (e.g. one-way streets, street parking, school zones, commuter road restrictions, laneways and narrow roadways).	**3.00**	2.00	3.00	1.00	3.00
B10.2	For each project listed in B10.1(a), the Proponent should submit:					
	(a) description of the project;	**1.00**	1.00	1.00	0.83	1.00
	(b) role of the proponent;					
	(c) original implementation schedule versus actual achieved implementation schedule;					
	(d)contractor customer service performance in accordance with past contracts; (i)number of reported missed collections per ten thousand of homes serviced. (ii)number of reported damaged carts per ten thousand homes serviced. (iii)number of reported occurrences of property damage per year.	**5.00**	5.00	4.00	4.00	3.50
	(e) number of average hours of unscheduled/reported Equipment down time per year;	**2.00**	1.50	1.67	1.67	1.00
	(f) technique or software (or other) utilized to accurately confirm an address has been collected (missed collections concerns);					
	(g) project owner;					
	(h) reference information (two current names with telephone numbers per project); and					
	(i) list of all current contracts with start dates within the last five years.					
B10.3	The Proposal should include information regarding the Proponents health and safety experience and rating, including accident frequency and severity statistics, provincial and federal health and safety violations, safety records including but not limited to, staff, Equipment in regard to compliance in relation to contracts.	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	3.00	2.50
B10.4	The Proposal should include general firm profile information, including years in business, average volume of work, number of employees and other pertinent information for the Proponent.					
	Total for Experience of Proponent	**20.00**	**18.50**	**18.00**	**14.50**	**16.33**
B11	**Experience of Key Personnel Assigned to the Project**					
B11.1	Describe your approach to overall team formation and coordination of team members.	**2.00**	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
B11.2	Include an organizational chart for the Project including but not limited to:					
	(a) Contract Manager;					
	(b) Fleet Manager;					
	(c) Route Supervisor (s);					
	(d) Dispatcher (s);					
	(e) Clerical (s);					
	(f) Operators;					
	(g) Swampers; and					
	(h) Any other support staff.					
B11.2.2	Roles of each of the Key Personnel in the Project should be identified in the organizational chart referred to in B11.2	**2.50**	2.50	2.50	2.50	2.00
B11.3	Submit the names of the Key Personnel identified in B11.2(a), B11.2(b), B11.2(c), B11.2(d) and B11.2(e) that will be assigned to and named in the Contract. Submit for such individual their educational background and degrees (if applicable); professional recognition; job title; years of experience in current position; and years of experience with existing employer; a statement of experience/qualifications; a listing of contracts/projects of similar complexity, scope and value that such individual has participated in, including the contract owner of such contracts/projects.	**3.00**	2.50	3.00	2.33	2.50
B11.4	For each person identified in B11.2(c), B11.2(d), B11.2(f), (including spare Operators) and B11.2(g), provide the respective number of such persons proposed to be employed in the Work.	**1.00**	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
B11.5	For each person identified in B11.2(a) and B11.2(b) list at least two comparable projects in which they have played a primary role. If a project selected for a key person is included in B10, provide only the project name and the role of the key person. For other projects provide the following:					
	(a) Description of project; (b) Role of the person; (c) Project Owner; and (d) Reference information (two current names with telephone numbers and email addresses per project).	**1.50**	1.00	1.50	1.00	1.00
	Total for Experience of Key Personnel Assigned to the Project	**10.00**	**9.00**	**10.00**	**8.83**	**8.50**
B12	**Project Understanding and Methodology**					
B12.1	Describe your firm's project management approach and team organization during the performance of Services, so that the evaluation committee has a clear understanding of the methods the Proponent will use in the delivery of this Project.	**2.00**	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
B12.2	Methodology should be presented in accordance with the Scope of Services identified in D2. Describe the collaborative process/method to be used by the Key Personnel of the team in the various phases of the Project.	**2.00**	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
B12.3	Proposals should address the team's understanding of the functional and technical requirements including:					
	(a) General experience of using GPS/AVL/RFID systems and reporting;	**1.00**	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
	(b) A description of the GPS/ AVL/ RFID which the Contractor proposes to utilize including, without limitation, information concerning the system/Equipment specifications including make and model of Equipment and software, and information and details concerning GPS/ AVL/ RFID systems described in the RFP;	**1.00**	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.67
	(c) Specific experience using the proposed GPS/AVL/RFID system and its reliability as noted in E7. If an operations malfunction or active errors with software is occurring during the collection day, what is the secondary tool or mechanise used to ensure the collected/missed status for residents is accurately communicated to the City of Winnipeg Contract Administrator;	**2.00**	2.00	2.00	1.83	1.00
	(d) A description of how your system confirms RFID and reads in real-time;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.00
	(e) Systems or methods that will be used to compensate for RFID failures during a collection route;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.25
	(f) An explanation of how you plan to categorize and report different collection exceptions (example, but not limited to: Not Out vs. RFID Unread vs Contaminated);	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50
	(g) Communication plans for notifying the City of scheduled system maintenance or service disruptions;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50
	(h) An explanation of your proposed process for video storage as noted in E8.34, retrieval time within two (2) hours of request, and integration with service reporting;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50
	(i) Information regarding the location, ownership, size and intended purpose of all facilities proposed to be used for the Work, including but not limited to the offices, fleet storage yard and vehicle maintenance facility that will be used by the Contractor;	**1.00**	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00

	(j) A complete list of the Equipment which the Contractor proposes to utilize, including, but not limited to the number and types (including Collection Vehicles for Automated Collection, Semi-Automated Collection, and for the Collection of Yard Waste) of Collection Vehicles, spare Collection Vehicles, and all other Equipment (with make, model, year, height, turning radius, body type and capacity, applicable delivery dates, and CNG fuelling plan if applicable);	**2.00**	2.00	2.00	1.83	2.00
	(k) A response plan for emergencies and contingencies to effectively manage unexpected situations;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.25
	(l) A fleet mitigation plan in case of natural disasters or emergencies affecting Collection Vehicles, including, but not limited to vehicle fires;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50
	(m) A fleet mitigation plan to address the impact of extreme temperatures on collection vehicles during launch operations;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.00
	(n) A proposed plan for the Collection of Garbage and Recyclables using Eligible Containers including:					
	(i) The number of Collections to be performed per Collection Vehicle per day	**1.00**	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
	(ii) Proposed method of the collection of Walk-up Service	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50
	(o) Plan for collection of Yard Waste, including how you will manage peak volumes during the spring and fall yard waste seasons;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50
	(p) Procedures for addressing missed collection or service delays;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50
	(q) A plan for collection in narrow lanes, cul-de-sac, areas with parked vehicles and lane intersections, while avoiding damage to property, including overhead lines and wires;	**1.00**	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.75
	(r) An alternate method to be used to confirm collection at each address if GPS/ AVL/ RFID is unable to confirm collection at each address;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.50
	(s) A plan to provide Manual Collection of carts at times, to fulfill obligations of the Contract; and	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.00
	(t) A plan to address any other issues that convey the Proponent understands the Work requirements.	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.50	0.00
	Total for Project Understanding and Methodology	**20.00**	**20.00**	**20.00**	**19.66**	**15.92**
B13	**Project Schedule**					
B13.1	Proponents should present a carefully considered critical path method schedule using Microsoft Project or similar project management software, complete with resource assignments, durations (weekly timescale) and milestone dates. The schedule should address each requirement of the Work including, but not limited to, as per E3:					
	(i) Equipment (including Collection Vehicles) delivery and readiness;	**1.00**	0.83	1.00	0.50	0.33
	(ii) Facilities commissioning;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.25	0.50
	(iii) GPS/ AVL/ RFID installation/commissioning and training;	**1.00**	1.00	1.00	0.83	0.50
	(iv) Hiring of staff;	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.33	0.50
	(v) Training of staff; and	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.42	0.00
	(vi) Post award, pre-commencement of Collection, implementation activities and planning.	**1.00**	1.00	1.00	0.83	1.00
B13.2	The Proponent's schedule should include critical dates for review and approval processes by the City and other organizations anticipated during the tendering phases of the Project. Reasonable times should be allowed for completion of these processes.	**0.50**	0.50	0.50	0.42	0.42
	Total for Project Schedule	**5.00**	**4.83**	**5.00**	**3.58**	**3.25**
B14	**Social Procurement Questionnaire (Section G)**					
	Indigenous Pillar					
1	Does your organization currently have strategies or policies around inclusive employment practices to ensure you are providing employment opportunities for Indigenous Rightsholders?	**6.00**	6.00	0.00	6.00	0.00
2	Do you currently have an apprenticeship, paid internship or paid work experience program that prioritizes Indigenous Rightsholders?	**6.00**	6.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
3 a or b only	Are you an Indigenous business?	**Yes/No**	Yes	No	No	No
	(a) Please complete the self-declaration to confirm you are a Diverse business.	**6.00**	N/A	0.00	0.00	0.00
	b) Do you have a third-party certification that confirms you are an Indigenous business?		6.00	N/A	0.00	N/A
4	Does your organization intentionally purchase from Indigenous businesses?	**6.00**	6.00	0.00	6.00	0.00
	Social Pillar					
5	Does your organization currently have strategies or policies around inclusive employment practices to ensure you are providing employment opportunities for Equity Groups?	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00
6	Do you have a Living Wage policy or certification?	**3.00**	0.00	0.00	3.00	3.00
7	Do you currently have an apprenticeship, paid internship, or paid work experience program? This can include student terms from institutions, as long as they are paid work experiences.	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	0.00	3.00
8	Do you currently have an apprenticeship, paid internship or paid work experience program that targets any of the following Equity Groups: Racialized peoples, newcomers (less than 5 years in Canada); Persons with Disabilities; Women; people facing poverty; Veterans, and 2SLGBTQ+ (Two-spirit, Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans, Queer, plus) Peoples.	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	0.00	0.00
9 a or b only	Are you a Diverse Business?	**Yes/No**	No	No	No	No
	(a) Please complete the self-declaration to confirm you are a Diverse business.	**3.00**	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	(b) Do you have a third-party certification that shows you are a Diverse Business?		No	N/A	N/A	N/A
10 a or b only	Are you a Social Enterprise?	**Yes/No**	No	No	0.00	No
	(a) Please complete the self-declaration to confirm you are a Diverse business.	**3.00**	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	(b) Do you have a third-party certification that shows you are a Social Enterprise?		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
11. a	Does your organization practice social procurement?	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	0.00	0.00
11. b	Do you currently track the number of contracts and/or dollar spend in your social procurement practice?	**3.00**	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
12	Do you have any formal relationships with public and/or private education and training institutions?	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	0.00	0.00
	Sub total for Social Procurement	**51.00**	**39.00**	**15.00**	**18.00**	**9.00**
	Total for Social Procurement Questionaire	**2.50**	**1.91**	**0.74**	**0.88**	0.44
B15	**Environmental Procurement Questionnaire (Section H)**					
1	Does your organization have a plan for, have you taken actions on and/or are you tracking and measuring the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions? City of Winnipeg Community Energy Investment Roadmap outlines actions to be taken to work towards net zero emissions by 2050	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00

2	Does your organization have a plan for, have you taken actions on and/or are you tracking and measuring use of renewable energy sources and/or increase of your organization's overall energy efficiency?	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00
3	Does your organization have a plan for, have you taken actions on and/or are you tracking and measuring waste reduction, reuse or management to minimize your overall waste footprint?	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00
4	Does your organization have a plan for, have you taken actions on and/or are you tracking and measuring water use reduction, recycling, reuse or management to minimize your overall water footprint?	**3.00**	0.00	3.00	3.00	3.00
5	Does your organization support environmental stewardship and/or the circular economy through your business practices or involvement in the community?	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00
6	Does your organization or the products used in the delivery of this Contract have any third-party eco-certifications? • Biodegradable Products Institute (BPI) • Canada's National Standard for Sustainable Forest Management (SFM) • EcoLogo • EPEAT • Fairtrade • Forest Stewardship Council • Green Seal • GREENGUARD • Sustainable Forestry Initiative • Other third-party certification	**3.00**	0.00	3.00	0.00	0.00
7	Does your organization have a plan for, have you taken actions on and/or are you tracking and measuring the increased use of local food in the delivery of this Contract? Local food is food produced in Manitoba or within 50 kms of the Manitoba border	**3.00**	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
8	Does your organization have a plan for, have you taken actions on and/or are you tracking and measuring your commitment to net zero emissions by 2050 in alignment with the City of Winnipeg Community Energy Investment Roadmap?	**3.00**	3.00	3.00	3.00	0.00
	Sub total for Environmental Procurement Questionnaire	**24.00**	**15.00**	**21.00**	**18.00**	**15.00**
	Total for Environmental Procurement Questionnaire	**2.50**	**1.56**	**2.19**	**1.88**	**1.56**
	Total	**100.00**	**95.80**	**86.60**	**89.29**	**76.71**