Minute No. 351
Report – Executive Policy Committee – April 13, 2005

Item No. 7 **City of Winnipeg Museums – Heritage Preservation Policy Committee**
File PR-9

COUNCIL DECISION:

Council concurred in the recommendation of the Executive Policy Committee and adopted the following:

1. That a Committee be established to make recommendations on a Heritage Preservation Policy for the City of Winnipeg, including the exploration of the creation of a City of Winnipeg museum; with the Committee's terms of reference to include that a consultative approach be taken with the existing city museums in the development of a proposed policy.

2. That the Committee be comprised of one member of Council, two citizen members from the Records Committee, one representative from the Winnipeg Arts Council, one representative from the Manitoba Museum, one representative from the Corporate Finance Department, all as appointed by Executive Policy Committee, and that the Committee be chaired by the City of Winnipeg's Archivist.

3. That the Committee report back to the Executive Policy Committee by December 31, 2005.

4. That the Proper Officers of the City be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the intent of the foregoing.

Report – Executive Policy Committee – April 13, 2005

DECISION MAKING HISTORY:

Moved by His Worship Mayor Katz,
That the recommendation of the Executive Policy Committee be adopted.

Carried

EXECUTIVE POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

On April 13, 2005, the Executive Policy Committee concurred in the administrative recommendation with the following amendment:

- The Committee Terms of Reference include that a consultative approach be taken with the existing city museums in the development of a proposed policy,

and submitted the matter to Council.

On March 12, 2003, the Executive Policy Committee referred the matter of museum funding to the Administration for review and report back including the possible centralization and an overall funding strategy for all museum services.

Report

Re: City of Winnipeg Museums

For Submission To: Executive Policy Committee

Original Report Signed By: R. Kachur, City Clerk

Report date: March 30, 2005

Recommendation(s):

1. That a Committee be established to make recommendations on a Heritage Preservation policy for the City of Winnipeg, including the exploration of the creation of a City of Winnipeg museum.

2. That the Committee be comprised of one member of Council, two citizen members from the Records Committee, one representative from the Winnipeg Arts Council, one representative from the Manitoba Museum, one representative from the Corporate Finance Department, all as appointed by Executive Policy Committee, and that the Committee be chaired by the City of Winnipeg's Archivist

3. That the Committee report back to Executive Policy Committee by December 31, 2005.

Report Summary

Key Issues:

On March 12, 2003, Executive Policy Committee referred the issue of museum funding to the administration, directing that a report be submitted on the issues of museum services and on an overall funding strategy for museums. The City Clerk's Department currently administers museum funding.

Implications of the Recommendation(s):

General Implications

X None

☐ For the organization overall and/or for other departments

☐ For the community and/or organizations external to the City of Winnipeg

☐ Involves a multi-year contract

Comment:

Policy Implications
X No

☐ Yes
Comment:

Environmental Implications
X No

☐ Yes
Comment:

Human Resource Implications
X No

☐ Yes
Comment:

Financial Implications
X Within approved current and/or capital budget

☐ Current and/or capital budget adjustment required

Report

Reason for the report:

On March 12, 2003, Executive Policy Committee referred the issue of museum funding to the administration, directing that a report be submitted on the issues of museum services and on an overall funding strategy for museums. The City Clerk's Department currently administers museum funding.

History & Discussion:

The City of Winnipeg currently budgets for the operation of eight community museums through its current operating budget. The museums were inherited by the City of Winnipeg at the time of Unicity from the various communities that merged with Winnipeg. The City of Winnipeg, for the most part, owns the buildings housing these museums and the museum artifacts contained therein.

The current 2005 operating budget for the eight museums is $718,998. Of this amount, $171,725 is retained by the City of Winnipeg for lease and maintenance of the City of Winnipeg owned buildings, providing the museums with an overall operating budget of $547,273. The 8 museums budgeted for by the City of Winnipeg are as follows: St. Boniface Museum, Transcona Museum, St. James Assiniboia Museum, Seven Oaks House Museum, Ross House Museum, The Fire Fighters Historical Society Museum, Grants Old Mill and Barber House. A broad perspective of museum information, as compiled by the Community Services Department is provided in Schedule "1" to this report.

The City also operates other museums through its current departmental budgets, including the Winnipeg Police Museum through the Winnipeg Police Services budget, the Living Prairie Museum through the Public Works Department budget and the City of Winnipeg Archives through the City Clerk's Department budget. As well, the City of Winnipeg provides funding to four other museums (Dalnavert, Manitoba Children's Museum, Manitoba Museum, and the Western Canada Aviation Museum) through Winnipeg Arts Council grants.

The true cost of museums to the City of Winnipeg is higher than the above stated budget, as the City has traditionally provided three of the eight museums with a variety of services at no charge. (The other five museums receive their funding through a direct grant). These services include financial services, such as budgeting and bill payments, human resource services such as payroll administration and information technology support. These services were provided until recently by the Community Services Department. As the burden of providing these services became too great, these service duties were distributed across the organization to several departments, including Corporate Finance to provide financial services, Corporate Services to provide human resource services and the City Clerk's Department to provide overall coordination and budgeting.

The museums themselves are generally not self-sufficient as they generate very little in terms of revenue from visits or other grants / donations. As well, the majority of museums have no professional museum staff and are operated / managed by volunteer boards and temporary staff. There is virtually no communication or coordination among the museums themselves, with each museum operating as a separate entity. As well, there is no direction provided by the City in terms of museum operations itself. The City does not have a museum expert or coordinator who can ensure that museums are operating in an appropriate manner, providing basic levels of service and protecting heritage appropriately.

The museums are only somewhat accountable in terms of their funding. Museums are required to submit a financial statement on the previous year's expenditures to the respective Community Committee in order to qualify for funding for the following year.

There is no requirement to provide an audited financial statement, as this would prove to be a financial burden to many of the museums.

Museums are currently perceived to be underfunded by their operators and volunteer curators. Four of the museums came forward to Council to ask for increases in their budget for 2004 and beyond.

It is important for the City of Winnipeg to develop a strategy for the operation and funding of museums in the future. This strategy should be one that reflects the needs of the City of Winnipeg financially in terms of budget dollars and actual services provided. As well, it needs to address the City's historical responsibility to provide museums and museum services to the citizens of Winnipeg. Finally the strategy must meet the needs of the museums and allow them to operate with the resources required and provide them with a consistent direction on how to operate in a sustainable manner.

There are several issues to consider when developing a museum strategy:

1) Museums are not currently accountable financially to the City. For example, the St. Boniface Museum has been allowed to over-expend its budget in recent years, with the over expenditures funded by the Community Services Department in 2000 through 2002 and through an extra appropriation in 2003. Another example includes the Seven Oaks House Museum, where the entire board resigned and was replaced in 2002. This turnover caused a loss of knowledge for the museum and the existence of a $70,000 trust fund remained undiscovered by the new board until an audit was done by the City of Winnipeg Audit Department in 2003. Without financial accountability, the City would be better served by providing a direct grant to all of the museums, rather than attempt to administer budgets on their behalf.

2) Museums receive no direction from the City in terms of operation, and have very little coordination amongst themselves. They lose out on synergies that could be created by working together in a coordinated manner including applying for grants, increased attendance through coordinated advertising campaigns and reduced operational costs through sharing of resources and personnel. As such, any strategy developed should incorporate the provision of direction to all museums and a method for coordinating operations, advertising strategies, etc.

3) The City has traditionally supported the operation of museums in the past through the provision of various services, including financial services, human resource services and assistance in planning and direction. This support has decreased to different degrees in the various museums over the last few years. Museums are struggling to fill the void left behind by the City and are as well struggling to understand what responsibilities the City has vis a vis museums.

Any strategy developed should clarify exactly what the responsibility of the City is in terms of museums.

4) Many of the museums have very low attendance, very limited artifacts, and premises in great need of repair. As well, each museum is focused on one particular subject or community history; no museum currently exists that focuses on the history of Winnipeg as greater whole. Any strategy should take into account the continued viability of operating each of these museums as separate entities and whether synergies could be gained by creating a larger Winnipeg museum that combines some or all of the current museums into this one greater entity.

5) There are several legal issues to consider regarding museums. The majority of buildings housing museums belong to the City of Winnipeg. Ownership of the majority of artifacts housed in museums would revert back to the City of Winnipeg were museums to close. Staffing arrangements vary across museums, with one museum, the Transcona Museum, having 1 City employee assigned to it, with this person being in a permanent, unionized position with CUPE Local 500. St. Boniface Museum has several permanent unionized positions, but these are not considered City employees, and are unionized through a different CUPE local. As well, the director of the St. Boniface Museum, despite not being a City employee, has and continues to contribute to the City of Winnipeg Pension plan. As such, any strategy developed should consider and report back on legal considerations of building / artifact ownership and staffing concerns and develop policies in this regard.

It is recommended that a committee be established to examine the overall operation and viability of museums, to explore the possible creation of a City of Winnipeg Museum and make recommendations to Council on a high level Heritage Preservation Policy and Strategy, similar to the Public Art Policy recently adopted in principle by Council. The Committee should include one member of Council, two citizen members from the Records Committee, one representative from the Winnipeg Arts Council, one representative from the Manitoba Museum, one representative from the Corporate Finance Department and be chaired by the City of Winnipeg's Archivist. Suggested terms of reference are provided in Schedule "2".

The Committee should be provided with administrative support from the City Archivist and the City Clerk's Department and report back to the Executive Policy Committee by the end of 2005.

IN PREPARING THIS REPORT THERE WAS CONSULTATION WITH:

Corporate Finance
Community Services
Winnipeg Art's Council

THIS REPORT SUBMITTED BY:
The City Clerk's Department

Financial Impact Statement:

Project Name: City of Winnipeg Museums

Date: April 30, 2004 First Year of Program: 2005

	0	1	2	3	4
Capital					
Capital Expenditures Required					
Less: Existing Budgeted Costs					
Additional Capital Budget Required	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Funding Sources:					
Debt - Internal					
Debt - External					
Grants (Enter Description Here)					
Reserves, Equity, Surplus					
Other - Enter Description Here					
Total Funding	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Total Additional Capital Budget Required	$ -				
Total Additional Debt Required	$ -				
Current Expenditures/Revenues					
Direct Costs	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Less: Incremental Revenue/Recovery					
Net Cost/(Benefit)	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Less: Existing Budget Amounts					
Net Budget Adjustment Required	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Additional Comments:					

Marc Lemoine

Department Controller

J:\LIBRARY\REPORTS\050330 - Museum Strategy.doc

Schedule 1

MUSEUM BACKGROUND INFORMATION

	St. James / Assiniboia	St. Boniface	Transcona	Seven Oaks	Ross House	Fire Fighters	Grants Old Mill	Barber House
2003 Proposed Budget/Grant	$70,979	$285,293	$106,776	$24,737	$17,542	$82,204	$11,917	$3,373
Governance Model								
- Number of Board Members	10	9	13	9	19	11	7	N/A
- Make-up of Board (all boards are volunteer)	5 Executive Officers, 4 Directors and 1 City appointed elected rep.	8 members and 1 councilor	12 members and 1 councilor	8 members and 1 councilor	14 regular & 5 adhoc members	4 Executive and 7 Directors	7 Executives	N/A
- Who appoints Board (Council approves all appointments and appoints Council member)		volunteer/elected	Officials appointed by City of Wpg Council and balance elected by Community	volunteer/elected	Manitoba Historical Society	Elected by the Membership	Elected by the Membership	N/A
- Board Reports to		Community Committee	Community Committee	Community Committee	Manitoba Historical Society	Federal Government	Manitoba Historical Society	N/A
- Terms of reference and/or City by-laws.		Bylaw#4824\88	City of Transcona Bylaw #429(2 of Municipal Act) & Board of Directors Terms of Reference	Terms of reference	No	No	No	N/A
- Is Organization Incorporated?		No	Yes	No	Yes - Manitoba Historical Society is	Yes	Yes	N/A
- Is Organization a separate legal entity?		No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	N/A
Number of visitors (Annual Total)	4,000	13,983	7,450	800	870	1,500	5,000 approx.	N/A
Tours								
- Number in 2001	61	321	80	6	200 approx.	40	120	N/A
- Tour Visitors 2001	954	7,086	1,365	150	870 approx.	1,520	1,800	N/A
- Type of tour	Seniors groups, schools, day cares, tourists, general public researchers, volunteers, and Civic Personnel.	Schools, groups, bus and extension tours	Schools	Schools	Majority are self guided.	Tour buses, students, Beavers, Cubs, Day Cares, Seniors Homes and Red Knights Motorcycle Club.	School and groups	N/A
Type of Programming	Educational, Special Events & Community Outreach. Annual Pioneer Children's Day is offered in August.	Manitoba francophone heritage and Metis peoples whose traditional center is St. Boniface. Also Festival du Voyageur, Easter, July, August and Christmas.	Gallery exhibit displays, off-site exhibits, special events and activities.	Mainly individual walk through with some school tours.	Neighbourhood drop in centre. Community barbeque held in conjunction with Canada Day.	Emphasis on fire safety and burns awareness. Focus on seniors as they helped create Winnipeg's heritage. Target young to instill fire safe values.	BBQ in Aug., School, Daycare & Public Tours	N/A
Value of annual donations /								
- Total Revenue 2001	$91,395.00	$282,236.00	$20,474.35	Not available - new board did not receive	N/A	$115,916.82	$19,282.00	$3,272.00
- Less City of Winnipeg Contribution	$49,873.00	$282,236.00		$2,774.78	$17,542.00	$97,982.00	$11,982.00	N/A
- Net Revenue 2001	**$41,522.00**	**$0.00**	**$20,474.35**		**N/A**	**$17,934.82**	**$7,300.00**	**N/A**
- Net Revenue as a % of Total Revenue	45%		100%			15%	38%	
- Are donations recoveries included in the museum budget?	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No
Annual Report / Financial Statements								
- 2000	Yes	Yes (FRS Statements)	Yes	Reimbursement request with all receipts attached.	Yes	Yes	Copy of Operating Budget	No
- 2001	Yes	Yes (FRS Statements)	Yes	Reimbursement request with all receipts attached.	Yes	Yes	Copy of Operating Budget	No

Schedule 1

MUSEUM BACKGROUND INFORMATION

	St. James / Assiniboia	St. Boniface	Transcona	Seven Oaks	Ross House	Fire Fighters	Grants Old Mill	Barber House
Museum History								
- Date created	Incorporated 1971	1959	1979	Officially opened 1958	City took over in 1949.	1982	1975	N/A
- Pre-Uncity relationship to City/Town	William Brown Red River Frame House was built in 1845 and later moved to the Museum site in 1973 from Headingley.	Former Convent for the Grey Nuns since 1847 and vacated in 1956.	Built by Bank of Toronto in 1925 and became a Municipal Office for Transcona in 1943.	House was constructed between 1851 & 1853 and lived in by the Inkster family. The house was lived in continuously till 1954.	Built on shore of Red River. At one time was the first post office west of Thunder Bay other than Hudson's Bay. Later it was used as a Construction Company Office.	Fire Station #2	Flour Mill	N/A
Volunteer Base	Museum relies upon volunteers for assistance with special events programming, social planning, membership and fundraising.	At present it is limited to its Board of Directors	50 volunteers in 2001and further support from Service Clubs, Museum/Heritage Support, City of Winnipeg, Elected Officials, Corporate/Business and Memberships	Limited to Members	Number of neighbourhood people who assist. Garden in particular has the attention of three particular people and one or two others occasionally.	Unique, with a mixture of young, senior and retired fire fighters. There is a pool of approx. 850 active and 450 retired volunteers that can be called upon. Approx. 30 are called on a weekly basis.	Limited to Members	N/A
Collection								
- Size	approx. 5,000 objects	Over 19,000 objects	approx. 46,000 objects	approx. 2,500 objects	Ross House is the largest artifact in the collection. The contents of the museum (195 pieces) are owned by the Manitoba Historical Society.	Horse drawn, steam powered apparatus to early-motorized apparatus to modern vehicles. 1000's of photos, 3000 books 50 binders of newspaper archives.	Primarily the Mill, millstones, waterwheel & approx 8 misc. items	N/A
- Inventory Listing		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Partial	Yes	N/A
- Cost to Insure		$3,000	$11,000	No Records in Museum s/b covered by City of Wpg	$917	Not Insured	No	N/A
- Insured by		Aon Reid Stenhouse	Wyatt Insurance	N/A	CGU Insurance Co. of Cda.	N/A	No	N/A
- Title to artifacts		St. Boniface Museum Board	Transcona Historical Museum Incorporated	City of Wpg	Manitoba Historical Society	Fire Fighters Historical Society of Wpg Inc.	St. James Pioneer Association	N/A
- Responsible for Managing artifacts		St. Boniface Museum Board See City of Wpg Act Section 674	Board of Directors	Board of Directors	Manitoba Historical Society	Fire Fighters Historical Society of Wpg Inc.	St. James Pioneer Association	N/A
- Financial responsible for maintaining artifacts		St. Boniface Museum Board / City of Wpg	Board of Directors	City of Wpg	Manitoba Historical Society	Fire Fighters Historical Society of Wpg Inc.	St. James Pioneer Association	N/A
- Pays property taxes to City of Wpg		No (City holds 99 year lease to building and grounds which expires 2062)	No (City holds lease to building)	No	No	No	Yes	N/A
Square Footage of Building	5000 approx.	12,500	1,313	3,000 - 4,000 approx.	871	12,200	5,000 approx.	N/A
Staff								
- Complement	2 Full Time, 3-4 Term	6 Full Time, 10 Part Time, 2 Term	2 Full Time, 1 Part Time	4 Term, 2 Standby	2 Term	Volunteers	3 Term	N/A
- Affiliation	Museum	Museum paid through City	1 Full Time City, Others-Museum	Museum-paid through City	Museum	Museum	Museum	N/A
- Hires staff		Museum	Museum & City of Wpg	Museum	Manitoba Historical Society/Museum	Fire Fighters Historical Society of Wpg Inc.	St. James Pioneer Association	N/A
- Part of Union		Yes	1 only	No	No	No	No	N/A
- City of Wpg Union		No	1 only	No	No	No	No	N/A
- Pay levels, benefits and vacation allotments consistent with like positions within C of W		Not pay levels (Continual topic of negotiation between CUPE and Museum Board)	1 only	No	No	No	No	N/A
Admission Fees	By donation	Yes	None	Donation	None	$3 Adult, $2 Youth, Under 7 free	By Donation	N/A
Admission Fees Credited To	Museum	To budget and recoveries	N/A	Museum	N/A	Museum	Museum	N/A

Schedule 1

MUSEUM BACKGROUND INFORMATION

	St. James / Assiniboia	St. Boniface	Transcona	Seven Oaks	Ross House	Fire Fighters	Grants Old Mill	Barber House
Building Maintenance	Public Works/PPD	Public Works/PPD	Public Works/PPD	Public Works/PPD	Public Works/PPD	Public Works/PPD	Public Works	N/A
Grounds Maintenance	Public Works	Museum	Public Works - snow removal	Museum & Public Works	Public Works	Public Works	Public Works	N/A
Services by Public Works Charged Back	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
Utilities Paid by	Public Works	Museum through City	Public Works	Museum through City	Public Works	Public Works	Public Works	N/A
Average Annual Cost of Svcs. & Utilities provided by Civic Depts.	$20,611	$56,024	$35,698	$6,031	N/A	$50,453	N/A	$3,462
Season	Year Round	Year Round	Year Round	May to September	June to August	Year Round	May to September	Boarded Up
Ownership	City	Leased to Museum Board by Grey Nuns	City	City	City	City, leased to Museum Board	City	City
Debt								
- Long-term debt or mortgage		No	No	No	No	No	No	N/A
- Guaranteed loans or mortgage by City		No (Museum functions as City Department)	No	No	No	No	No	N/A
Financial Assets								
- Significant financial assets		Collections and building	Collections	No	Building & Collection	Collection	Mill	N/A
- Investments used		City of Wpg Trust Funds Co 26 (Capital)	GIC'S	RBC Account of approx. $72,000? (Presently cannot be utilized as it was raised for another purpose)	Term Deposits	GIC'S	No	N/A
- Investments reserved for special purposes		Yes	Yes, Exhibit Upgrades	Frozen pending verification of reallocation of funds for the preservation of museum.	Special projects	No - Used as required	No	N/A
Lawsuits or Outstanding Claims								
- Outstanding lawsuits or claims pending.		No	No	No	No	Part of ceiling collapsed; collection damaged by dust & debris. Cost to repair was approx. $17,000; claims suit against City resulted; still pending	No	
- If so is City named as a defendant?		No	No	No	No	Yes	No	
Issues identified by Curators	Response and recovery from rodent infestation and mould / bacteria in Municipal Hall.	Uninformed and uninvited in the City's march towards digital future and Intranet.	Lacking appointed support structure from City.	Public washroom facilities are needed.	Ross House and Seven Oaks House should be separate for budget and financial references.	Museum is perceived to receive large sums of budget money annually but non can be used for operation.	None	N/A
	Curator attended conference with workshops on issues on biocontamination of collections, disaster planning and staff health and safety.	Need for climate controlled storage facility. Wish to upgrade quality of exhibits and programming. Lack of designated parking.	Requires increase in annual operating budget for staff, computers/software and to accommodate increasing costs.	Signage to promote the Museum should be improved and expanded.	Return financial support to $20,000+ range.	Budget money is administered solely by Public Works for building maintenance and utilities.		
	Contraventions in Fire Code that are outstanding and waiting for completion.	Budget is consolidated with other Civic Museums that have no formal relationship.	Need access to City Intranet for budget preparation and financial statements.	Additional picnic tables/benches and waste containers are needed.	Broaden interpretation of time period and Ross family's role in community.	Need paid staff as a base and have volunteers supplement during peak periods.		
	Unresolved salvage operation and cleaning of reserve collection.	City staff are unaware there is any relationship/ responsibility to museum.	Enhanced email access	Review with Community Committee is being made for change to admission fee structure.				
	Continued adverse physical reactions while attempting to work in Municipal Hall.	Museum building is in need of routine maintenance. City is responsible but we are not even on the list of Buildings as per PP&D.		Is assistance available from the City for staffing?				

Schedule 2

Heritage Preservation Policy Committee – Suggested Terms of Reference

1) That the committee consider and report back on the long-term viability of the current civic museums and examine options to promote synergies, cost savings and sustainable operations.

2) That the committee identify museum strategies employed by other major Canadian municipalities.

3) That the committee explore and report back on funding issues for existing Civic Museums, identify funding and fundraising alternatives and propose a long-term strategy in regards to funding and funding requirements.

4) That the committee examine the issue of other museums funded through the City of Winnipeg's operating budget and through WAC grants, and make recommendations regarding these.

5) That the committee consider and report back on the viability of establishing a City of Winnipeg Museum, showcasing the history of the City of Winnipeg and the operation of civic government.

6) That the committee identify operating relationships between a new City of Winnipeg Museum and the existing Civic Museums.

7) That the committee identify funding and fundraising alternatives for a City of Winnipeg Museum and propose a long-term strategy for sustaining operations in concert with other Civic Museums.

8) That the committee define the relationship between Civic Museums and the City of Winnipeg and define what services and responsibilities the City should provide to museums in the future.

9) That the committee consider the current state of museums in terms of building / artifact ownership and staffing, and make recommendations for dealing with any current issues as well as set recommended standards.